The Copyright Protection of Computer Software in the United Kingdom

DR STANLEY LAI
LLB (Hons) (Leicester), LLM (Cantab), PhD (Cantab)
Barrister-at-Law (Lincoln’s Inn), Advocate and Solicitor (Singapore)
Contents

Acknowledgements xi
Table of Cases xiii
Table of Legislation xxiii
Table of EU Directives xxix
Table of International Instruments xxxi

1. Introduction 1
   I. Aims and Objectives 1
   II. Issues for Investigation 1
   III. Approach 5
   IV. Proposed Infringement Methodology 6
   V. Justification 7
   VI. The Relevance of Competition Law 8
   VII. Method and Plan 9

PART 1: SUBSISTENCE OF COPYRIGHT AND INFRINGEMENT METHODOLOGY

2. Subsistence of Copyright and Infringement Analysis under US and UK Laws 13
   I. Introduction 13
   II. Subsistence of Copyright 13
      (a) Computer Programs as Protectable Works 13
      (b) Originality 15
      (c) Other Prohibited Acts under Section 16 CDPA 19
      (d) Secondary Infringement of Copyright 19
      (e) Moral Rights 20
   III. The Idea/Expression Dichotomy 21
      (a) The Realm of Ideas 21
      (b) Dichotomy under Threat 22
      (c) Basis for Applying the Dichotomy in the United Kingdom 22
   IV. Infringement Methodology: a Prescriptive Analysis of Substantial Similarity 24
      (a) Copyright Infringement of Computer Software: Literal Copying 24
      (b) Copyright Infringement of Computer Software: Non-Literal Copying 26
V. Summary of Trends in US Infringement Methodology 34
   (a) Adoption of the Altai Test by Other Courts 34
   (b) Other Tests of Substantial Similarity 37
   (c) Proper Definition of Abstraction Levels 38
   (d) Observations 39
VI. Conclusion 40

3. Limiting Doctrines of Merger and Scènes à Faire 41
   I. Introduction 41
   II. Merger Doctrine 41
      (a) US Origins 41
      (b) Difficulties in Application 43
      (c) Traces of Merger in the United Kingdom 44
   III. Merger and Software Copyright Protection 46
      (a) The Operation of the Doctrine in the USA 46
      (b) Possibility of Applying Merger in the United Kingdom 48
      (c) Case Against the Application of the Doctrine of Merger 49
      (d) Case for the Application of the Doctrine of Merger 51
IV. The Scènes à Faire Doctrine 52
    (a) The Origin and Development of Scènes à Faire 52
    (b) The Idea/Expression Dichotomy 53
V. The Position of Scènes à Faire in English Law 54
    (a) Historical Accounts and Incidents 55
    (b) Plots, Themes, Characters and Dramatic Ideas 55
    (c) Case for the Direct Application of the Scènes à Faire Doctrine 56
VI. Software Copyright: the Relevance of Scènes à Faire 57
    (a) Material for Exclusion 57
    (b) De Facto Standardisation 59
    (c) Video Games 60
VII. Conclusion 60

PART 2: THE SCOPE OF COPYRIGHT PROTECTION OF USER INTERFACES

4. The Copyright Protection of User Interfaces 65
   I. Introduction 65
      (a) Report of the Australian Copyright Law Review Committee 65
      (b) Definitions 66
   II. Copyright Protection of User Interfaces in the USA: a Survey of Recent Cases and Determination of Protectable Elements 67
      (a) The Early Cases 68
(b) The High-Water Mark for User Interface Protection: *Lotus v Paperback* 68
(c) Contributions of the Ninth Circuit to User Interface Protection 70
(d) A New Dawn 72
(e) Other Courts: Clash of Circuits 75

III. General Conclusions on User Interface Protection in the USA and its Impact on UK Software Copyright Law 77
(a) Ramifications for UK Software Copyright Law: Infringement Analysis 77
(b) *John Richardson v Flanders*: a User Interface Case 78
(c) Two Avenues of Protection 80

IV. Protection of Screen Displays under UK Copyright Law 80
(a) The Protection of Static Displays 80
(b) A Running Sequence of Displays: Protection as Films or Computer-Generated Works under the CDPA 82

V. Policy/Economic Justifications 83
(a) Menell's Economic Analysis 84
(b) Policy and Economic Considerations in *Lotus v Borland* 84

VI. Conclusion 86

5. Copyright Protection of Video Games 87
   I. Introduction 87
   II. Protection of Video Games in the USA 87
   III. Protection of Video Games in the United Kingdom 89
      (a) Play Mode/Attract Mode: Film Protection of Screen Images 89
      (b) Other Products of Execution 90
   IV. Conclusion 91

