Law and Uncertainty
Risks and Legal Processes

Edited by
Robert Baldwin

with the assistance of
Peter Cane
Contents

Acknowledgements xi
List of contributors xii

1 Introduction – Risk: The Legal Contribution 1
Robert Baldwin

1.1 Risk studies: five core concerns 1
  1.1.1 Defining risk 1
  1.1.2 Types of risk 2
  1.1.3 The perception and assessment of risks 3
  1.1.4 Risks, information and democratic processes 10
  1.1.5 Managing risks 11

1.2 The legal contribution 14
  1.2.1 Assessing risks 15
  1.2.2 Tort law and risks 15
  1.2.3 Statutory design and risks 15
  1.2.4 Regulatory responses to risk 16
  1.2.5 Using the law in risk management 17
  1.2.6 Courts, judges and uncertainty 17

1.3 Conclusions 18

Part I  Assessing Risks

2 Prediction Scores for Risk Assessment 21
David Wright and John Copas

2.1 Statistical methodology for risk scores 22
  2.1.1 Point scoring 23
  2.1.2 Logistic regression 25

2.2 Two examples of reconviction scores 26
  2.2.1 A risk score for probation 26
  2.2.2 A risk score for parole 27

2.3 Risk scores: some practical issues 31
  2.3.1 Choice of risk factors 32
  2.3.2 Interpretation of risk scores 33
  2.3.3 The use of risk scores 34

2.4 Comparison of risk scores 35

2.5 Conclusion 38
3 Some Ergonomic Challenges for Fault-Based Compensation Systems
Julian Killingley
3.1 The cognitive mechanisms of automaticity and vigilance
3.1.1 Automaticity
3.1.2 Vigilance
3.2 Automaticity, vigilance and deterrence
3.3 Risk compensation and risk homeostasis theory
3.4 Conclusions

Part II Tort Law and Risks

4 The Control of Corporate Conduct and Reduction of Uncertainty by Tort Law
Gert Brüggemeier
4.1 Instrumental concept of tort law
4.2 Wrongs and risks – negligence and strict liability
4.3 The new challenge of the ‘risk society’: reduction of uncertainty
4.4 The four answers of tort law
4.4.1 Enterprise liability
4.4.2 Collective liability of enterprises
4.4.3 Directors' and officers' liability
4.4.4 Shareholders' proportionate liability
4.5 Conclusion

Part III Statutory Design and Risks

5 Parenthood at Risk
Catherine Kratz
5.1 Artificial procreation in the light of social function and objectives of the law
5.2 Risk in artificial procreation
5.2.1 Technology as a tool to reduce uncertainty
5.3 Law and the danger of technological control
5.3.1 How should we understand this notion of a social environment?
5.3.2 Risk as a normalization of uncertainty
5.4 Neutralization of the legal danger of artificial procreation: the construction of a legal risk
5.5 Law and the danger of surrogacy arrangements
5.6 Suggestions for a better communication of risk
6 Limiting the Rise of Limited Liability
Andrew Hicks
6.1 Introduction 95
6.2 Historical background 96
6.3 How important is limited liability? 102
6.4 The transfer of risk to creditors 104
6.5 The uses and abuse of limited companies 107
6.6 Incentives and disincentives 111
6.7 Insurance 113
6.8 A new ‘business corporation’? 115
6.9 Conclusions 119

7 The Entrepreneur, Business Failures and Corporate Law Ideology
Joseph Savirimuthu
7.1 The politics of corporate risk culture: a historical perspective 122
7.2 Redefining corporate ideology 126
7.2.1 Effective management 127
7.2.2 Corporate financial distress 129
7.3 Risk management or crisis management? 131
7.4 Conclusion 134

Part IV Regulatory Responses to Risks

8 Risk Management and ‘Rational’ Social Regulation
Anthony Ogus
8.1 Institutional framework for risk management 140
8.1.1 Judicial interpretation of general standards 140
8.1.2 Bureaucratic formulation of regulatory specific standards 141
8.2 Risk management and the economic concept of optimal care 143
8.3 Limitations of the economic model of optimal care 144
8.4 Differences between lay and expert perception of risk 145
8.5 ‘Rational’ risk management and lay perceptions of risk 147
8.5.1 ‘Rationality’ and social preferences 147
8.5.2 Extending the traditional parameters of cost–benefit analysis 149
8.5.3 Adjustments to the institutional arrangements 150
8.6 Conclusions 152

9 Derivative financial instruments, risk, regulation and investor protection
Joanna Gray and Elspeth Fennell
9.1 Derivative financial instruments 156
9.1.1 Futures contracts 156
Contents

12 Whose Risk is it Anyway? Allocation of Entrepreneurial Risk in Employment Contracts
Paul Skidmore

12.1 Prologue
12.2 Risk
12.2.1 Planned risk
12.2.2 Unplanned risk
12.3 Risk in the case law of employment
12.3.1 Private allocation of risk – will it be enforced?
12.3.2 Default rules in employment – how does the common law allocate risk?
12.4 Law and economics theory – some questionable assumptions
12.4.1 Bargaining the risk allocation – distributional considerations
12.4.2 Timing of risk allocation
12.5 Where next? Relational contracting?
12.6 Epilogue

13 Long-tail Liabilities and Claims Management in the NHS
Paul Fenn and Ron Hodges

13.1 A brief history of claims management in the UK
13.1.1 Claims management prior to NHS indemnity
13.1.2 Claims management after NHS indemnity
13.1.3 Claims management under the CNST
13.2 Evidence relating to claims management decisions in the NHS
13.3 Evidence relating to accounting provisions in the NHS
13.4 Conclusion

14 A Risk Management Approach to Legal Decision-Making about 'Dangerous' People
David Carson

14.1 Predicting dangerousness
14.2 Risk-taking decisions
14.3 Risk management
14.4 Conclusions

Part VI Courts, Judges and Uncertainty

15 Radiological Risk and Civil Liability: A Review of Recent Developments in the United Kingdom
Christopher E. Miller

15.1 Merlin v. British Nuclear Fuels plc
15.2 Reay v. British Nuclear Fuels plc; Hope v. British Nuclear Fuels plc 278
  15.2.1 Statutory background 278
  15.2.2 Scientific versus legal standards of proof 280
  15.2.3 The Gardner and Kinlen hypotheses 281
  15.2.4 The Bradford–Hill criteria 283
15.3 Conclusions 288

16 The Risks of Quantifying Justice: The Use of the Substantial Evidence Test in Judicial Review of OSHA Rule-Making 293
Elizabeth C. Fisher
  16.1 Regulating risk: defining the problem 294
  16.2 OSHA and judicial review 297
    16.2.1 The substantial evidence test 297
    16.2.2 Judicial review 299
    16.2.3 The Benzene decision and its aftermath 300
    16.2.4 The Air Contaminants case 303
  16.3 Reorienting: two paths to reform 306
    16.3.1 The pragmatic approach 306
    16.3.2 The idealistic approach 308
  16.4 Conclusion 311

17 Vulnerable Providers of Security, Independent Legal Advice and Moral Hazard: Risk Management Considerations in Non-Commercial Third Party Secured Transactions after 313
Robin Mackenzie
  17.1 As above, so below: macro-and microeconomic banking regulation and moral hazard 314
  17.2 The legal background to non-commercial third party secured transactions 319
  17.3 Containing moral hazard and maintaining commercial liability 328
  17.4 Conclusion 332

Selected Bibliography 333
Index 341