INTERNATIONAL MANAGEMENT OF HAZARDOUS WASTES

The Basel Convention and Related Legal Rules

KATHARINA KUMMER

CLARENDON PRESS • OXFORD
1995
Contents

Abbreviations xix
Foreword xxiii
Table of Cases xxv
Table of Legal Instruments of the EU and the OECD xxvii
Table of Treaties and other International Legal Instruments xxxvi
Introduction 1

I. Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes in International Law 4

TRANSBOUNDARY MOVEMENTS OF HAZARDOUS WASTES: QUANTITIES AND CAUSES 4
A. Quantities of Hazardous Wastes 4
B. Causes of the Increase in Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes 6
   1. Wastes following the 'path of least resistance' 6
   2. Wastes exported on a regional scale 8
   3. Wastes with value as secondary raw materials 9
C. Hazardous Waste Generation in the Future 10

THE NATURE OF THE PROBLEM: CRITERIA FOR LEGAL REGULATION 12
D. The Hazardous Waste Cycle as an International and Multi-sectoral Issue 12
E. Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes as an Aspect of Transboundary Pollution 13

EXISTING AND EMERGING INTERNATIONAL LEGAL RULES RELEVANT TO THE HAZARDOUS WASTE CYCLE 14
F. Customary Law Related to Pollution Control 16
   4. The limitation on the 'freedom to pollute' and the concept of due diligence 16
   5. The right of states to control activities within their area of jurisdiction 20
   6. Duties of co-operation and information 23
   7. An assessment of the relevant customary law rules 25
G. Sectoral Pollution Control Regimes 25
H. International Rules on the Transport and Management of Hazardous Substances 26
THE NEED FOR A GLOBAL WASTE MANAGEMENT REGIME 28
I. Uniform Global Standards and Regional Rules 29
J. Sectoral and Integrated Regulation 30
K. 'Sovereignty-based' and 'Holistic' Rules 32
L. The Preventive and the Remedial Approach 34
M. Conclusions 36

2. The Basel Convention: an Analysis and Assessment 38

THE ELABORATION OF THE BASEL CONVENTION 38
A. Preliminary Work within UNEP: the Montevideo Programme and the Cairo Guidelines 38
B. The Basel Negotiation Process 40
   1. The Working Group and the Basel Conference 40
   2. Background to the negotiations 42
   3. Subsequent developments 46

STRUCTURE AND CHARACTERISTICS OF THE BASEL CONVENTION 47
C. The Scope of the Basel Convention 48
   4. Wastes covered by the Basel Convention 48
      4.1 The definition of wastes and the 'recycling dilemma' 48
      4.2 Classification of hazardous wastes and hazardous characteristics 49
      4.3 Exclusion clauses 51
   5. Territorial scope 52
D. General Obligations 55
   6. Minimization of generation and transboundary movement of hazardous wastes 55
   7. Environmentally sound management of hazardous wastes and the principle of non-discrimination 56
   8. Nature of the general obligations 60
E. Restrictions on Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes 61
   9. Hazardous waste traffic between parties 61
   10. Hazardous waste traffic between parties and non-parties 61
   11. Absolute prohibition of hazardous waste exports to Antarctica 63
   12. Prohibition of hazardous waste traffic from OECD to non-OECD countries 63
F. The Prior Informed Consent (PIC) Procedure 65
   13. The position of the states of export and import 65
Contents

14. The position of the state of transit 62
   14.1 Party transit states 68
   14.2 Non-party transit states 68
15. Wastes defined as hazardous by national legislation 70
G. Illegal Traffic and the Duty to Re-import 70
H. Liability and Compensation 72
I. International Co-operation and Exchange of Information 73
   16. International co-operation 73
   17. Exchange of information 73
J. Institutional and Financial Mechanisms 74
   18. Institutional mechanisms 74
   19. Financial mechanisms 76
K. Compliance Monitoring and Settlement of Disputes 76

