SOURCEBOOK ON MEDICAL LAW

Marc Stauch MA (Oxon),
Solicitor, Senior Lecturer in Law

and

Kay Wheat BA,
Solicitor, Senior Lecturer in Law

with

John Tingle BA, M Ed,
Barrister, Reader in Health Care Law

all at
The Nottingham Trent University
CONTENTS

Preface v
Table of cases xxxv
Table of legislation xlvii
Table of abbreviations xlvii

PART ONE

1 ETHICS AND MEDICINE 1

INTRODUCTION TO ETHICS 1
  Why study ethics? 1
  Consequences v deontological absolutes 5
    Consequentialism 5
    Absolutism/deontology 8
  Rights, duties and liberties 13
  Respect for persons 16
  Justice 18
  Relativism and feminist ethics 18

THE DOCTOR-PATIENT RELATIONSHIP 20
  Beneficence 20
  Non-maleficence 27
  The nature of illness 28

THE CASE FOR PATERNALISM 30
  Introduction 30
  What is paternalism? 31
    Strong and weak paternalism 33
  Paternalism and the sanctity of life principle 36
  Paternalism and the doctor's duty of beneficence 37
  Paternalism and a duty to oneself? 37

THE CASE FOR PATIENT AUTONOMY 38
  Autonomy 38
  The right to self-determination 40
  The political approach and the rejection of 'social control' 40
  Utilitarianism and autonomy 41
  Rationality 41
  Autonomy and beneficence 42

PATERNALISM V AUTONOMY - A FALSE DICHOTOMY? 42
  Collaborative decision making 42
  A fiduciary relationship 44

JUSTICE IN THE ALLOCATION OF HEALTH RESOURCES 45
2  HEALTH CARE IN ENGLAND AND WALES  57

BACKGROUND  57
    The international framework  57
    National provisions  57
        The National Health Service Act 1977  58

STRUCTURE OF HEALTH CARE IN THE UK  61
    The internal market  62
    Beyond the internal market  70
    The private sector  71

REGULATING THE QUALITY OF HEALTH CARE  72
    'Macro' decision making: the role of the NHS Executive  72
    Regional level – the role of Community Health Councils  74
    Complaints and discipline  77
        The complaints system  77
        Discipline  80
        Role of (criminal) law  83

ACCESS TO HEALTH CARE  86
    Background – scarcity of NHS resources  86
    Disputes over obtaining treatment  88
        Judicial review  89
        Breach of statutory duty  101
        Negligence and health resources  102
    Compulsory treatment and care  102

3  CONSENT TO TREATMENT  103

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS  103
    Autonomy  103
    Paternalism  104

THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK  105
    Introduction  105
        Battery  105
        Countervailing interests that justify non-consensual treatment?  106
        Maim and statutory criminal offences  111
        Express and implied consent  112

THE ELEMENTS TO A VALID CONSENT  115
    Introduction  115
    Capacity to consent  115
    Assessing capacity  119
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-therapeutic sterilisations</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sterilisation to manage menstruation – therapeutic or non-therapeutic?</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abortion</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5 CONFIDENTIALITY AND ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS</strong></td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONFIDENTIALITY – THE DUTY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ethical obligation</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The General Medical Council’s guidance</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The legal obligation</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying the nature of the obligation</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The elements of an action for breach of confidence</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The confidential information</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The circumstances in which the information is acquired</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statutory obligations of confidence</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incompetent patients and confidentiality</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incompetent adults</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONFIDENTIALITY – BREACHING CONFIDENCES</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consent</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public interest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure to maintain the freedom of the press</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure to prevent crime</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure to prevent civil wrongs</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure for the public good</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure for the protection of third parties</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidentiality and HIV and AIDS</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The administration of justice</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure in the interests of national security</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical research</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exchange of information amongst health care workers</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breaches of confidence justified by statute law</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Might there be a common law duty to disclose?</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To whom should disclosure be made and what should be the extent of that disclosure?</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONFIDENTIALITY – REMEDIES</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detriment</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Damages</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Injunctions</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The dead</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

### ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS
  - ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS 262

### ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS – THE LAW 263
  - Statutory provisions 263
    - Access to Health Records Act 1990 263
    - Data Protection Act 1984 266
    - Access to Medical Reports Act 1988 267
  - Common law 268
  - Supreme Court Act 1981 273

### 6 MEDICAL MALPRACTICE 275

#### INTRODUCTION 275

#### THE DUTY OF CARE 276
  - The duty to the patient 276
  - The duty to third parties 279
  - Who to sue? 282
  - Liability of the Department of Health 284

#### THE BREACH OF DUTY 285
  - The standard of care 285
    - The ordinary professional 285
    - Junior doctors 286
    - Emergencies 288
  - Accepted practice – the *Bolam* test 289
    - Development and rationale 289
    - Application and scope 295
    - Impugning accepted practice – ‘new *Bolam*’ 297
    - Departures from approved practice 303
  - Proving the breach 307

#### CAUSATION 309
  - A framework for analysis 309
  - Evidential uncertainties 312
  - Medical negligence cases 312
  - Claims for loss of chance 315
  - Human agency in the causal chain 320
    - Non-disclosure cases 320
    - Failure to attend 322
    - Remoteness of damage 325

