Silence, Confessions and Improperly Obtained Evidence

PETER MIRFIELD

CLARENDON PRESS • OXFORD
1997
Contents

1. Introduction
   Scope of the Book 1
   The Issues 1
   Broader Considerations 4

2. The Principles Behind Exclusion 6
   Introduction 6
   The Reliability Principle 7
      Confessions, Unlawfully or Unfairly Obtained Evidence, Silence—and Reliability 7
      Reliability Principle as Paramount or Exclusive? 9
   Source of Unreliability 10
   Three Modes of Responding to Unreliability 12
   The Nemo Debet Principle 13
      Nemo Debet, the Right to Silence, and the Privilege Against Self-incrimination 14
   The Content of the Nemo Debet Principle 16
   The Validity or Value of the Nemo Debet Principle 17
   The Protective Principle 18
   The Disciplinary Principle 19
      The Nature of the Disciplinary Principle 19
      Predicting Disciplinary Efficacy of Exclusion 21
      The Wrong Vehicle or Wrong Place for Discipline? 22
   The Judicial Integrity Principle 23
      The Principle or Principles Stated 23
      Judicial Integrity in English Law 25
   Testing the Principles 28
      Cogency of Evidence 28
      Heinousness of Breach 29
      Seriousness of the Offence 31

3. Procedural Issues and Exclusion 34
   The Developed Common Law Position 34
      Confession Evidence—Arguments about Admissibility 34
      Confession Evidence—Arguments about Discretion 37
   Non-confession Evidence 38
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reconsidering Exclusion Issues</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Police and Criminal Evidence Act 1984</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exclusion under Section 76</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exclusion under Section 78</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconsideration and Deferral of Exclusion Issues</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sections 76 and 78 Relied Upon in the Alternative</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exclusion under Section 82(3)</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Judicial Power under Section 76(3)</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burden and Standard of Proof</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Exclusionary Rule for Confessions</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Exclusionary Discretion</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Confessions—Preliminary Issues</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functions of Judge and Jury</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Meaning of ‘Confession’</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judicial Confessions</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admissions Falling Short of Full Confessions</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements on their Face Exculpatory</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement Showing Mode of Speech, Writing, or Expression</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Mixed’ Statements</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confessions of Third Parties</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confessions of Non-accused Third Parties</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confessions of Co-accused Exculpating the Accused</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confessions of Co-accused Inculpating the Accused</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning the Accused on the Voir Dire</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidential Use of the Accused’s Statements on the Voir Dire</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Confessions—The Exclusionary Rule</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Common Law Rule</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Statutory Rule</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oppression</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Definition Given in Fulling</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Elements of Oppression</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A High Level Concept</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fact and Degree of Unlawfulness or Impropriety</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis upon the Physical and Temporal Circumstances</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Characteristics of the Suspect</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torture, etc.</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unreliability</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anything Said or Done</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

Relevance of Police Impropriety 91
The Circumstances Existing at the Time 93
Likely to Render Unreliable 95
Any Confession Which Might be Made by Him 99
Causation 101
Subsequent Confessions 105

6. Discretionary Exclusion of Confessions and Other Evidence—General Principles 109
The Common Law Discretion 109
The Rule of Admissibility 109
The Discretion before Sang 111
The Effect of Sang 114
The Effect of the 1984 Act 120
The Discretion under Section 78(1) of the 1984 Act 120
Juridical Nature of Discretionary Exclusion 122
The Categories of Unfairness 125
The Theory of Section 78 Unfairness 131
The Unreliability Discretion 131
The Unfairness Discretion 133
Inequality of Access to Evidence 133
Breach of Promise as to Use 135
Judicial Fiat 137
The Decision in Keenan 138
No Recourse to Disciplining the Police 139
Deliberate and Bad Faith Breaches 140
Fairness to Both Sides 141
Wider than Sang 143
Causation 144
Subsequent Confessions 146
Cases Where the Questioning Code (Code C) is Inapplicable 148
Abuse of the Process of the Court 151

7. Discretionary Exclusion of Confessions and Other Evidence—Specific Cases 155
The Accuracy of the Record 155
Breaches of the Questioning Code 156
Meaning of ‘Interview’ 157
The Discretion in Cases of Interview Breach 162
Tape-recording 165
Admission of the Taped Record Itself 166
Contents

Admission of the Transcript with the Taped Record 167
Admission of the Transcript Alone 168
Admission of a Précis or Summary 170
Ancillary Matters 171
Other Elements of the Formal Record 173
Defects of the Formal Record 174
The Completeness of the Record 174
The Accuracy of Prepared Summaries 176

The Code C Rights 177
Right to Legal Advice 178
Varieties of Breach 178
Significant and Substantial Breaches 180
Culpability and Bad Faith 180
Causation 181
Breath Test Cases 182
Adequacy of Legal Advice 183
Right Not to be Held Incommunicado 184
Other Rights 186
The Right to be Cautioned 186
The Right Not to be Detained Unlawfully 187

Identification Procedures 189
Failure to Carry Out an Identification Procedure 189
The Hierarchy of Procedures 189
The Relevance of a Dispute about Identification 190
Effects of Breach 191
Impracticability 193
Contamination of Identification Procedures 194
Deliberate and Flagrant Breaches: Bad Faith 195
Significance of the Suspect’s Consent 196
Exclusion where Code D is Inapplicable 197

Trickery and Entrapment 199
Some Terminology 199
Agents Provocateurs, Entrapment, and Section 78(1) 201
Unfair Gathering of Evidence 205
Kinds of Evidence 205
The Grounds for Exclusion: Express Deception 206
The Grounds for Exclusion: Implied Deception 207

Unlawful Searches and Trespass 209
Unlawful Searches of the Person or Property 209
Unlawful Surveillance 211
Factors Relevant to the Exercise of the Discretion 212