AN ASSESSMENT OF THE BASEL CONVENTION 77
L. Perceived Strengths of the Convention 79
M. Perceived Weaknesses of the Convention 80

THE NEED FOR CO-ORDINATION WITH OTHER RELEVANT LEGAL INSTRUMENTS 83

3. The Basel Convention as an Umbrella for Regional Hazardous Waste Treaties 87

ARTICLE 11 OF THE BASEL CONVENTION 88
A. Overview 88
B. Compatibility of Separate Agreements with the Provisions of the Basel Convention 90
   1. Interpretation of Article 11 based on the requirement of 'environmentally sound management' 90
   2. Suggested broader interpretation of Article 11 92
C. Limitation of the Scope of the Agreements Addressed by Article 11 94
D. The Relationship between the Basel Convention and Legal Instruments Addressed by Article 11 96
E. Conclusions 98

THE BASEL CONVENTION AND THE 1991 BAMAKO CONVENTION 99
F. Outline of the Elaboration History and Provisions of the Bamako Convention 99
   3. Scope of wastes covered 101
   4. Ban on imports of hazardous wastes into Africa 101
   5. Transboundary movements and management of hazardous wastes generated in Africa 102
## Contents

6. Other provisions

G. The Bamako Convention as a Regional Agreement Within the Meaning of Article 11 of the Basel Convention 104

THE BASEL CONVENTION AND ARTICLE 39 OF THE LOMÉ IV CONVENTION 107

H. Outline of the Provision of Article 39 of the Lomé IV Convention

I. Article 39 of the Lomé IV Convention Within the Framework of Article 11 of the Basel Convention 110

THE BASEL CONVENTION AND THE NORTH AMERICAN BILATERAL AGREEMENTS ON TRANSBOUNDARY MOVEMENTS OF HAZARDOUS WASTES 113

J. Outline of the Provisions of the Agreements

7. The agreement between Canada and the USA on transboundary movements of hazardous waste

8. The agreement between the USA and Mexico on transboundary movements of hazardous wastes and hazardous substances


9. General considerations

10. Environmental standards established by the Canada–USA agreement

11. Environmental standards established by the USA–Mexico agreement

THE BASEL CONVENTION AND OTHER EXISTING AND EMERGING REGIONAL AGREEMENTS ON TRANSBOUNDARY MOVEMENTS OF HAZARDOUS WASTES 118

L. Post-Basel Agreements on Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes

M. Hazardous Waste Agreements Currently Under Discussion

N. Agreements on Wider Environmental Issues 122

CONCLUSIONS 123

4. The Relationship Between the Basel Convention and the Waste Management Systems of the EU and the OECD 126

THE BASEL CONVENTION AND THE EU RULES ON THE MANAGEMENT OF HAZARDOUS WASTES 126

A. The Management of Hazardous Wastes in EU Policy and Law 126
Contents

1. The waste management policy of the EU: fundamental concepts 126
2. EU legislation on the management of hazardous wastes 128
   2.2 The 1991 Directive on hazardous waste 130
   2.3 The 1984 Directive on transboundary movements of toxic and dangerous waste 131
   2.4 The 1993 Regulation on the supervision and control of shipments of waste within, into and out of the European Community 131
3. An assessment of EU policy and legislation 136

B. The EU Rules Within the Framework of the Basel Convention 137
4. The competence of the EU and its members with regard to the conclusion and implementation of the Basel Convention 137
   4.1 International competence of the EU in the field of hazardous waste management 137
   4.2 Legal basis of EU legislation in the field of hazardous waste management 139
5. The modalities of the implementation of the Basel Convention within the EU, and between the EU and other states 145
   5.1 The legal nature of the EU for the purposes of the Basel Convention 145
   5.2 The EU waste management legislation as a regional ‘arrangement’ within the meaning of Article 11 of the Basel Convention 149
   5.3 The fundamental concepts of the Basel Convention and the free movement of goods 151

