COMPETITION LAW AND THE WORLD TRADE ORGANISATION: THE LIMITS OF MULTILATERALISM

Kevin C. Kennedy

Professor of Law
Michigan State University
Detroit College of Law
East Lansing, Michigan

LONDON
SWEET & MAXWELL
2001
Contents

Acknowledgements vi
Preface vii
Contents xi
Table of Cases xvii
Table of Legislation xxiii
International Agreements and other formulations of International Trade Law xxvii
Table of Abbreviations xxxvii

Chapter 1: Trade and Competition Policy at the World Trade Organisation: An Introduction and Overview

I. What Is the Trade and Competition Policy Relationship? 1.05
   A. Complementarities between Trade and Competition Policy 1.06
   B. Divergences between Trade and Competition Policy 1.13
   C. Summary 1.27

II. Competition Policy at the WTO: A First Look 1.31

Chapter 2: Unilateral, Bilateral, Regional, Plurilateral, and Multilateral Approaches to Competition Policy

I. Introduction 2.001

II. Unilateral Approaches 2.002
   A. Self-Restraint: Comity 2.013
   B. Other Self-Restraints on Unilateral Approaches 2.022
   C. Anti-Competitive Conduct that may go Unchallenged Under a Unilateral Approach 2.027
   D. Reactions to Unilateral Approaches: Foreign Non-disclosure Laws, Clawback Statutes, and Official Protests 2.029
   E. The Limits of Unilateralism 2.032

III. Bilateral Approaches 2.037
   A. Bilateral Co-operation Agreements on Competition Law Enforcement 2.041
      1. The 1976 Germany-U.S. Antitrust Accord 2.042
      2. The 1982 Australia-U.S. Antitrust Co-operation Agreement 2.044
      3. The Canada-U.S. Co-operation Agreements 2.047
      4. The E.U.-U.S. Co-operation Agreements 2.052
      5. The 1999 Israel-U.S. Antitrust Co-operation Agreement 2.063
6. The 1999 Japan-U.S. Antitrust Co-operation Agreement 2.064
7. The 1999 Brazil-U.S. Antitrust Co-operation Agreement 2.068
8. The E.U.-Eastern and Central Europe Co-operation Agreements 2.069
10. Other Bilateral Co-operation Agreements 2.071

B. Mutual Legal Assistance Agreements on Competition Law Enforcement 2.072
   1. Bilateral Agreements on Antitrust Enforcement under the IAEAA 2.077

C. The Australia-New Zealand Closer Economic Relations Trade Agreement 2.088

IV. Regional Approaches 2.091
   A. The European Union 2.091
      1. Article 81 on Restrictive Agreements 2.094
      2. Article 82 on Abuse of a Dominant Position 2.105
      3. Article 86 on Government-Induced Distortions of Competition 2.107
      4. The Regulation of Mergers and Acquisitions 2.108
      5. Extraterritoriality and Comity 2.115
   B. MERCOSUR 2.117
      1. Introduction 2.117
      2. Competition Policy 2.122
   C. NAFTA 2.129
   D. The Free Trade Area of the Americas 2.137
      1. Introduction 2.137
      2. The Negotiating Group on Competition Policy 2.142
   E. CARICOM 2.149

V. Plurilateral Approaches 2.151
   A. The Work of the OECD 2.151
      1. Introduction 2.151
      2. Studies and Recommendations on Trade and Competition Policy 2.152
      3. Guidelines for MNEs on Competition Law and Policy 2.154
      4. Co-operation on Competition Law Enforcement 2.160
      5. Recommendation on action against Hard-Core Cartels 2.164
      6. Notification of transnational Mergers 2.167
      7. Technical assistance to developing countries 2.170
      8. Summary 2.171
   B. APEC 2.172
      1. Introduction 2.172
      2. Competition Policy 2.175
Chapter 3: Trade and Competition Policy at the WTO: The Past and Present

I. The History of Competition Policy in the GATT-WTO System
   A. The Havana Charter and the Stillborn International Trade Organisation 3.001
   B. Competition Policy under GATT 1994 3.010
      1. Provisions in GATT 1994 relating to Competition Policy 3.010
   C. Proposals to add Competition Policy Provisions to GATT 1947 3.034
   D. GATT Dispute Settlement Proceedings involving Competition Policy Issues 3.036
      1. The Canadian Foreign Investment Review Act dispute 3.037
      2. The Copper Cartel dispute 3.038
      3. The Semiconductors dispute 3.039
      4. Japanese Keiretsu 3.041