8. Confessions: Ancillary Issues Under the Exclusionary Rule and Discretion 214

Involuntary Signature 214

No 'Person in Authority' Requirement 215

Use of Excluded Confessions other than by the Prosecution as Part of Its Case 217

Evidence Yielded by Inadmissible Confessions 221
  Mode of Speech, Writing, or Expression 221
  Facts Discovered in Consequence of the Confession 222

9. Compelled Self-incrimination and Incriminating Silence 226

General Introduction 226

Compulsory Examination of Suspects and Others 228
  The Substantive Provisions 228
  Their Evidential Effects 229
  Non-application of the Ordinary Laws of Criminal Investigation 231
  Exclusion Under the Evidential Provisions of the 1984 Act 233

Compulsory Acquisitions of Non-confessional Evidence 235
  Preliminary Remarks 235
  Documents Ancillary to Compulsory Examination 235
  Non-confessional Evidence Otherwise Acquired Compulsorily 236

Silence and Refusal as Incriminating Evidence: Introduction 238

Evidential Effects of Pre-trial 'Silence' 239
  The Four Kinds of Evidential Significance 239
  The Common Law Position (Other than on Implied Admissions) 240
  The 'Right to Silence' Debate 242
  The Statutory Law on Pre-trial Silence 246
  Silence at Trial (Section 35) 247
    Pre-trial Silence—the Essential Elements (Section 34) 248
      Caution Requirement 249
      Silence 249
      Defence Facts 252
      Reasonable Expectation 253
      Proper Inferences 258
    Pre-Trial Silence—Procedures (Section 34) 260
      The Division of Responsibility 261
      The Procedure for Decision-making 261
  Other Adverse Inferences from Pre-trial Silence
Contents

(Sections 36 and 37) 262
Features Common to Both Sections 262
Features Distinguishing the Two Sections 264
Evidential Use of Adverse Inferences 266
Elements Common to Sections 34, 36, and 37 267
Exclusion of Unfair Evidence of Silence 269
The Common Law Relating to Implied Admissions 270
Evidential Effects of Pre-trial Refusal to Provide Items 272
Evidential Effect of Pre-trial Non-disclosure or Defective Disclosure 274
Introduction 274
The Elements of the New Disclosure Regime 275
Adverse Inferences from Faults in Disclosure 276

10. Vulnerable Suspects 281

Introduction 281
Vulnerability and Section 76(2)(b) 283
Vulnerability and Section 78 284
Vulnerability and ‘the Appropriate Adult’ 284
Failure to Comply with Paragraph 11.14 284
Meaning of ‘the Appropriate Adult’ 288
The Purpose of Presence of ‘the Appropriate Adult’ 291
Use of ‘the Appropriate Adult’ 292
Withdrawing the Case from the Jury 295
Section 77 Warnings 296
The Admissibility of Evidence to Establish Mental Disorder or Handicap 299

11. The Relevance of the European Convention on Human Rights 303

Introduction 303
The Effect in English Law of Convention Provisions 304
Compelled Self-incrimination and Adverse Inferences from Silence 306
Compelled Self-incrimination 307
The Decision in Saunders v. United Kingdom 307
The Impact of Saunders v. United Kingdom upon English Law 308
Adverse Inferences from Silence 309
The Decision in Murray v. United Kingdom 309
The Impact of Murray upon English Law 311
‘Solely or Mainly’ 311
The Caution 312
The Role of the Judge 312
Contents  

Legal Advice 314  
Evidential Use of Silence 314  
Relevance to the Exercise of the Section 78(1) Discretion 315  
The Decision in *Khan* 315  
Convention Breach and the Section 78(1) Discretion 316  
The European Union Dimension 317  

12. Alternative Approaches 319  
Introduction 319  
Exclusionary Rules in the United States 319  
The *Mapp* Rule 320  
The Governing Principle(s)? 320  
Absence of Balancing—and its Attendant Problems 321  
Limiting the Impact of *Mapp*—the Good Faith Exception 322  
The *Miranda* Rule 324  
Confessions at Common Law 324  
The Decision in *Miranda* Itself 325  
The Retreat from *Miranda* 327  
Person in Custody 327  
Interrogation 328  
Warning of Rights 329  
Scrupulous Honour 330  
Waiver 331  
Re-assertion 333  
Impeachment 333  
Public Safety 335  
Conclusion 336  
The Fruit of the Poisonous Tree 336  
The Basic Doctrine 336  
Exceptions and Non-exceptions 337  
The Special Rule for Primary Evidence Obtained in Breach of *Miranda* 338  
Exclusion for Unfairness in Scotland 339  
Introduction 339  
The Decision in *Chalmers* 340  
Developments since *Chalmers* 342  
Supporting Evidence or Warning Requirements for Confessions 345  
Introduction 345  
Supporting Evidence in Australia 347  
Corroboration in Scotland 348  
Recommendations of the Royal Commission 350  
Exclusion for Unfairness or to Defend Judicial Integrity 352
Contents

Scotland
   The Rule in Lawrie v. Muir 353
   The Principle Behind the Rule 354
   Guidelines 355

Ireland
   The Exclusionary Rule for Evidence Obtained in Breach of the Constitution 355
   Scope of the Exclusionary Rule 356
   The Principle Behind the Rule 357
   The Inclusionary Exception 357

Australia
   Development of the Bunning v. Cross Discretion 358
   The Principle Behind the Discretion 360
   Scope of the Discretion 360
   Presumptions and Onuses 362
   Factors or Matters Governing the Discretion 363

Canada
   Exclusion to Prevent Judicial Disrepute 365
   Exclusion by Rule or by Discretion? 366
   Causation 367
   The Test of Judicial Disrepute 368