ESSAYS ON THE NATURE OF INTERNATIONAL TRADE LAW

Robert E. Hudec
## I. THE NATURE OF INTERNATIONAL TRADE LAW

### 1. THE GATT LEGAL SYSTEM: A DIPLOMAT'S JURISPRUDENCE 17

#### I. The Negotiation History 18
   **A. The Trade Agreements Background** 18
   **B. The ITO Negotiations** 21
      1. The main currents 22
      2. The ITO's substantive obligations 23
      3. The ITO's enforcement procedures: the basic design 24
      4. The mechanics of the enforcement procedure 27
      5. Requests and recommendations 31
      6. Reviews of the ITO's jurisprudence 33
   **C. The GATT Negotiations** 35
      1. The purpose and design of the General Agreement 36
      2. GATT's disputes procedure 38
      3. ITO's ambiguity magnified in the GATT 41

#### II. The Belgian Family Allowances Case 41
   **A. The Dispute** 42
      1. The dispute before the GATT 44
      2. The dispute under discussion 46
      3. Hardening of the Belgian position 48
   **B. The Panel Proceedings** 50
      1. The legal implications of the case 51
      2. The Panel report 54
   **C. The Meaning of the Panel Report** 58
      1. The minimum interpretation 59
      2. The breach of legal obligations 60
      3. The precise violation 62
      4. The Panel report in perspective 65
   **D. The Follow-up: Interpretation and Enforcement** 68
      1. A final view of the Panel decision 74
   **E. A Summary** 75
2. GATT OR GABB? THE FUTURE DESIGN OF THE GENERAL AGREEMENT ON TARIFFS AND TRADE

I. The Current Debate .......................................................... 80
II. The Function of Substantive Rules ...................................... 88
   A. The Draftsmen's Objectives ......................................... 89
   B. The Role of Substantive Rules in National Decision-Making .... 94
      1. The United States Executive .................................... 94
      2. The United States Congress .................................... 104
   C. The Role of Substantive Rules in GATT Procedures .......... 107

3. "TRANSCENDING THE OSTENSIBLE": SOME REFLECTIONS ON THE NATURE OF LITIGATION BETWEEN GOVERNMENTS 117

4. THE ROLE OF JUDICIAL REVIEW IN PRESERVING LIBERAL FOREIGN TRADE POLICIES 133

I. Tumlir's Critique: Protectionism as a Constitutional Failure .... 133
II. What can Courts do to Improve the Process? ....................... 139
   A. The Substantive Function: A Question of Coherence .......... 140
   B. The Procedural Function: Delegation Revisited ............... 147

5. THINKING ABOUT THE NEW SECTION 301: BEYOND GOOD AND EVIL 153

I. What is the New Section 301, and How does it Violate GATT? .... 158
   A. GATT-Based Retaliation: Regular 301 .......................... 159
   B. Retaliation against "Unreasonable" Practices: Super 301 and Special 301 ......................................................... 164
II. The Case for Justified Disobedience .................................. 167
   A. The Wheat Flour Subsidy Case .................................... 169
   B. The Conditional MFN Policy ..................................... 170
   C. The "New Issues" Problem ....................................... 172
III. Objections to the Case for Justified Disobedience ................. 173
IV. Some Possible Guidelines for Justified Disobedience .............. 179
   A. Structural Guidelines ............................................. 179
   B. Substantive Guidelines .......................................... 180
V. Applying the Guidelines to the New Section 301 .................... 182
   A. GATT-based Retaliation: Regular 301 .......................... 183
   B. Retaliation against "Unreasonable" Measures: Super 301 and Special 301 ......................................................... 188
II. CONCEPTS OF FAIRNESS IN INTERNATIONAL TRADE LAW

8. MIRROR, MIRROR ON THE WALL: THE CONCEPT OF FAIRNESS IN US FOREIGN TRADE POLICY

I. Introduction..................................................................................................................227
II. Two Preliminary Observations..................................................................................229
   A. The Queen’s Mirror.................................................................................................229
   B. Does Fairness Really Matter?..................................................................................230
III. Offensive Unfairness..................................................................................................233
   A. A Functional Perspective on Offensive Unfairness..............................................232
   B. The Substantive Content of Offensive Unfairness Claims.................................233
      1. Offensive unfairness claims in US domestic markets..................................233
      2. Offensive unfairness claims against foreign trade.........................................234
   C. Containing Offensive Unfairness Claims..............................................................343
IV. Defensive Unfairness..................................................................................................245
   A. A Functional Perspective on Defensive Unfairness..............................................245
   B. Dealing with Defensive Unfairness Claims..........................................................249

9. DIFFERENCES IN NATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS: THE LEVEL PLAYING FIELD DIMENSION

I. Recent Legislative Proposals.........................................................................................253
II. The Environmental Case for a Level Playing Field..................................................255
III. The Concept of Fairness in International Trade........................................................257
   A. Fair Competition in US Economic Policy.........................................................258
   B. “Fair Competition” Applied to Foreign Trade....................................................259
   C. Limiting the Reach of Fairness Concepts............................................................263
IV. Fairness Concepts in Action: Can Low Environmental Standards be Treated as “Subsidies” or “Dumping”?.................................................................264
III. CONCEPTS OF DISCRIMINATION IN INTERNATIONAL TRADE LAW

10. TIGER TIGER, IN THE HOUSE: A CRITICAL APPRAISAL OF THE CASE AGAINST DISCRIMINATORY TRADE MEASURES 281

Introduction ................................................. 281

I. The Economic Consequences of Discrimination .................................. 284
A. Discriminatory Tariffs .............................................. 285
   1. The basic case for efficiency loss .................................... 285
   2. The special case of preferences granted to developing countries ....... 288
   3. The special case of temporary protective measures ................. 289
   4. GATT legal rules: discrimination and reciprocity .................... 290
   5. An overview ...................................................... 291
B. Discriminatory Quantitative Restrictions ................................... 292
   1. What is a discriminatory QR? ..................................... 293
   2. The case for an efficiency loss .................................... 297
   3. The Article XIV exception ........................................ 299
   4. Selective safeguards as an instrument of liberalization ............ 301
   5. An overview ...................................................... 305
II. The Political Consequences of Discrimination .................................. 305
A. The Lessons of the Pre-war Era Applied to GATT .......................... 306
   1. The importance of MFN in tariff bargaining ....................... 306
   2. Conditional-MFN and trade liberalization .......................... 308
   3. Differences in the type of discrimination ......................... 311
   4. Differences in the players ....................................... 313
   5. Political irritation .............................................. 314
   6. An overview ...................................................... 315
B. The Lessons of the GATT Era ........................................... 316