C. Is the Existing and Emerging EU Waste Management Regime Compatible with the Requirements of the Basel Convention? 154
6. Transboundary movements of hazardous wastes within the EU 155
   6.1 Minimization of waste generation and proximity of disposal facilities 155
   6.2 Environmentally sound waste management and the principle of non-discrimination 156
   6.3 Establishment of a control system for waste transport based on environmental considerations 156
   6.4 Provisions on illegal traffic and the duty to re-import 157
Contents

7. Transboundary movements of hazardous wastes between the EU and third states  157

D. Conclusions  158

THE BASEL CONVENTION AND THE WASTE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM OF THE OECD  159

E. Outline of Existing OECD Rules Addressing the Hazardous Waste Cycle  159

8. Legal instruments elaborated prior to the adoption of the Basel Convention  160

9. The 1992 Decision concerning the control of transfrontier movements of wastes destined for recovery operations  161

10. An assessment of the waste management system of the OECD  163

F. The Relationship Between the OECD Waste Management System and the Basel Convention  164

11. General considerations  164


CONCLUSIONS  168

5. The Basel Convention Regime and Sectoral Pollution Control Treaties  172

INTRODUCTION  172

THE BASEL CONVENTION REGIME AND EXISTING TREATIES ON OCEAN DUMPING AND INCINERATION OF WASTES AND OTHER NOXIOUS SUBSTANCES  176

A. Outline of the London Convention and Other Relevant Rules  176

B. The Relationship Between the Basel Convention and the London Convention  182

1. Areas of conflict and overlap  184

1.1 Transboundary movements of hazardous wastes for the purpose of dumping or incineration at sea  186

1.2 Shipment of hazardous wastes to the Antarctic region for the purpose of dumping or incineration at sea  194

2. Areas requiring harmonization  195

3. Outlook  196

THE BASEL CONVENTION REGIME AND TREATIES ON THE CONTROL OF OTHER FORMS OF POLLUTION  196
Contents

C. The Basel Convention Regime and Treaties on Marine Pollution from Land-Based Sources 196
   4. Outline of the relevant rules 196
   5. The relationship between the Basel Convention regime and treaties on land-based sources of marine pollution 200
D. The Basel Convention Regime and International Rules on the Pollution of Continental Waterways 201

CONCLUSIONS 205

6. Ensuring Compliance: Relevant Concepts and Mechanisms 210

THE OBJECTIVES OF ENFORCEMENT MECHANISMS IN THE CONTEXT OF HAZARDOUS WASTE MANAGEMENT 212
A. Ensuring Compliance with Relevant Rules in Order to Prevent Environmental Damage Caused by Hazardous Wastes 212
B. Restoration of the Environment and Adequate Compensation of the Victims in the Event of Damage Caused by Hazardous Wastes 212
C. Equitable Allocation of the Costs of Minimization of Risks and Redress of Environmental Damage 213

STATE RESPONSIBILITY AND STATE LIABILITY 213
D. Existing and Emerging Rules on State Responsibility and Liability Relevant to Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes 214
   1. Forms of state responsibility and state liability 215
   2. Attribution to states of acts entailing responsibility 217
   3. Forms of reparation 219
E. Conventional Rules Established by the Emerging Global Waste Management Regime 219
   4. Article 9 of the Basel Convention: a basis of state responsibility for illegal traffic in hazardous wastes 219
   5. Article 8 of the Basel Convention: duty to re-import wastes that were legally exported 221
   6. Related provisions in regional waste management systems and sectoral pollution control treaties 223
   7. An emerging basis for state responsibility and liability in the context of waste management? 224
F. The Contribution of State Responsibility and Liability to the Achievement of the Objectives: Strengths and Weaknesses 224
Contents

INSTITUTIONAL SUPERVISION 227

G. Existing and Emerging Forms of Institutional Supervision: Precedents in Environmental Treaty Systems 227

H. Institutional Supervision Under the Emerging Global Waste Management Regime 230
   8. The Basel Convention 230
   9. Regional waste management systems and sectoral pollution control regimes 233

