Integration of Environmental Protection into other EC Policies
Legal Theory and Practice

Nele Dhondt

The Avosetta Series (2)
## Contents

8.2.1 'Take into account' versus 'observe' 81
8.2.2 Priority issue or interpretation 84
8.3 Two other interpretations of the integration concept 86
8.4 Priority interpretation of the integration concept 89
8.4.1 Introduction 89
8.4.2 Weak interpretation: 'must be taken into account' 90
8.4.3 Strong interpretation: 'must be observed' 93
8.4.4 Application of the two different interpretations to an example 98
9 Conclusions 100
9.1 Arguments in favour and against the two possible interpretations: most plausible interpretation 100
9.1.1 Introduction 100
9.1.2 In light of the wording and a comparison with similar clauses 100
9.1.3 In light of the aim of the principle 103
9.1.4 In light of relevant case law of the ECJ 104
9.1.5 Comments: the most plausible interpretation and the underlying idea 105
9.2 Summary 108

### CHAPTER III

**The Legal Consequences of Articles 6 and 174 EC**

1 Introduction 113
2 Views in literature 114
2.1 Interpreting the SEA version of the provisions 114
2.1.1 Article 130r, 1 EC: the environmental objectives 114
2.1.2 Article 130r, 2 first sentence EC: the environmental principles 115
2.1.2.1 Principles of preventive action, rectification at source and polluter pays 115
2.1.2.2 High level of protection and subsidiarity: also environmental principles? 117
2.1.2.3 Article 130r, 2 second sentence EC: the 'Querschnittsklausel' 118
2.1.3 Article 130r, 3 EC: the environmental criteria 119
2.2 More recent literature 119
2.2.1 Article 6 EC: the integration principle or clause 119
2.2.2 Article 174, 1 EC: the environmental objectives 120
2.2.3 Article 174, 2 EC: the environmental principles 121
2.2.3.1 Two new principles: a high level of protection and the precautionary principle 121
2.2.3.2 Views on all the environmental principles of Article 174, 2 EC 122
2.2.3.3 Subsidiarity principle 123
INTEGRATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION INTO OTHER EC POLICIES

2.2.4 Article 174, 3 EC: the environmental criteria

2.3 Summary

2.3.1 Different views, various criteria and confusing terminology

2.3.2 Article 6 EC: different norm, different implications?

2.3.3 Search for answers in jurisprudence

3 Rules and principles in legal theory

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Hart and Positivism

3.3 Dworkin's Distinction

3.3.1 A 'general' attack on positivism

3.3.2 Rules versus principles

3.3.3 Legal principles versus non-legal principles

3.4 Answer of Hart to Dworkin's Criticism

3.5 Re(de)fining Hart and Dworkin and principles in the EC legal order

3.6 Application of legal theory to the provisions in Articles 6 and 174 EC

3.6.1 Intro: can principles be part of a legal order?

3.6.2 Are the provisions in question rules or principles?

3.6.2.1 Article 174 EC

3.6.2.2 Article 6 EC

3.6.3 Are the provisions in question legal or non-legal principles?

3.7 Summary and next step

4 Legal consequences as appears from case law of the EC

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Overview of relevant case law

