Judicial Review and the Rights of Private Parties in EC Law

ANGELA WARD

BA (Univ. of QLD) LL B (hons) (ANU), Ph.D. (EUI)
Pupil Barrister, One Pump Court,
Fellow, Magdalene College, Cambridge
Deputy Director, Centre for European Legal Studies, Cambridge

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
# Contents

Table of Cases xv  
Introduction 1  

2 Early Court of Justice Regulation of Member State Remedies and Procedural Rules 17  
  Moves Toward Closer Court of Justice Review 21  
  The Ruling in Factortame No 1 24  
  Conclusion 29  

3 Current Issues in Court of Justice Case Law on Member State Remedies and Procedural Rules 30  
  Interim Relief 31  
  National Time-limits for bringing Proceedings and other Temporal Restrictions on the Enforcement of Community Law 35  
  The Ruling in Emmott and National Time-limits for Bringing Proceedings 36  
  Narrowing the Emmott Rule: Restrictions on Retroactive Effect Involving Payments due to Individuals 38  
  Time-limits and other Restrictions on the Raising of Arguments before Courts 46  
  National Time-limits for bringing Proceedings and the Principle of Effectiveness: The Law as it Stands 55  
  Unjust Enrichment 63  
  The Johnston Right of Access to Judicial Review 70  
  The Duty of Member State Governments to Recover Sums Paid to Individuals in Breach of Community Law 79  
  Damages at National Level 81  
  Francovich: Foundation Principles and Problems 82  
  Member State Liability in Damages for Breach of Directly Effective EC Measures 91  
  Basis of the Court’s Jurisdiction over State Liability 95  
  Relevance of Domestic Rules Minimizing Damages Liability for Acts of the Legislature 96  
  Gravity of Breach and Damages Liability 98  
  Rules Left to National Law 108  
  Relationship Between Contemporary Rules on State Liability and other Case Law on Remedies and Procedures 117  
  Liability of Individuals to Pay Damages for Breach of EC Law 127  
  Summary 128
Other Principles of National Law Infringing the Principle of Effectiveness 131
The ‘No New National Remedies’ Rule 135
The Principle of Non-Discrimination 137

4 Policy Discussion and Conclusions 144

5 The Enforcement of Directives in National Law 158
   Traditional Rationale for the Application of Community Law in National Legal Systems 159
   Contemporary Developments 161
   The Notion of ‘State’ Entities 161
   Constitutional Adjustment to the Public/Private Divide 163
   Breaking New Moulds: the Doctrine of Sympathetic Interpretation 165
   The Ruling in Doni 169
   Further Open Questions 172
   Interpretation of the Meaning of Directives in other Actions Concerning Private Parties inter se 175
   The Right to an Effective Remedy as a General Principle of Law? 179
   Coote and Restrictions on the Improvement of Remedies in Horizontal Situations 183
   Alteration to the Scope of Direct Effect: Signalson and Lemmens 186
   Policy Issues 192
   The Present Regime: Some Key Difficulties 192
   Horizontal Direct Effect: A Logical Prohibition? 197
   Conclusion 200

6 Private Parties and the Article 230 Action for Annulment 202
   The Time-limit for Bringing Proceedings under Article 230(5) 205
   The Schedule for Raising Arguments Before the Community Judicature and the Obligation of Timeous Disposal of Disputes before the Court of First Instance 209
   Locus Standi under Article 230 and Challenge by Private Parties to Regulations and Directives 213
   The Traditional Approach to the Fourth Paragraph of Article 230 213
   Judicial Review of Regulations and Directives: the Law as it Stands 221
   TWD Deggendorf and the Expansion of the Right to be Heard 236
   Stichting Greenpeace and Effective Judicial Review in the Event of Joint National and Community Misconduct 239
## Contents

Access to EC Documents and the Right to Effective Judicial Review 245
Sanctions and Procedural Rules and Article 230(4) Nullity Review 249
Articles 231 and 233 (Articles 174 and 176) 249
Interim Relief 254
Summary and Conclusions 256

7 Article 234 Validity Review 261
Article 234 Validity Mechanism: A Critical Analysis 262
Initiatives which have Favoured the Individual 262
The Powers of National Judges 264
Temporal Effect 269
Efficacy of Substantive Grounds of Review of EC Administrative Law 272
Sanctions and Procedures 279
Conclusion 286

8 Damages Under Article 288(2) 288
The Time-limit for Bringing Proceedings under Article 288(2) and the Scope of the Order Available to Private Parties 289
The Exhaustion of Local Remedies Rule 294
Key Problems and Principles 294
Applying the Exhaustion Rule to Regulations and Directives on Broad Policy Areas 303
Which Authority is Liable—Member State or Community? 307
The Substantive Test 309
Basic Principles 309
Applying the Substantive Test to Regulations and Directives Concerning Broader Policy Areas 311
Pressure for Change: the Distinction between Administrative and Legislative Measures 313
Do Individuals Enjoy Equivalent Standards of Judicial Protection when Claiming Damages against Member States as against Community Institutions? 318
Conclusions 320

9 General Conclusions 323
State Liability 325
Less Certain Areas: Limitation Periods, Unjust Enrichment, and Retroactive Payments 326
The Johnston Right to Effective Judicial Review 327
Contents

The Principle of Non-discrimination—The Dominant Threat to Domestic Autonomy? 328
ECJ Review of National Procedures and Remedies: Questions of Policy 328
The Impact of Directives Enforced by Novel Means 330
ECJ Resistance to Horizontal Direct Effect of Directives 331
Assessment of the Scheme Providing for Judicial Review of Community Measures by Private Parties 332
Judicial Review under Article 230 332
The Article 234 Validity Procedure 336
Damages Liability under Article 288(2) 338
Conclusion 340
Solutions to Enhance Justice 342

Bibliography 345

Index 359