Common Values and the Public-Private Divide

Dawn Oliver

Faculty of Laws, University College London

Butterworths
London, Edinburgh, Dublin
1999
Preface v
Table of statutes xv
List of cases xvii

Chapter One
Public Law, Private Law: Problematic Concepts 1

Theories of government, democracy and citizenship in public law 2
   Positivist authoritarianism  2
   Liberal majoritarianism  4
   Considerate altruism  5
   Participative communitarianism  5
   Citizenship theories  7
   Civil democracy and citizenship  8

The public/private divide in English law 9
   The state and public sector reform 11
   Can public and private law be separated? 14
   Defining public law 15

The public/private divide in civil law systems 16

The development of English public law: remedies and substance 19
   Remedies 20
   Substantive public law 21

From status to contract: public law, private law and the imposition of legal obligations 22

Supervisory jurisdictions 25
Where public and private law meet and mix 27

The next steps 29
Chapter Two

Democracy, Power and its Control  31

The meanings and nature of power  32
  Galbraith’s anatomy of power  34
  Daintith’s analysis of power: ‘imperium’ and ‘dominium’  36
Power, powers and the justifications for judicial review  37
  The ultra vires rule  38
  Judicial review of non-statutory powers  40
  The sovereignty of Parliament  41
  The equitable and common law roots of judicial review  43
Bagg’s case, 1615  45
The development of the common law jurisdiction to control exercises of power  47
  Mandamus  48
  Certiorari and prohibition  50
  Procedural protections in judicial review  51
The ultra vires rule reconsidered  53

Chapter Three

The Values of Public and Private Law  55

The concept of ‘values’  56
The five ‘key’ values  60
  Autonomy, dignity and respect  60
  Status  65
  Security  67
  Competing values  70

Chapter Four

Public Law I: O'Reilly v Mackman  71

Before O’Reilly v Mackman  71
O’Reilly v Mackman  72
The case against procedural exclusivity  75
Underlying values and procedural exclusivity  77
Exceptions to procedural exclusivity  78
  Public employment and the exclusivity rule  79
A substantive public-private divide?  80
  Rights protected by public law  84
  Justiciability  85
Public or governmental functions  86
Bodies excluded from judicial review: regulatory bodies in sport and
the substantive public-private divide  88
Conclusions  92

Chapter Five

Public Law 2: Interests, Power and Democracy  94
Public law values  94
  Procedural fairness  95
  Legitimate expectations  99
  Rationality  102
  The Wednesbury test: relevance and irrelevance  103
  Discrimination  104
  Relevance and weight  105
  Rationality – intensity of review  108
  Public law values – summary  110
The interests of the state  110
  Deference to authority  111
  How much autonomy do public bodies enjoy?  112
European influences in English public law  117
  A public-private divide in European law  117
  Vertical and horizontal direct effect  118
  State liability for breach of European law  119
  The grounds for review in European law  120
Summary and conclusions  121

Chapter Six

The Law of Relationships I: The Individual and
the State, and the Employment Relationship  123
The sovereign-subject relationship  124
  Emancipation of the individual from the state  126
Employment  127
  Public law values in employment law  129
  Unfair dismissals  133
  Discrimination  137
  The employer’s prerogatives  137
  From employer prerogatives to responsibility?  140
Comments and comparisons  145
Chapter Seven

The Law of Relationships 2: Family Relationships 147

Marriage 147
Towards the emancipation of married women 149
Property relations 150
Marriage and parenthood 153
Marriage law, power relations and the five values 153
Marriage and employment compared 155
From the security of marriage to emancipation and self-reliance 157
Parents and children 158
Illegitimacy 158
Legitimacy – the father’s prerogatives 159
From paternal prerogatives towards equal parental rights 159
Towards parental responsibilities and children’s rights 161
Parallels in the public and private law of relationships 162
Comments 164

Chapter Eight

Private Law I: Tort, Contract and Equity 167

Tort 167
The integration of public and private law in tort 168
Justiciary issues in tort: implications for the public-private divide 169
Claimants’ interests in tort 171
Value clashes in the law of tort: medical cases 172
Tortious abuse of power by public bodies 175

Contract 177
The orientations of contract law: interests and the control of power 178
Contract and the control of discretion 180
Membership bodies 184
The protection of security and status in contract 185
Some comparisons 186

Fiduciary relationships: trusts 187
General principles 189
Supervisory jurisdiction in trusts: legality and rationality 189
Procedural propriety in trusts 191
Enforcement of the duties of trustees 192
Comparisons with judicial review 192
Company law 194
General principles 195
Comparisons with judicial review 197
Conclusions 199

Chapter Nine

**Private Law 2: Public Policy and the Public-Private Divide** 201

Monopolies and public services 201
Other controls on private power 206
  Restraint of trade, *Nagle v Feilden* and *McInnes v Onslow Fane* 206
  Public policy: general considerations 213
  Public policy and the control of power 215
Duties of consideration in private law 216
  Towards general principles of decision making 217
Remedies in private law 218
  Damages 218
  Injunctions and declarations 220
Conclusion 223

Chapter Ten

**The Human Rights Act, Europe and the Public-Private Divide** 225

The Human Rights Act 1998 – the provisions summarised 225
The rationales for civil and political rights: the values they express 228
  Rationales for the right to privacy 229
  The right to freedom of expression 230
  The courts, rationales for rights, and the Human Rights Act 230
The European Convention on Human Rights and the key values 232
  Article 3: Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment 233
  Article 8: Respect for private and family life, home and correspondence 234
  Article 2 of the First Protocol: A right to education 235
  Teleological values in the European Convention 236
The weight to be attached to the key values 236
The vertical and horizontal effects of the Human Rights Act 237
The Human Rights Act and the public/private divide 238
  Horizontal effects 240
Lessons from Canada 240
Developing the common law: how far can you go? 241
Remedies 242
  State liability and the Human Rights Act 243
European law and the key values 245
Conclusion 246

Chapter Eleven
‘There is no Public-Private Divide’ 248
The case for substantive integration summarised 248
Countervailing considerations 250
  Weighing up the defendant’s interests 250
  Justiciability 251
  Deference to authority 253
  Respect for pluralism 254
Integrating the public and private law of remedies 255
  Damages 256
  The prerogative orders 260
The application for judicial review 262
The case against integrating public and private law 264
Law, politics and the role of the state 265

Chapter 12
Towards Democracy and Citizenship in Public and Private Law 267
Power 267
Values 268
Theories of government and democracy 268
  Citizenship theories 270
And finally ... 273

Annex
A Comparison: The Scottish Approach 275
  The West case 276
  After West: When is a Scots supervisory jurisdiction exercisable in private law? When is the jurisdiction exercisable otherwise than in a petition for judicial review? 278
  Grounds for review in Scotland 283