4.2.1 The case law in relation to all the provisions

4.2.1.1 Peralta case

4.2.1.2 Safety Hi-Tech and Bettati cases

4.2.2 Case concerning the high level of protection principle

4.2.3 Cases concerning the prevention and the precautionary principles

4.2.3.1 Mondiet case

4.2.3.2 Cases concerning wild birds, British beef and brown bees: the difference between precaution and prevention

4.2.3.3 GMO case

4.2.3.4 Waste law cases

4.2.3.5 Summary

4.2.4 Case concerning the rectification at source principle

4.2.5 Case concerning the polluter pays principle

4.2.6 Case concerning the integration principle

4.2.7 Summary and next step
4.3 Analysis: direct and indirect legal consequences of Articles 6 and 174 EC

4.3.1 Introduction

4.3.2 The direct legal consequences

4.3.2.1 Criterion of validity of Community legislation

4.3.2.2 The role of the integration principle in the legal basis discussion

4.3.2.3 Limits to bringing an action on the basis of the environmental provisions

4.3.3 The indirect legal consequences

4.3.3.1 Introduction

4.3.3.2 Interpretation of EC environmental law in light of Article 174 EC

4.3.3.3 Interpretation of EC non-environmental law in light of Article 174 EC

4.3.3.4 Lacunae-filling interpretation

4.4 Summary

5 Conclusions

Part III Integration in Practice

CHAPTER IV Methodology of Examining Integration in Practice

1 Introduction

2 Research aim and method

3 Scope of the research

4 Terminology

5 Design of the ‘sectoral’ chapters

CHAPTER V The Common Agricultural Policy and the Environment

1 Introduction

2 Characteristics of the agricultural sector

2.1 Economic importance and specific features of the sector

2.2 Effects on the environment

2.2.1 Introduction

2.2.2 Negative effects of the agricultural sector

2.2.3 Positive effects of the agricultural sector

2.2.4 The net balance and interdependence

2.2.5 Summary and next step

3 The Common Agricultural Policy (CAP)

3.1 Development of the EC Treaty Title on the CAP

3.1.1 The need for a common agricultural policy

3.1.2 The Treaty provisions on the CAP: primary agricultural law
3.1.3 The first years of the CAP
3.1.4 Financing of the CAP
3.1.5 Competition and State aid rules
3.1.6 Producer and interbranch organisations
3.2 Main features of the market and price policy
3.2.1 The market and price policy as originally developed
3.2.2 The market and price policy in the 70s and early 80s
3.2.3 Reform of the market and price policy prior to 1992
3.2.4 The 1992 reform of the market and price policy
3.2.5 The Agenda 2000 reform of the market and price policy
3.3 The main features of structural measures
3.3.1 Introduction
3.3.2 Improving the efficiency of agricultural structures
3.3.3 Disadvantaged and problem regions or (agriculturally) LFAs
3.3.4 Processing and marketing conditions for agricultural products
3.3.5 Forestry measures
3.3.6 Environmentally Sensitive Areas (ESA) and agri-environment measures
3.3.7 Organic production
3.4 Approximation of laws: plant protection products legislation
3.5 Agricultural research
3.6 Main features of secondary 'agriculture-specific' environmental legislation
4 Integration of environmental protection requirements into the CAP
4.1 Introduction
4.2 Are the most environmentally damaging practices encouraged?
4.2.1 By way of direct regulation?
4.2.2 By way of economic/market-based instruments?
4.2.2.1 Price support, direct aid and quotas
4.2.2.2 Structural aid
4.2.3 By way of promoting R&D?
4.3 Are environmentally friendly and/or the least environmentally damaging practices encouraged?
4.3.1 By way of direct regulation?
4.3.1.1 By way of (traditional) c&c legislation
4.3.1.2 By way of cross-compliance?
4.3.1.3 Declaration of generally binding
4.3.2 By way of economic/market-based instruments?
4.3.2.1 Instrument of financial aid
4.3.2.2 By way of other economic/market-based instruments? 280
4.3.3 By way of promoting R&D, information exchange and/or training? 282
4.3.3.1 Supporting R&D 282
4.3.3.2 Information and training programmes 283
4.4 Comments 284
4.4.1 Introduction: the CAP objectives and the environment 284
4.4.2 Integration failures 285
4.4.3 Integration efforts (incl. nature of instruments used) 286
4.4.4 Net balance and future action 288
5 Conclusion 289