II. WTO Rules on Competition Policy 3.042
   A. Competition Policy issues addressed in the Uruguay Round Agreements 3.044
      1. The TRIPS Agreement 3.045
      2. The GATS 3.060
      3. The TRIMs Agreement 3.077
      4. The Safeguards Agreement 3.087
      5. The Agreement on Government Procurement 3.095
      6. Other WTO Provisions 3.098
      7. Summary 3.099
   B. Competition Policy Disputes in the WTO 3.100
      1. The Kodak-Fuji Film Dispute 3.101
      2. The Antidumping Act of 1916 Dispute 3.112

III. Cautious Steps Forward on Competition Policy Negotiations at the WTO 3.116

Chapter 4: The Search for Convergence, the Reality of Divergence

I. The WTO Work Programme on Competition Policy 4.001
   A. The WGTCP’s 1997 Work Programme 4.002
   B. The WGTCP’s 1998 Work Programme 4.016
   C. The WGTCP’s 1999 Work Programme 4.031
D. The WGTCP's 2000 Work Programme 4.044
E. Other WTO Activities on Trade and Competition Policy 4.050

II. Areas of Convergence and Divergence: threshold issues 4.051

III. Horizontal Restraints 4.057
A. Cartel Activity 4.059
1. Introduction 4.059
2. An example of Prohibited Cartel Activity: Price Fixing 4.061
3. Problems in Policing Export Cartel Activity 4.064
4. The OECD Recommendation on Hard-core Cartels 4.077
B. Import Cartels 4.078
C. Trading companies 4.080

IV. Vertical Restraints 4.082
A. Resale price maintenance 4.085
B. Vertical non-price restraints 4.088
C. Abuse of Intellectual Property rights in vertical agreements 4.091
D. Grey market goods and the Doctrine of Exhaustion 4.096
1. The regulation of grey market goods in the United States 4.100
E. Parent-subsidiary relationships 4.108

V. Abuse of a Dominant Position (Unlawful Monopolisation) 4.111
A. Definition of the relevant market 4.112
B. Predatory pricing 4.120
C. The fit of the Price Discrimination Laws and the Antidumping Duty Law 4.125

VI. Mergers and Acquisitions 4.143

VII. Residual Issues 4.157

VIII. Summary 4.173

Chapter 5: Trade and Competition Policy at the WTO: The Future 5.01
I. A WTO Multilateral Agreement on Competition Policy 5.02
A. A multilateral agreement on minimum RBP standards 5.03
1. Minimum Standards on Anti-Competitive Conduct 5.03
2. Non-Discrimination and Transparency 5.11
3. Dispute Settlement 5.12
4. Developing Countries 5.16
B. A WTO Framework Agreement on Core Principles 5.29
1. National Treatment 5.31
2. Most favoured-nation treatment 5.32
3. Transparency 5.34
CONTENTS

4. The Content and Coverage of Competition Laws 5.35
5. Effective Enforcement Procedures and Meaningful Remedies 5.36
6. International Co-operation and Co-ordination 5.37
7. Developing Countries and Economies in Transition 5.38
8. Dispute Settlement 5.39

C. The Structure of Negotiations on a Multilateral Competition Policy Agreement 5.51

II. A WTO Plurilateral Agreement on Competition Policy 5.54
III. An OECD Agreement on Competition Policy 5.57

Chapter 6: The Limits of Multilateralism

I. Preconditions to Negotiations on a WTO Agreement on Competition Policy 6.01

II. Addressing Private RBPs under Existing GATT-WTO Rules 6.51

A. An Article XXIII: 1(a) Nullification or Impairment Complaint 6.53
   1. An Article II: 4 Import Monopoly Complaint 6.55
   2. A National Treatment Complaint 6.57
   3. An Article XI Quantitative Restriction Complaint 6.64
   4. Private import or export monopolies established under GATT Article XVII 6.68
   5. GATS Competition Policy commitments 6.70
   6. Abuse of Intellectual Property Rights 6.77

B. An Article XXIII: 1(b) Non-Violation Nullification or Impairment Complaint 6.78

C. An Article XXIII: 1(c) Non-Violation Nullification or Impairment Complaint 6.87

D. A post-mortem on and lessons from the Kodak-Fuji Film dispute 6.93

III. Summary and Conclusions 6.96

Index 333