Privity
Private justice or public regulation

Edited by
PETER KINCAID
Macquarie University
Sydney

Ashgate
DARTMOUTH
Aldershot • Burlington USA • Singapore • Sydney
## Contents

*Contributors*...x
*Preface*...xi
*Acknowledgments*...xiii

1 **Theoretical Issues Raised by the Privity Question**
   
   *Peter Kincaid*
   
   Private or Public Justice ................................. 1
   Flexible v. Formal Reasoning ............................. 2
   Pragmatism v. Principle .................................. 3
   Nature and Source of a Third-Party Right ................ 4
   Rights and Duties: the Question of Focus ................ 5
   Remedies .................................................. 6

2 **Summaries of Essays**
   
   *Peter Kincaid*
   
   Chapter 3: Robert Flannigan, “Privity – The End of an Era (Error)” ..... 7
   Chapter 4
      (Part B): Peter Kincaid, “Privity Reform in England” .................... 10
   Chapter 5: Sir Anthony Mason, “Privity – A Rule in Search of Decent
      Burial?” .................................................................. 11
   Chapter 6: Catherine Mitchell, “Searching for the Principles behind
      Privity Reform” ......................................................... 13
   Chapter 7: Roger Brownsword and Dale Hutchison, “Beyond
      Promissory Principle and Protective Pragmatism” .......................... 14
   Chapter 8: Stephen A. Smith, “Contracts for the Benefit of Third
      Parties: in Defence of the Third-Party Rule” ................................. 16
   Chapter 9: Melvin Aron Eisenberg, “The Third-Party Beneficiary
      Principle” .................................................................. 18
   Chapter 10: John Gava, “Is Privity Worth Defending?” ....................... 19
   Chapter 11: John Swan, “The Rights of Third Parties to Contracts: A
      Suggested Basis for Recognition” ........................................... 20
   Chapter 12: Simon Whittaker, “Reciprocity Beyond Privity” ................. 22
   Chapter 13: J.L.R. Davis, “Privity and Exclusion Clauses” ..................... 24
   Chapter 14: Anthony Jon Waters, “Privity, Property, and Pragmatism” ..... 26
Privity: Private justice or public regulation

3 Privity – The End of an Era (Error) .......................................................... 28
   Robert Flannigan
   - The Early Cases .................................................................................. 29
   - Privity or Consideration? ................................................................. 32
   - The Entrenchment of the Doctrine of Privity ..................................... 34
   - The Modern Cases ......................................................................... 38
   - Privity Pro and Con .................................................................. 40
   - Privity and Contract Theory ......................................................... 48
   - Conclusion ................................................................................. 59

4a Privity and Private Justice in Contract ............................................. 60
   Peter Kincaid
   - Introduction .................................................................................. 60
   - The Law Commission’s Proposals .................................................. 61
   - The Law Commission’s Justifications .......................................... 63
   - Issues Raised by Justifications ...................................................... 71
   - Conclusion ................................................................................ 80

4b Privity Reform in England ................................................................. 82
   Peter Kincaid

5 Privity – A Rule in Search of Decent Burial? .................................... 88
   Sir Anthony Mason
   - The Nature of the Privity Rule ....................................................... 88
   - The Purpose of the Privity Rule ..................................................... 88
   - Suggested Justifications for the Rule ........................................... 91
   - The Rule is not Accepted or has been Modified Elsewhere ......... 93
   - The Justification for Departing from the Rule ............................ 94
   - Other Reasons for Departing from the Rule ................................. 95
   - Trust of the Third-Party Promise ............................................... 97
   - Complexity, Artificiality and Uncertainty .................................. 97
   - Adverse Consequences for Commercial Activities ..................... 98
   - Criticisms of the Case for Departing from the Rule ................. 98
   - Other Criticisms of Reform ......................................................... 100
   - Conditions According to which Third-Party Enforcement is Permitted ......................................................... 102
   - Conclusion ................................................................................ 103

6 Searching for the Principles Behind Privity Reform ...................... 104
   Catherine Mitchell
   - Introduction ................................................................................ 104
   - The Proposals for Reform .......................................................... 108
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Law Commission Proposals and the Orthodox Account of Contractual Obligation</td>
<td>109</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can the Orthodox Account Justify Third-Party Rights in Contract?</td>
<td>114</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Crystallisation Test</td>
<td>120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Law Commission and the Modern Account of Contractual Obligations</td>
<td>121</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>124</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Beyond Promissory Principle and Protective Pragmatism</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roger Brownsword and Dale Hutchison</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>126</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. From Bilateral to Trilateral Promissory Situations</td>
<td>128</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The South African Regime</td>
<td>132</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The New English Regime</td>
<td>142</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion</td>
<td>145</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>In Defence of the Third-Party Rule</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen A. Smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Third-Party Rule Defined and Defended</td>
<td>148</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Real Problems in Privity Cases</td>
<td>155</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Law Commission’s Reform Proposals</td>
<td>166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusion</td>
<td>170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The Third-Party Beneficiary Principle</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melvin Aron Eisenberg</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>172</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Principle Governing Enforceability of Contracts by Third-Party Beneficiaries</td>
<td>173</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Some Recurring Third-Party-Beneficiary Categories</td>
<td>185</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>198</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Is Privity Worth Defending?</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Gava</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functionalism and Contract</td>
<td>201</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functionalism and Legal History</td>
<td>203</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract in the Marketplace</td>
<td>209</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can Judges be Good Functionalists?</td>
<td>215</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract as Part of the Common Law Constitutional Heritage</td>
<td>222</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does it Matter that Contract does not Matter?</td>
<td>226</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract and Turbo-Capitalism</td>
<td>229</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>232</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
11 The Rights of Third Parties to Contracts: A Suggested Basis for Recognition

John Swan
1. Introduction.................................................................................................................. 233
2. The Practical Pattern.................................................................................................. 235
3. A Principle for Recognition?...................................................................................... 246
4. Conclusion.................................................................................................................. 257

12 Reciprocity Beyond Privity

Simon Whittaker
1. Leasehold Covenants......................................................................................... 263
2. Transferring Contracts of Employment................................................................. 265
3. Undisclosed Principals......................................................................................... 269
4. Package Holidays................................................................................................... 271
5. The Death of the Parties: Privity and Personal Representatives....................... 273
6. Freehold Covenants............................................................................................... 274
7. A General Principle of Benefit and Burden Beyond Privity?............................ 277
Conclusion..................................................................................................................... 281

13 Privity and Exclusion Clauses

J.L.R. Davis
Introduction.................................................................................................................... 284
The Benefit of an Exclusion Clause........................................................................... 285
The Burden of an Exclusion Clause.......................................................................... 302
Conclusion..................................................................................................................... 307

14 Privity, Property, and Pragmatism

Anthony Jon Waters
1. The History of the American Rule......................................................................... 310
2. Why the Need for a General Rule?......................................................................... 318
3. Can a Fuzzy Set of Reasons Constitute a Coherent Concoction? And Does It Matter?................................................................. 320
4. Public and Private................................................................................................... 325
5. The Nature of Contract............................................................................................ 327
Conclusion..................................................................................................................... 331
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix: Contracts (Rights of Third Parties) Act 1999</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statutes</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>