Regulating Cartels in Europe

A Study of Legal Control of Corporate Delinquency

CHRISTOPHER HARDING
and
JULIAN JOSHUA

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
CONTENTS

Tables of Cases xvi
Tables of Treaties, Legislation, and Notices xxi
Glossary of Key Terms xxiii

Introduction: Talking about Cartels: The Main Elements of Analysis and Discussion 1

1. Epistemology: the control of cartels as a subject 1
2. Political economy: the phenomenon and concept of the anti-competitive cartel 2
3. Legal control: competition law as a model of regulation 3
4. Drama: cartel control—the main actors 4
5. History: a twentieth-century overview of European cartel control 5
6. International relations: the global dimension 6
7. Pathology: antitrust delinquency as the target of legal action 7

I. Business Cartels: Sleeping with the Enemy 9

1. A history of ambivalence: is it a criminal law rap? 9
2. Defining cartel arrangements 11
3. The co-operative instinct: 'the customer is our enemy' 16
   (a) Collusion: the main defences 19
4. The macro-economic context: typical markets? 22
   (a) Markets: areas of trade and production 22
   (b) Markets: private or public management 24
5. The micro-economic context: the quest for supracompetitive profit 29
6. Cartel dynamics: the cartel as a private treaty regime 32
   (a) Inside looking out 32
   (b) 'The business community: 'I wanna be closer to you than I am to any customer' 34
   (c) Internal organization: the leader and the pack 36
7. Mapping the discussion 37
II. Models of Legal Control: North America and Europe

1. Atlantic crossing: the usual suspects, but differing perceptions and models of legal control 39
2. Surveying perceptions of the subject: the debate on cartels 41
3. The North American tradition: the delinquency of the business cartel 46
   (a) Part of the American way of life 46
   (b) The crime model 49
4. The European experience: a culture of toleration 52
5. The Quest for mens rea: differing perceptions of antitrust delinquency 55
   (a) ‘Conduct-oriented’ antitrust: the cartel as a conspiracy 57
   (b) ‘Outcome-oriented’ antitrust: the cartel as an instrument of damage 59
6. The dilemma for European cartel regulation: which model? 60

Appendix 1 61

III. Cartels in Europe, 1870–1945: Das Kartellproblem 63

1. The centrality of the German experience: the ‘land of cartels’ 63
2. Cartels in economic longitude: industrialization and economic downturn 65
3. Wilhelmine cartels as vehicles for order and stability 67
4. The arguments against cartels and the need for regulation: das kartellproblem 71
5. The wider European picture: respectable and necessary or suspect and delinquent organizations? 75
6. The mid-century watershed 82

IV. Cartels in Europe, 1945–70: From Registrable Agreement to Concerted Practice 84

1. Post-war debates: back to the drawing board 84
2. The political perspective: the cartel as a tainted organization 85
3. Cartels and international trade: early attempts at international regulation 88
4. The emergence of national regulation of cartels in Europe 96
5. The national position(s): stocktaking in the mid-1960s 100
   (a) Austria 100
   (b) Belgium 101
   (c) Denmark 102
   (d) Finland 102
   (e) France 102
   (f) Germany 104
   (g) The Netherlands 104
   (h) Norway 105
   (i) Sweden 106
   (j) Britain 107
6. The Common Market context 108
7. The European cement market: the hardening of cartel control 113

V. A Narrative of Cartel Regulation in Europe, 1970 to the Present Time 117
1. Reading a history of regulation and enforcement: a 30 years' war 117
2. The early years of litigation 118
3. The lull in litigation, 1975–85 128
4. European cartel litigation: a new legal industry 130
5. Recovering the initiative in enforcement 136
6. Changing modalities of enforcement 140

VI. Proof of Cartel Delinquency: Fashioning the European Cartel Offence 143
1. 'Delinquency inflation' and the emergence of the problem of antitrust evidence 143
2. Economic evidence: the significance of market context 145
3. Economic evidence: the problem of parallel behaviour and 'tacit collusion' 147
4. Testing oligopoly argument under European law 151
   (a) The argument in Dyestuffs 151
   (b) The argument in Wood Pulp 153
5. Forging the cartel offence: marshalling the evidence and framing the charge 159
6. Collecting persuasive proof of cartel participation 164
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VII. Judicial Review of Cartel Control: Testing the Evidence and Due Process</th>
<th>170</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The role of the Community Courts</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Testing the evidence: the Court of First Instance rolls up its sleeves</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The clamour for stronger review: the cartels strike back</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Exercising an 'unfettered evaluation of evidence'</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Judicial review and the search for due process: firing the 'big guns of constitutional artillery'</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The nature of the Commission's procedure</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Investigations and the collection of evidence</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Effective rights of defence and 'access to the file'</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The balance of legal protection</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The significance of procedure and procedural violations</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Different kinds of rights</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Postscript: the epistemology of the debates on judicial review</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VIII. Negotiating Guilt: Leniency and Breaking the Code of Silence</th>
<th>209</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The psychology of business truce: 'your cheating heart'</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Leniency: the American model—designing the irresistible offer</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Leniency: the EC model: a 'prisoner's dilemma' playground</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The St Valentine's Day Notice</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. A European 'patchwork' of leniency: 'amnesty international'?</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The lessons of leniency</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IX. Sanctions: Dealing with Business Delinquency</th>
<th>229</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Sanctions, censure, and effectiveness</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The repertoire of sanctions</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Orders to desist</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Compliance programmes</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Claims for compensation</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The penal option: financial penalties</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The legal character of EC fines</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) The Commission as a sentencing authority</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Sentencing discounts and 'plea-bargaining'</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. The penal option: criminalization and imprisonment 253
5. The European criminalization of cartels 258
   (a) The global campaign against cartels 258
   (b) Criminalization at the national level: the British model 260
   (c) Problems at the interface with European law 262
6. The outlook: an escalation of sanctions? 267

X. Cartel Law in the Twenty-First Century: Globalized and Criminal?
   1. Conversion, convergence, or global mosaic? 270
   2. Retrospective: a parallax view? 271
   3. The character of contemporary European cartel law 277
      (a) The economist's tale: cartel law as competition law 278
      (b) The prosecutor's tale: cartel law as the law of evidence 279
      (c) The defence lawyer's tale: cartel law as corporate rights law 280
      (d) The penologist's tale: cartel law as criminology 283
   4. Prospective: the globalization of cartel regulation? 284
      (a) Globalizing forces: the global economy 285
      (b) A globalized regulation? 286

Bibliography 291
Index 299