I. The Contribution of Institutional Supervision to the Achievement of the Objectives: Strengths and Weaknesses 235

CIVIL LIABILITY AND COMPULSORY INSURANCE 238

J. The Emergence of International Civil Liability Regimes: Precedents for the Global Waste Management Regime 238
   10. Strict or absolute liability 240
   11. Channelling of liability or joint and several liability 240
   12. Definition of damage 241
   13. Limitations of liability 241
   14. Compulsory insurance or other financial guarantee 242
   15. Unified procedural rules, equal access, and mutual recognition of court decisions 242

K. Civil Liability Under the Global Waste Management Regime 243
   16. The proposed liability protocol to the Basel Convention 243
   17. Other existing and emerging liability provisions under the global waste management regime 246

L. The Contribution of the Civil Liability Regimes to the Achievement of the Objectives: Strengths and Weaknesses 247

ESTABLISHMENT OF AN INTERNATIONAL HAZARDOUS WASTE COMPENSATION FUND 250


N. Establishment of a Fund under the Basel Convention Regime 252
   18. Basel Convention emergency fund ('revolving fund') 253
   20. Establishment of regional waste compensation funds? 255

O. Contribution of the Hazardous Waste Funds to the Achievement of the Objectives: Strengths and Weaknesses 256

CONCLUSIONS 259
Contents


INTRODUCTION 261

THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE BASEL CONVENTION AND RELATED LEGAL INSTRUMENTS TO EMERGING RULES AND CONCEPTS RELEVANT TO THE HAZARDOUS WASTE CYCLE 262

A. Principles of Waste Minimization and Proximity of Disposal 263

B. Prohibition or Restriction of Hazardous Waste Disposal Outside the Generating State 265

1. Prohibition of export of hazardous wastes to states that have banned their import 268

2. Prohibition of traffic in hazardous wastes from developed to developing and transitional countries 268

3. Prohibition of hazardous waste trade with states that are not parties to a particular treaty or other waste control system 270

4. Prohibition of waste export for disposal in parts of the global commons considered particularly vulnerable 271

C. Environmentally Sound Management of Hazardous Wastes and Principle of Non-Discrimination 272

D. Control System Including Prior Notification and PIC 274

E. Duty to Ensure Environmentally Sound Disposal of Hazardous Wastes that were Illegally Exported or Cannot be Disposed of in the State of Import 276

F. Conclusions 278

THE EMERGENCE OF A GLOBAL, HOLISTIC AND INTEGRATED REGIME FOR THE CONTROL OF THE HAZARDOUS WASTE CYCLE 279

G. Uniform Global Standards and Regional Rules 280

H. Sectoral and Integrated Regulation 281

I. Sovereignty-Based and Holistic Rules 282

J. The Preventive and the Remedial Approach 283

K. Conclusions 284

OUTLOOK 285

Appendices


II Decision II/12 of the Conference of the Parties to the Basel Convention (2nd Meeting) 25 March 1994) 316
Contents

III Bamako Convention on the Ban of the Import into Africa and the Control of Transboundary Movement and Management of Hazardous Wastes within Africa (30 January 1991) 317

IV Lomé IV Convention (15 December 1989), Article 39 and Annexes VIII-X 344

V Agreement Between the Government of Canada and the Government of the United States of America Concerning the Transboundary Movement of Hazardous Waste (28 October 1986, as amended) 346

VI Agreement of Co-operation Between the United States of America and the United Mexican States Regarding the Transboundary Shipments of Hazardous Wastes and Hazardous Substances (12 November 1986) 351

VII EC Council Regulation on the Supervision and Control of Shipments of Waste within, into and out of the European Community (No 259/93, 21 February 1993) 360


IX London Convention on the Prevention of Marine Pollution by Dumping of Wastes and Other Matter (29 December 1972, as amended) 418

Bibliography 430

Index 445