TAKing life imprisonment seriously
in national and international law

by

Dirk van Zyl Smit

Kluwer law international
the Hague / London / New York
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ix  
List of Tables xi  

**CHAPTER 1 – STUDying Life Imprisonment**  
1. What is a life sentence? 1  
2. A brief historical introduction 4  
3. Justifying and limiting punishment 7  
   a) Prohibitions on cruel, inhuman and degrading punishments 7  
   b) Human dignity 10  
   c) Rehabilitation 12  
   d) Liberty, legality and due process 14  
4. Punishment in context 16  
5. The structure of this book 17  

**CHAPTER 2 – THE United States of America**  
1. The current position 20  
2. Historical background 29  
   a) The colonies and the new republic 29  
   b) A new penal vision 33  
   c) Implementing the new vision 37  
   d) Consolidation and restriction 42  
3. The 1970s and the modern era 49  
   a) Life sentences for drug offenders 51  
   b) Life without parole 54  
   c) ‘Three strikes and you are out’ 58  
4. Life imprisonment and the Constitution 62  
5. Juveniles 71  
6. Indirect life sentences for the dangerous sane? 73  
7. Conclusion 76  

**CHAPTER 3 – ENGLAND and WALES**  
1. The current position 78  
2. Historical background 84  
   a) Early alternatives to the death penalty 84  
   b) Indeterminate preventive sentences 85
Table of Contents

3. The new system in operation 92
4. Contemporary life imprisonment: so what has changed? 96
   a) Imposing life prior to the Human Rights Act 1998 97
      (i) Mandatory life sentences for murder 97
      (ii) Discretionary life sentences 105
      (iii) Automatic life sentences 108
   b) Implementing life 112
      (i) Discretionary and automatic life sentences 112
      (ii) Mandatory life sentences 117
      (iii) Juveniles 124
5. Human rights for lifers as the way forward? 128
6. Conclusion 131

CHAPTER 4 - GERMANY 135
1. The current position 135
2. Historical background 139
3. The purpose of imprisonment and the life sentence 143
4. The constitutional challenge 145
5. The impact of the 1977 decision of the Federal Constitutional Court 150
6. Further constitutional decisions 152
7. Abolition as the (constitutional) alternative? 155
8. Resurgent punitiveness? 161
9. Conclusion 164

CHAPTER 5 - INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE 167
1. The current position 167
2. Punishment in international law 167
3. The International Law Commission 171
   a) Arguments against life imprisonment 173
   b) Arguments for life imprisonment 174
4. Building on the debate of the International Law Commission 176
5. Life imprisonment and international Realpolitik 177
   a) Life imprisonment as automatic substitute for the death penalty? 180
   b) Releasing lifers 183
   c) The tribunals in practice 185
6. The International Criminal Court: a principled compromise? 188
   a) Restricted use of life imprisonment 190
   b) International penalties and national laws 191
   c) Enforcement of sentences 192
7. Conclusion 196

CHAPTER 6 - TAKING LIFE IMPRISONMENT SERIOUSLY? 197
1. Introduction 197
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Severity and proportionality</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Life sentences for habitual offenders?</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Dangerousness and risk as limits on proportionality</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Dangerousness tamed?</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Life imprisonment for the most severe crimes?</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Human dignity</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Practice</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Conclusion</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BIBLIOGRAPHY 218

TABLE OF CASES 233

INDEX 237