DATA PROTECTION LAW
Approaching Its Rationale, Logic and Limits

Lee A. Bygrave
B.A.(Hons.), LL.B.(Hons.), LL.D. / Dr. juris
Barrister of the Supreme Court of New South Wales

2002
KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
The Hague • London • New York
Table of Contents

Foreword *The Hon Justice Michael Kirby AC CMG*  xi
Preface xv
Abbreviations xvii
Table of Statutes and Conventions xix
Table of Cases xxiv

1. Introduction 1
   1.1 Subject Matter and Aims of Book 1
   1.2 Approach and Orientation of Book 9
   1.3 Underlying Thesis of Book 13
   1.4 Source Material and Method 14
      1.4.1 Source material 14
      1.4.2 Legal method and difficulties 15
      1.4.3 Legal aspects of administrative decision making pursuant to Norwegian data protection law 17
      1.4.4 Legislative references 18
   1.5 Terminology 19

PART I: OVERVIEW OF DATA PROTECTION LAWS

2. Aims and Scope of Data Protection Laws 29
   2.1 Introduction 29
   2.2 Primary Points of Reference 30
   2.3 Aims 37
   2.4 Ambit 41
      2.4.1 Coverage with regard to type of data 41
      2.4.2 Coverage with regard to type of data processing 50
      2.4.3 Coverage with regard to sectors 53

3. Core Principles of Data Protection Laws 57
   3.1 Introduction 57
   3.2 Fair and Lawful Processing 58
   3.3 Minimality 59
# Table of Contents

3.4 Purpose Specification 61  
3.5 Information Quality 62  
3.6 Data Subject Participation and Control 63  
3.7 Disclosure Limitation 67  
3.8 Information Security 67  
3.9 Sensitivity 68  

4. Monitoring, Supervisory and Enforcement Regimes 70  
4.1 Data Protection Authorities 70  
4.2 Notification and Licensing Schemes 75  
4.3 Sanctions and Remedies 77  
4.4 Transborder Data Flows 79  

5. Concluding Observations for Part I 84  

PART II: ORIGINS, RATIONALE AND CHARACTER OF DATA PROTECTION LAWS

6. Catalysts for Emergence of Data Protection Laws 93  
6.1 Introduction 93  
6.2 Technological and Organisational Developments 93  
6.2.1 Developments generally 93  
6.2.2 Developments in mass surveillance and control 100  
6.2.3 Problems with quality of data/information 105  
6.3 Fears 107  
6.3.1 Fears over threats to privacy and related values 107  
6.3.2 Economic fears 112  
6.4 Legal Factors 116  
6.4.1 Positive legal factors 116  
6.4.2 Negative legal factors 123  

7. Values and Interests Safeguarded by Data Protection Laws 125  
7.1 Introduction 125  
7.2 Interests of Data Subjects 125  
7.2.1 Privacy and integrity 125  
7.2.2 Values and interests associated with privacy 133  
7.2.3 Informational values and interests 136  
7.2.4 Norwegian interest models 137  
7.2.5 A re-elaboration of data protection interests 144  
7.3 Interests of Data Controllers 160  

8. Concluding Observations for Part II 165
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**PART III: DATA PROTECTION RIGHTS FOR PRIVATE COLLECTIVE ENTITIES**

9. Background to Issue 173  
9.1 Parameters of the Issue 173  
9.2 Early Enthusiasm for Protecting Collective Entity Data 178  
9.3 Official Motives for Giving Data Protection Rights to Collective Entities 186  
9.4 Opposition to Data Protection Rights for Collective Entities 192  

10. Existing Safeguards for Data on Collective Entities Pursuant to Data Protection Laws 199  
10.1 Express Protection 199  
10.1.1 Legislative points of departure 199  
10.1.2 Discriminatory provisions 201  
10.1.3 Discriminatory practices 205  
10.2 Sectoral Express Protection 205  
10.3 Indirect Protection 210  

11. Consequences of Protecting Data on Collective Entities 216  
11.1 Allegations about Consequences 216  
11.2 Actual Consequences 219  
11.2.1 Survey method 219  
11.2.2 Access rights 220  
11.2.3 Transborder data flows 223  
11.2.4 Organisational burdens 228  
11.2.5 The ‘mixed file’ and ‘small business’ problems 228  
11.2.6 Conclusions on survey results 230  
11.3 Actual Cases of Data Protection for Organised Collective Entities 232  
11.3.1 Denmark 233  
11.3.2 Norway 236  
11.3.3 Conclusions on the above cases 238  

12. Data Protection Interests of Collective Entities 241  
12.1 The Privacy-based Argument against Data Protection Rights for Collective Entities 241  
12.1.1 Elements of argument 241  
12.1.2 Relationship between privacy and collective entities 242  
12.2 Applicability of Other Data Protection Interests to Collective Entities 253  
12.3 Summing Up 254  

13. Social, Economic and Political Factors 257  
13.1 Introduction 257
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.2 Social Impact/Risk</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3 Information Use</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4 Vulnerability and Resources</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5 Expectations and Accountability</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6 Summing Up</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Legal Factors</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.1 Introduction</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2 Protection of Collective Entities under other Branches of Law</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.1 Extent of protection</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.2 Desirability of protection</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.3 Possible Legislative Regimes for Protecting Collective Entity Data</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4 Summing Up</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Protection For Data On Non-Organised Collective Entities</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.1 Introduction</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.2 Nature of Non-Organised Collective Entities</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3 Previous Approaches to Issue</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4 Existing Safeguards under Data Protection Laws</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.5 Group Actions</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.6 Extending Protection Levels?</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.7 Summing Up</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Concluding Observations for Part III</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART IV: PROFILING – REGULATION BY DATA PROTECTION LAWS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Profiling as Practice and Problem</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.1 Introduction</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2 Profiling as Practice</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3 Profiling as Problem</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Regulation of Profiling</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.1 Introduction</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.2 The Concept of Personal Data Revisited – Particularly in Light of</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet Profiling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3 Express Regulation of Profiling</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3.1 EC Directive</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3.2 Germany’s Teleservices Data Protection Act</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3.3 The Swiss federal Data Protection Act</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3.4 Norwegian PDA</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.4 Indirect Regulation of Profiling</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.4.1 Principle of fair and lawful processing</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

18.4.2 Principle of purpose specification 337  
18.4.3 Principle of minimality 341  
18.4.4 Principle of information quality 348  
18.4.5 Principle of data subject participation and control 351  
18.4.6 General exceptions and derogations 356  
18.4.7 Regulation pursuant to a licensing regime 357  

19. Concluding Remarks on Part IV 363  
20. Conclusion 377  
Select Bibliography 381  
Index 411