#### DAMAGES 325
  - Principles governing awards 325
    - Damages for non-pecuniary loss 326
Sourcebook on Medical Law

- Damages for pecuniary loss 327
- Limitation of actions 330
- Defences 332
  - Contributory negligence 332
  - *Volenti non fit injuria* 332
  - Necessity 332
- Liability for defective medicines 332

**REFORMING THE LAW**
- Problems with the medical litigation system 337
- Moving to a 'no fault' system? 342

**PART TWO**

7 **ASSISTED REPRODUCTION** 347

**INTRODUCTION** 347
- The key interests at stake 348
  - Potential parents 348
  - Gamete providers/surrogates 349
  - Potential children 349
  - Embryos 350
- The response of the law 350
- The Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act Scheme 351

**IN VITRO FERTILISATION** 354
- Background 354
- The potential parents 355
  - Access to treatment 355
  - Protection through counselling and informed consent 358
  - Control over the use/disposition of embryos/gametes 359
- The embryo 362
  - What is its status? 362
  - The storage of embryos and gametes 364
  - Embryo research 366
- Concerns over future developments 371

**COLLABORATIVE REPRODUCTION** 374
- Background 374
- The potential rearing parent(s) 378
  - Access to treatment 378
  - Counselling requirements 379
  - Legal status vis à vis child 379
- The gamete providers 381
Recruitment and screening issues 382
Status vis-à-vis resulting children 384
The child 387

SURROGACY 390
Background 390
Ethical considerations 391
The response of the law 393
Entering into the surrogacy arrangement 395
Resolving surrogacy arrangements 396

8 PREGNANCY AND ABORTION 405
INTRODUCTION 405
The morality of abortion 406
Abortion and legislation 415
THE LEGAL POSITION 416
Criminal law provisions 416
Defences to abortion prior to 1967 418
The effect of the Abortion Act 1967 as originally enacted 420
The Abortion Act 1967 as amended 422
IMPLICATIONS OF THE LAW 429
The interested parties 429
The foetus 429
The pregnant woman 434
The father 436
The doctor/health care worker 437
Forms of termination raising special issues 444
Pre-implantation terminations 444
Selective reduction 445
Drug-induced abortions 447
Late abortion and the living abortus 450
PRE-NATAL HARM BEYOND THE ABORTION CONTEXT 451
General principles 451
Harm caused by the child’s mother 454
Refusals of obstetric intervention 456

9 MENTAL HEALTH LAW 467
BACKGROUND 467
Introduction 467
What is mental illness? 467
Justifying detention 473
Statutory control 477
History 477
Current scheme under the Mental Health Act 1983 479

DETENTION 480
Mental disorder 480
Mental impairment 480
Psychopathic disorder 481
Treatability 482
Key parties involved 486
Approved social worker 486
Nearest relative 488
Doctors 490
The categories of admission 491
Admission for assessment – s 2 491
Admission for treatment – s 3 492
Admission for assessment in emergencies – s 4 493
Guardianship – s 7 495
The detention of in-patients – s 5 496
Informal admission – s 131 498
Miscellaneous powers 498
The criminally insane 498

TREATMENT 499
Consent to treatment 499
Treatment not needing the patient’s consent 499
Exceptional treatment not covered by s 63 503
Section 57 – consent and a second opinion 503
Section 58 – consent or a second opinion 504
Is it right to give any form of treatment without consent? 508
Is competence treated differently when the patient is suffering from a mental disorder? 509
Options for reform 510

SAFEGUARDING THE PATIENT 511
The Mental Health Act Commission 511
Challenging detention 512
Discharge of the patient under s 23 512
Mental Health Review Tribunals 512
Habeas corpus 513
Judicial review 515
A right to treatment for mental disorder? 516
Liability towards patients 519
Criminal liability 519
Civil liability 519
Sourcebook on Medical Law

Ethical considerations 577
The legal position at common law 579
Statutory limitations –
the Human Organ Transplants Act 1989 590
The dead donor 595
The position at common law 596
The statutory position – the Human Tissue Act 1961 601
Other sources of organs/tissue 605
Foetal tissue transplants 605
Xenotransplantation 609
Mechanical organs 611

THE STATUS OF EXTRACTED MATERIAL 612
Rights in the whole body 612
Rights in body parts 615
Intellectual property rights 618

IMPLANTATION OF MATERIAL 620
The interests of the would-be donee 620
The rights of the actual donee 620
Against the surgeon 620
Against the procurement agency 621
Against the donor 623

REFORMING THE LAW 624
Addressing the shortfall in cadaveric organs 625
Elective ventilation – clarifying the law 629
Creating a market in organs 630

12 EUTHANASIA 635
INTRODUCTION 635
What is euthanasia? 635
The value of human life 635
‘Sanctity of life’ and ‘vitalism’ 638
Quality of life 642
The qualified sanctity of life principle 644
The acts/omissions distinction 645
Euthanasia and the State 649

ACTIVE EUTHANASIA 650
Background 650
Medicines which shorten life 652
Assisted suicide 655
Contents

PASSIVE EUTHANASIA 658
  Background 658
  Competent patients 660
    Refusals of medical treatment 660
    Advance directives 663
  Incompetent patients 668
    General 668
    Best interests 674
    Permanently insensate patients 679
    The implications of Bland 682
    Developments since Bland 689

REFORMING THE LAW 692

Index 697