The Role of the International Court of Justice as the Principal Judicial Organ of the United Nations

by

Mohamed Sameh M. Amr
CONTENTS

Foreword vii
Abbreviations xix

Introduction 1

1. International Courts as Organs of International Organisations: Historical Perspective 5

1. International courts and international organisations: A historical development 5

1.1. The situation prior to the First World War 6

1.1.1. Prior to 1899 6

1.1.2. The Hague Peace Conferences of 1899 and 1907 9

1.1.3. The establishment of the Permanent Court of Arbitration (PCA) 10

1.2. After the First World War 12

1.2.1. The establishment of the League of Nations and the Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ) 12

1.2.2. The institutional relationship between the PCIJ and the League of Nations 14

1.3. After the Second World War 17

1.3.1. The development of the notion of international organisations 17

1.3.2. The establishment of the United Nations and the International Court of Justice 17

1.3.3. The ICJ and the PCIJ: Is it a new Court? 20

2. The ICJ as a part of the UN system 22

2.1. The legal basis of the organic relationship 23

2.1.1. The UN Charter 23

2.1.2. The Statute of the ICJ 25
## Table of Contents

2.2. The dimensions of the organic relationship between the ICJ and the UN 26

2.2.1. The effect on the ICJ 26

2.2.2. The effect on the UN 33

2.3. Final remarks 41

Conclusion 44

### 2. The Advisory Role of the International Court of Justice 47

1. The Legal Basis of the ICJ’s Advisory Jurisdiction 49

2. Organs Authorised to Request Advisory Opinions 50

   2.1. Direct authorisation 52

   2.2. Indirect authorisation 52

      2.2.1. The nature and limits of the authorisation 53

      2.2.2. Authorised organs 55

3. Prerequisites for Requesting an Advisory Opinion 66

   3.1. The competence of the requesting organ 66

      3.1.1. Limits upon the competence to request 66

      3.1.2. The impact of a request for an opinion by one organ upon the competence of other organs 72

      3.1.3. The impact of the refusal to request by one organ upon the competence of other organs 74

      3.1.4. The power to withdraw a request 75

   3.2. The vote 75

   3.3. The request 79

   3.4. The subject-matter of the request 83

      3.4.1. The scope of the term “legal question” 84

      3.4.2. Legal questions and other questions 86

      3.4.3. Abstract questions 91

      3.4.4. Legal questions related to disputes actually pending between states 92

4. The Obligation to Request Advisory Opinions from the ICJ 100

5. Is the ICJ under any Obligation to Give Opinions? 102

   5.1. The power of the Court to decide upon its own jurisdiction 103
5.2. The discretionary power of the ICJ to give advisory opinions

6. The Legal Effect of Advisory Opinions of the Court: Are They Binding?
   6.1. The non-binding effect as a consequence of the absence of an express provision
   6.2. The obligatory effect of the advisory opinions in exceptional cases
   6.3. The non-binding effect of the advisory opinions in the ICJ’s jurisprudence
   6.4. Evaluation

Conclusion

3. The Role of the International Court of Justice in Interpreting and Developing the Institutional Law of the United Nations

1. The Power of the ICJ to Interpret the Constitutional Instrument
   1.1. The United Nations Charter: A treaty or a constitution?
   1.2. The power of the ICJ to interpret the Charter
       1.2.1. The silence of the Charter
       1.2.2. General Assembly resolutions
       1.2.3. The practice of the ICJ: Confirmation of its interpretative power

2. The ICJ and the Implied Powers of the UN and its Organs
   2.1. The international legal personality of the UN
   2.2. Supervisory competence over territories under the mandate system
   2.3. The creation of subsidiary judicial organs by political organs

3. The Determination of the Relationship between the UN Organs
   3.1. Concurrent functions between the GA and SC in maintaining international peace and security
   3.2. Joint competence of the political organs

4. The ICJ and the Exercise of Exclusive Competence by the UN Organs
   4.1. Interpreting and developing the competencies of the GA
       4.1.1. Protection of human rights
       4.1.2. The power of the GA over international conventions concluded under its auspices
**Table of Contents**

4.1.3. The exercise of supervisory competence over the territories under the trusteeship (mandate) system 146
4.1.4. The relationship between the GA and the UN Administrative Tribunal 148
4.1.5. Budgetary power of the GA 149
4.1.6. The power to terminate mandate and trusteeship agreements (self-determination) 152
4.1.7. The GA and disarmament 155