PART 3: REVERSE ENGINEERING AND DEFENCES

6. Reverse Engineering 95
   I. Introduction 95
      (a) Structure 95
      (b) Reverse Engineering Defined 95
      (c) Implications of the Adaptation Right: Section 21 CDPA 96
   II. The Software Directive and Reverse Engineering 97
      (a) Origins of the Software Directive 97
      (b) Protection of Interfaces 97
      (c) Reverse Engineering Techniques other than Decompilation 98
      (d) Decompilation 99
III. Implementation of the Software Directive in the CDPA 103
   (a) Decompilation under the CDPA 104
   (b) Reverse Engineering Techniques other than Decompilation under the CDPA 106
IV. Reverse Engineering in the USA 106
   (a) Attitude of the US Supreme Court Towards Reverse Engineering Generally 106
   (b) Permissibility of Reverse Engineering under Section 117 USCA 107
   (c) Reverse Engineering and Fair Use: Section 107 USCA 109
V. Reverse Engineering under US and UK Copyright Laws:
   Points of Contrast 115
   (a) Differences Between the Two Regimes 115
   (b) Similarities Between the Two Regimes 118
   (c) Future Compatibility 119
VI. Commonwealth Developments 119
   (a) Australia 119
   (b) Singapore 123
VII. Conclusion 124

7. Defences and Other Permitted Acts 127
   I. Introduction 127
   II. Section 29 CDPA: Fair Dealing for Research and Private Study and its Continued Relevance for UK Software Copyright Law 127
      (a) Section 29(4) CDPA 127
      (b) Continued Relevance of the Fair Dealing Defence 128
      (c) Meaning of “Research and Private Study” 129
      (d) Whether the Dealing is “Fair” in a Reverse Engineering Situation to which Section 29(1) CDPA Applies 132
   III. Back-up Copies 136
   IV. Error Correction and Maintenance 137
      (a) “Error Correction” Defined 137
      (b) Extent of “Lawful Use” 138
      (c) Decompilation for the Purposes of Error Correction 139
   V. Miscellaneous Exceptions: Other Permitted Acts 139
      (a) Section 56 CDPA: Transfers of Licensed Software 139
      (b) Common Law Defence of Non-Derogation of Grant: the Retreat of British Leyland 140
   VI. Conclusion 144
PART 4: CHALLENGES FOR THE FUTURE

8. Software Copyright Protection in Relation to Internet Technology
   I. Introduction 149
   II. Copyright Issues and the WWW: Applicable Provisions of the CDPA 149
      (a) Websites as “Computer Programs” 149
      (b) Websites as Compilation/Database or Computer-Generated Works 150
      (c) Is a Website a Cable Programme Service? 150
      (d) Websites as “Broadcasts”? 152
      (e) The Scourge of WWW Links 153
      (f) Other Observations 153
   III. The Digital Agenda 154
      (a) Temporary Reproduction: Articles 2 and 5 Proposed Directive 155
      (b) Technical Protection Systems and Anti-Circumvention Legislation 156
   IV. Conclusion 159

9. Database Protection in the United Kingdom: the New Deal and its Effects on Software Protection
   I. Introduction 161
   II. Definitional Significance 161
   III. Copyright Protection of Databases 162
   IV. The Future of Computer-Generated Works 163
   V. The New Database Right 164
   VI. Impact of Database Copyright Provisions on Software Copyright Protection 165
      (a) Originality and Substantial Similarity 165
      (b) Computer Programs Contained within Databases 166
      (c) “Databases” Contained within Computer Programs 166
      (d) Computer Programs as Compilations of Sub-Programs 167
   VII. Conclusion 168

10. The Copyright-Contract Interface and Software Protection 169
    I. Introduction 169
    II. Shrink-Wrap Licensing 169
       (a) Users’ Rights Implied by Law 170
       (b) Description of “Shrink-Wrapping” 174
       (c) Shrink-Wraps under English Law 175
       (d) Buyer’s Remedies against the Software Supplier 179


Contents

(e) Shrink-Wrap Licences in the USA: Possible Application? 180

III. Implied Licences and Users’ Rights in Software Transactions 184
   (a) Implied Licences: General Principles 184
   (b) Implied Licences and Patent Law: Betts v Willmott 185
   (c) Implied Licences and Copyright Law 187
   (d) Further Extensions of the Betts v Willmott Principle 190
   (e) Shareware and Implied Licences 194

IV. Conclusion 194

11. General Conclusion 197
   I. Application of UK Copyright to the WWW 198
   II. The Digital Agenda 198
   III. UK Database Legislation 199
   IV. The Interface between Contract and Copyright 199

APPENDIX: TECHNICAL BACKGROUND

Appendix. Technical Background: Software Design, Functionality, Reverse Engineering and Internet Issues 203
   I. The Software Designing Process: an Overview 203
   II. How a Computer Functions 205
   III. Reverse Engineering Processes: a Technical Background 218
   IV. The “Clean Room” Procedure 231
   V. Technical Issues and the WWW 232

Index 239