Table of Contents

Table of Cases xv
Table of Legislation xxix
List of Abbreviations xxxix
Preface xli

Chapter 1: The European Community and Language Policy: Why do Minority Languages Matter? 1

1. THE RATIONALE OF LANGUAGE POLICY 1

2. THE (OFFICIAL) LANGUAGE POLICY OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITY 4
   A. Introduction 4
   B. Language in the Community Institutions 12
      (i) The European Court of Justice 12
      (ii) The Commission and the Council 15
      (iii) The Parliament 17
   C. Implications for Translation and Interpretation 18
      (i) Practical Impact on Translation and Interpretation Services 18
      (ii) Interpretation of Multilingual Texts 19
      (iii) Conclusion 20
   D. The Language Dimension of Fundamental Community Freedoms 21
      (i) Free Movement of Persons 22
      (ii) Right of Establishment and Freedom to Provide Services 24
      (iii) Free Movement of Goods 25
   E. Conclusion: Should EC Language Policy be Reformed? 28

3. SUSTAINING LINGUISTIC DIVERSITY: THE ROLE OF THE EC 33
   A. Introduction 33
   B. Is Linguistic Uniformity Necessary for 'True' European Unity? 34
Table of Contents

C. The Sovereignty Dimension 39
D. Issues of Democracy and Citizenship 44
E. Economic Considerations 45
F. Conclusion 48

4. MINORITY LANGUAGES: A PARTICULAR CONCERN? 48
   A. Definitions and Terminology: What is a Minority Language? 48
   B. The Status of Minority Languages in the EC 51
      (i) Irish and Letzeburgesch 52
      (ii) The Position of Minority Languages Generally 53
   C. Determining Cultural Democracy 54
   D. The EC and Minority Languages: Framing Responsibility 56

5. CONCLUSION 60

Chapter 2: Early Days: The Origins of EC Minority Language Policy 61

1. INTRODUCTION 61

2. INITIATIVES IN THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT 61
   A. Arfe Resolution (1981) 62
      (i) Background 62
      (ii) Content and Commentary 63
      (iii) Impact of the Resolution 65
   B. Arfe Resolution (2) (1983) 66
   C. Kuijpers Resolution (1987) 67
      (i) Introduction 67
      (ii) Content and Commentary 68
   D. Conclusion 70

3. JURISPRUDENCE OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE 71
   A. Ministère Public v. Robert Heinrich Maria Mutsch 72
      (i) Facts 72
      (ii) Judgment of the Court 74
      (iii) Commentary 74
Table of Contents

B. Anita Groener v. Minister for Education and the City of Dublin Vocational Education Committee 80
(i) Facts 80
(ii) Judgment of the Court 85
(iii) Commentary 86
(a) The 'nature of the post to be filled' 87
(b) The legal status of the language 91
(c) Competence versus fluency 95
(d) The free movement of workers and the question of discrimination 96
(e) The public service exception 102
(iv) Conclusion 103

C. Conclusion 105

4. CONCLUSION 105

Chapter 3: Language and EC Cultural Policy 107

1. INTRODUCTION: DEFINING CULTURE IN A COMMUNITY CONTEXT 107

2. DESTINATION MAASTRICHT: TRACING COMMUNITY ACTION IN THE FIELD OF CULTURE 114
A. 'Essential and Incidental': Where Culture meets Trade 115
B. The Evolution of EC Cultural Policy 118

3. ARTICLE 151 EC: AN APPRAISAL 126
A. Introduction 126
B. Article 151(1) 127
C. Article 151(2) 131
D. Article 151(3) 139
E. Article 151(4) 141
F. Article 151(5) 146

4. CONCLUSION 152
Chapter 4: Cultural Policy and the Principle of Subsidiarity

1. INTRODUCTION

2. THE SCOPE OF ARTICLE 5 EC: 'WHICH PRINCIPLE'?
   A. The Codification of Subsidiarity in Community Law
      (i) Before Maastricht
      (ii) Subsidiarity and the EC Treaty
   B. Applying Article 5: Tests and Criteria
   C. Conclusion

3. ARTICLE 151 AND THE APPLICATION OF SUBSIDIARITY
   A. Early Predictions
   B. Official Guidelines: The Edinburgh Summit and Amsterdam Protocol
   C. Elaboration of the EC Criteria: Academic Commentary
      (i) Is the scale of the problem so large that it needs to be tackled by the EC?
      (ii) Is there a substantial impact on cross-border situations and policies?
      (iii) Would differences between Member States be inherently inconsistent with the objective?
      (iv) How important economically is the distortion of competition, or the barrier to trade or other problem, which it is intended to eliminate? Will its importance increase or diminish?
      (v) What ill effects will result if no action is taken? Will the ill effects increase over time if not prevented?
      (vi) Can the objective be achieved by minimum standards or by mutual recognition rather than by comprehensive rules?
      (vii) Is a regulation or a directive more appropriate?
      (viii) Can the objective be achieved by providing funds rather than by rule making, or by co-ordination of national policies rather than by a Community measure?
      (ix) If the aim can be achieved in several different ways, could the Community measure allow Member States to choose one of several options?
(x) Would Community measures to achieve the aim in question be an objectively reasonable quid pro quo for a significant number of Member States to seek in response to some other Community measures? 184
(xi) If a Community measure were adopted, should it contain provisions for the special problems of particular regions? 184

4. CONCLUSION


1. INTRODUCTION

2. LANGUAGE MATTERS? LANGUAGE RIGHTS AS FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS 188
   A. International Standards on the Protection of Language Rights: Historical Origins 190
   B. Language Rights as Fundamental Rights: Competing Theories? 192

3. FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITY 209
   A. The EC and Fundamental Rights: Tracking a Jurisdiction 210
   C. The Protection of Language Rights: Sourcing International and National Standards 221
      (i) International Foundations: The United Nations 221
      (ii) Regional Adaptation: The Council of Europe 223
      (iii) National Provisions: Language and the Member State Constitutions 232
      (iv) Conclusion 233

4. WHERE TO FROM HERE? THE EVOLVING PROTECTION OF RIGHTS IN THE COMMUNITY LEGAL ORDER 234
   A. ‘Combating’ Discrimination? Article 13 EC 236
   B. The Way Forward? The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights 239
   C. Citizenship of the Union: Evolving Rights and Duties 247
   D. EC Influence on Member State Policy: ‘Aspiration Rights’ 256

5. CONCLUSION 260
### Table of Contents

#### Chapter 6: Minority Language Policy and the EC Institutions: The Emerging Ethos

1. **INTRODUCTION**

2. **DEVELOPMENTS IN THE INSTITUTIONS: THE PARLIAMENT AND THE COMMISSION**
     1. **Background**
     2. **Content and Commentary**
   - B. Communications from the Commission
     1. **Background**
     2. **Findings and Commentary**

3. **JURISPRUDENCE OF THE COURT OF JUSTICE**
   - A. Commission v. Luxembourg
     1. **Facts and Judgment of the Court**
     2. **Commentary**
   - B. Criminal Proceedings against Bickel and Franz
     1. **Facts**
     2. **Judgment of the Court**
     3. **Commentary**
   - C. Angonese v. Cassa di Risparmio di Bolzano SpA
     1. **Facts and Judgment**
     2. **Comment**

4. **CONCLUSION**

#### Chapter 7: Conclusion

**Appendix I: Relevant Constitutional Provisions of the EC Member States**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix II: Text of the Resolutions of the European Parliament</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>