Contents

Foreword ix
by Louis B. Sohn

Editor's Foreword xi
by Burns H. Weston

Acknowledgements xiii
Abbreviations xv
Preface xix

Chapter 1 A Brief History of the Establishment of the Human Rights Committee 1
I. The Creation of an International Bill of Rights 1
II. The Convention-Based Human Rights System 10
III. The Charter-Based Human Rights System 17

Chapter 2 International Norms Relating to the Procedures of the Human Rights Committee 29
I. Introduction 29
II. The Principle of Legality and Its Application to the Human Rights Committee 30
A. The Human Rights Committee's Competence 31
B. The Human Rights Committee's Obligation to Fulfil its Mandate 37
C. The Cold War 43
D. The Principle of Consensus 48
E. A New Context 56
III. Interpretation of the Constitutive Instruments of the Human Rights Committee: The International Civil and Political Covenant and the Optional Protocol 59
A. The Doctrine of Plain Meaning 61
B. The Principle of Effectiveness 64
1. The Object and Purpose of the ICCPR and the OP 64
2. The Doctrine of Implied Powers 69
3. The Intention of the Parties 78
4. The Practice of the Human Rights Committee 80
IV. The Principle of Legitimacy and Its Application to the Human Rights Committee 91
Chapter 3. The Procedure of Human Rights Committee in Relation to Communications

I. Introduction ........................................... 141

II. The Framework of the Communications Procedure ................................. 141
   A. Raising a Claim ...................................... 142
   B. Admission of a Claim ................................ 146
      1. The Registration Process .......................... 146
      2. Additional Information ............................ 147
      3. The Elements of Admissibility ................... 147
         i. Article 1 ........................................ 151
         ii. Article 2 ...................................... 156
         iii. Article 3 ...................................... 161
         iv. Article 4 ...................................... 167
         v. Articles 2 and 5(2)(b) .......................... 168
         vi. Article 5(2)(a) ................................ 172
   C. Review of Admissibility and Other Decisions .................................. 175
   D. The Human Rights Committee’s Views ........................................ 176
   E. The Use of Precedent in the Human Rights Committee ....................... 182
III. The Rules of Evidence and Proof in the Human Rights Committee

A. Introduction ........................................... 184
B. Evidentiary Rules in International Law ................. 185
C. The Production and Elicitation of Evidence .......... 190
   1. Types of Formal Proof .............................. 190
   2. The Parties and Other Sources of
      Information ......................................... 197
      i. The State Party .................................. 200
      ii. The Author ..................................... 201
      iii. Hearsay Evidence ............................. 201
   3. Alternatives to Formal Proof ......................... 207
      i. The Doctrine of Judicial Notice and
      Other Sources of Evidence ......................... 207
      ii. The Use of Previous Decisions as a
      Basis for Factual Determinations ................. 210
D. Basic Conditions to Admissibility of Evidence ....... 213
   1. Relevancy ........................................... 216
   2. The Rule on Time-Limits ............................ 219
E. The Evaluation of Evidence ............................... 224
   1. The Burden of Production ......................... 225
   2. The Burden of Proof ............................... 225
   3. The Standard of Proof ............................. 236
      i. Sufficiently Substantiated at the
      Admissibility Stage ............................. 237
      ii. Sufficiently Substantiated at the
      Merits Stage ..................................... 243
F. Synthesizing the Human Rights Committee’s
   Application of Principles of Evidence
   and Proof ............................................. 246

Chapter 4 Communications Involving Complaints
Against States Parties’ Judiciaries .......................... 249

I. Introduction ........................................... 249
II. The Normative Framework for Consideration of
    Claims Arising Under Article 14(1) .................. 254
   A. The Principle of “No Fourth Instance”............. 254
   B. The Limits of the Principle of “No Fourth
      Instance”: A Tripartite Test ..................... 256
III. The Human Rights Committee’s Application of
     Principles Developed in the Context of
     Article 14(1) Claims ............................... 264
     A. Introduction ..................................... 264
B. Application of the Principle of “No Fourth Instance” at the Admissibility Stage 266
   1. Dismissals Made Pursuant to Article 2 266
   2. Dismissals Made Pursuant to Article 3 269
C. Application of the Principle of “No Fourth Instance” at the Merits Stage 275
D. Application of the Principle of “No Fourth Instance” in Cases Where Admissibility and the Merits Are Considered Simultaneously 287

IV. Complaints of State Violation of Other ICCPR Articles by Means of Judicial Action 292

Chapter 5 Conclusions 297

Appendix A: Cross-Referencing Guide to the Records of the Human Rights Committee 305

Appendix B: Rules of Procedure of the Human Rights Committee 311

Bibliography 335

Table of Cases 343

Index 347

About The Procedural Aspects of International Law Institute 353

Procedural Aspects of International Law Monograph Series 353

Other PAIL Institute Publications 355