CHAPTER VI
The Common Transport Policy and the Environment

1 Introduction 293
2 Characteristics of the transport sector 293
2.1 Economic importance and specific features of the sector 293
2.2 Effects on the environment 294
3 The Common Transport Policy (CTP) 296
3.1 Development of the EC Treaty title on the CTP 296
3.1.1 The need for a Common Transport Policy 296
3.1.2 The Treaty provisions on the CTP: primary transport law 297
3.1.3 Relationship with the general rules of the EC Treaty 300
3.1.4 The initial development of a transport policy for the EC 302
3.2 Main features of secondary transport law 304
3.2.1 Introduction 304
3.2.2 Market operation 304
3.2.2.1 Market access 304
3.2.2.2 Access to the occupation and recognition of diploma's 318
3.2.2.3 Transport prices and terms 320
3.2.3 Fiscal harmonisation 323
3.2.4 Social harmonisation 324
3.2.5 Harmonisation of technical and safety specifications 327
3.2.5.1 Introduction 327
3.2.5.2 Road transport 328
3.2.5.3 Railways 332
3.2.5.4 Inland waterways 333
3.2.5.5 Air transport 334
3.2.5.6 Maritime transport 337
3.2.6 Transport infrastructure 340
3.2.6.1 Introduction 340
3.2.6.2 Coordination of infrastructure investment 341
3.2.6.3 Transport infrastructure charging 343
3.2.6.4 Traffic management
3.2.6.5 Spatial planning
3.2.7 Transport research
3.3 Main features of secondary 'transport-specific' environmental legislation
4 Integration of environmental protection requirements into the CTP
4.1 Introduction
4.2 Are the most environmentally damaging practices encouraged?
4.2.1 By way of direct regulation
4.2.2 By way of economic/market-based instruments?
4.2.2.1 Instrument of financial aid
4.2.2.2 Other economic instruments
4.2.3 By way of promoting R&D
4.3 Are environmentally friendly and/or the least environmentally damaging practices encouraged?
4.3.1 By way of direct regulation?
4.3.1.1 By way of (traditional) c&c legislation
4.3.1.2 By way of cross-compliance
4.3.2 By way of economic/market-based instruments?
4.3.2.1 Financial support to the deployment of ITS
4.3.2.2 Fiscal instruments
4.3.3 By way of promoting R&D, information exchange and/or training
4.3.3.1 R&D and demonstration projects
4.3.3.2 Information exchange and training
4.4 Comments
4.4.1 Introduction: the CTP objectives and the environment
4.4.2 Integration failures
4.4.3 Integration efforts (incl. nature of instruments used)
4.4.4 Net balance and future action
5 Conclusion

CHAPTER VII

The EC Energy Policy and the Environment
1 Introduction
2 Characteristics of the energy sector
2.1 Economic importance
2.2 Effects on the environment
3 The European Community energy policy
3.1 Development of the EC energy policy
3.1.1 The need for an EC energy policy
3.1.2 The Treaty provisions on the EC energy policy:
primary energy law 387
3.2 Main features of secondary energy law 390
3.2.1 Introduction 390
3.2.2 Economic policy measures: oil crisis measures 390
3.2.3 Market operation 392
3.2.3.1 Market access 392
3.2.3.2 Price transparency regulation 397
3.2.4 Fiscal harmonisation 398
3.2.5 Technical harmonisation 403
3.2.5.1 Introduction 403
3.2.5.2 Harmonisation of fuel quality standards 404
3.2.5.3 Harmonisation of energy efficiency standards
(incl. labelling) 405
3.2.6 Energy infrastructure 409
3.2.7 Energy R&D and demonstration programmes 410
3.3 Main features of secondary ‘energy-specific’ environmental
legislation 416
4 Integration of environmental protection requirements
into the EC energy policy 421
4.1 Introduction 421
4.2 Are the most environmentally damaging practices
encouraged? 422
4.2.1 By way of direct regulation? 422
4.2.2 By way of economic/market-based instruments? 424
4.2.3 By way of promoting R&D, information exchange and/or
training 429
4.3 Are environmentally friendly and/or the least
environmentally damaging practices encouraged? 430
4.3.1 By way of direct regulation? 430
4.3.1.1 By way of (traditional) c&c legislation 430
4.3.1.2 By way of cross-compliance 432
4.3.2 By way of economic/market-based instruments? 434
4.3.3 By way of promoting R&D, information exchange and/or
training 439
4.4 Comments 440
4.4.1 Intro: the energy objectives and the environment 440
4.4.2 Integration failures 442
4.4.3 Integration efforts (including nature of instruments used) 444
4.4.4 Net balance and future action 446
5 Conclusion 449
Part IV  Conclusions

CHAPTER VIII  Comparative Analysis and Evaluation of the Integration

1  Introduction 455
2  Various types of integration: strength of the integration 456
  2.1  Various integration types 456
    2.1.1  Intro 456
    2.1.2  No conflict situation 456
    2.1.3  Conflict situation 458
  2.2  Evaluation and comparison of the strength of the integration (in conflict situations) 461
3  The nature of the instruments used to integrate: form of the integration 463
4  Link with theory: is the integration sufficient? 467

CHAPTER IX  Summary and Concluding Remarks

1  Summary 477
2  Concluding remarks 482

Bibliography 487

Table of Cases 509

Evolution Relevant EC Treaty Provisions 515

Abbreviations 519

Index 523

Samenvatting 527