4.2. The role of the ICJ in respect of the Security Council’s competencies 156
4.2.1. Exclusive competence to act under Chapter VII 156
4.2.2. Unlimited competence in maintaining international peace and security 157

5. Interpretation and Application of Agreements between the UN and its Specialized Agencies vis-à-vis their Member States 159
5.1. The Headquarters Agreement case between the UN and the US 160
5.2. Interpretation of the Agreement of 25 March 1951 between the WHO and Egypt 161
5.3. The application of the Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of the UN 163

6. The ICJ and the Legal Effect of the Resolutions of the UN Organs 167
6.1. The legal effect of the SC’s resolutions 167
6.2. The legal effect of the GA’s resolutions 171

Conclusion 174

4. The Role of the International Court of Justice in Facilitating the Realisation of the Purposes and Principles of the United Nations through its Contentious Jurisdiction 177
1. The ICJ’s Contentious Jurisdiction: The Necessity of States’ Consent 178
1.1. The forms of states’ consent
   1.1.1. *Ante hoc* consent 180
   1.1.2. *Post hoc* consent 190
1.2. Time of determining the Court’s jurisdiction 193
1.3. Limits upon the ICJ’s jurisdiction 194
# Table of Contents

1.3.1. Reservations upon the ICJ’s jurisdiction 194  
1.3.2. Non-legal disputes 202  

2. The role of the ICJ in maintaining international peace and security 213  
2.1. The practice of the ICJ in settling international disputes 216  
2.2. The relationship between the ICJ and the political organs in settling international disputes 218  
  2.2.1. The role of the political organs with regard to the settlement of international disputes 218  
  2.2.2. The dimensions of the relationship between the ICJ and the political organs of the UN 220  

3. The role of the ICJ with regard to other purposes and principles of the UN 262  
  3.1 Prohibiting the threat or use of force 263  
  3.2. The duty of non-intervention 266  
  3.3. The right of self-defence 269  
  3.4. The principle of equal rights and self-determination of peoples 271  
  3.5. The principle of good faith 273  

Conclusion 277  

5. The International Court of Justice as a Constitutional Court:  
  The Question of Judicial Review 279  
1. The rule of law in the UN 280  
  1.1. Are the UN organs above the law? 280  
  1.2. Sources of law in the UN legal system 287  
    1.2.1. The Charter 287  
    1.2.2. Rules of procedure 287  
    1.2.3. Rules of international law and general principles of law 287  
2. Judicial review in the national and international domain 290  
  2.1. What is meant by the term “judicial review”? 290  
  2.2. Judicial review by domestic courts 290  
  2.3. The practice of judicial review by international courts 292  
3. Judicial review by the ICJ in the framework of the UN 295  
  3.1. Judicial review of the acts of the specialised agencies 295
3.1.1. Constitutional provisions 295
3.1.2. The jurisprudence of the ICJ as a constitutional court 296
3.2. Judicial review by the ICJ of the acts of the political organs of the UN 298
3.2.1. Judicial review of the political organs’ acts in the travaux préparatoires 300
3.2.2. Judicial review of the political organs’ acts in international doctrine 301
3.2.3. The ICJ’s jurisprudence: Recognition of its power of judicial review 308
3.3. Evaluation 320

4. The means of referring acts to the Court 326
4.1. Proprio motu 326
4.2. Direct recourse 327
4.3. Advisory jurisdiction 329
4.4. Contentious jurisdiction 331

5. The scope of the judicial review 333
5.1. Judicial review de novo 334
5.2. Examination of facts 335
5.3. Declaring the invalidity of an act 337
5.4. Judicial review against the failure to act by the organs 338

Conclusion 339

6. The International Court of Justice as a Court of Appeal 341
1. Judicial appeal and other judicial activities 343
1.1. Judicial appeal 343
1.2. The distinction between judicial appeal and other judicial procedures 343
2. The legal basis of the ICJ’s appellate jurisdiction over the Administrative Tribunals’ judgments 345
2.1. The Charter and the ICJ’s Statute 345
2.2. The Statutes of the Administrative Tribunals 346
2.2.1. Art. XII of the Statute of the ILOAT 346