Current Developments in International and Comparative Corporate Insolvency Law

Edited by

Jacob S. Ziegel, LL D (Lond.),
Professor of Law Emeritus, University of Toronto
and Member of Lincoln’s Inn and the Ontario Bar

with the assistance of

Susan I. Cantlie, B.Sc., LL B, LL M (Toronto),
Member of the Alberta Bar

CLARENDON PRESS · OXFORD
1994
Contents

List of Contributors xvii
Introduction xxi
Table of Cases xxix
Table of Legislation xlv
Table of Conventions and Treaties lvi

PART A: COMPARATIVE ASPECTS

Section I: Where Are We Now and Where Are We Going?

1. An Overview of Recent Developments and Future Prospects in the United Kingdom, Nick Segal 5
   1. Introduction 5
   2. English Insolvency Law Reform 6
   3. Intellectual Background 7
   4. Workouts 8
   5. Current Concerns 10

   1. Introduction: Why Bankruptcy Law Philosophy? 19
   2. Development and Present State of the Law 20
   3. Basic Attitudes and Current Debates 21
   4. Comments 25

3. An Overview of Recent Developments and Future Prospects in the United States, Lawrence P. King 29

4. An Overview of Recent Developments and Future Prospects in Australia (With Some Reference to New Zealand and Asia), Ron Harmer 39
   1. Introduction 39
   2. Some Reminders of the Past 40
   3. The Model 42
   4. Details of the Voluntary Administration Regime 43
   5. Comparison With Other Jurisdictions 47
   6. Other Important Areas of Reform in Australia 50
   7. Trans-Tasman Issues 54
8. Insolvency Law in Asia 56

Section II: The Challenges of Reorganizing Insolvent Corporations

5. Administration: Part II of the Insolvency Act, Dan Prentice, Fidelis Oditah, and Nick Segal 63
   Introduction 63
   Part A:
   1. The Background to Part II of the Insolvency Act 1986 65
   Part B: Administration 73
      Introduction 73
      1. The Obtaining of an Administration Order: The Preliminary Steps 75
      2. The Effect of Making an Order 83
   Part C:
      Conclusion 106

   1. Introduction 109
   2. Initiating Reorganization Cases 120
   3. Preserving Firm Value During Reorganization 129
   4. Determining the Terms of Reorganization 156
   5. Conclusion 178

   1. Introduction 191
   2. The Context of Administration 191
   3. The Structure of Administration 195
   4. The Data 202
   5. Conclusion 213

   1. Introduction 191
   2. The Context of Administration 191
   3. The Structure of Administration 195
   4. The Data 202
   5. Conclusion 213

9. Should We Abolish Chapter 11? The Evidence From Japan, Theodore Eisenberg and Shoichi Tagashira 215
   2. The Data and the Questions Studied 223
   3. Estimates of Liquidation Value and Proposed Repayment Terms 229
Contents

4. Confirmation, Withdrawal, and Denial ....................................................... 237
5. Net Gain or Loss to Creditors From Compositions ................................. 243
6. Implications for US Business Reorganizations ........................................ 253
7. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 257


11. Executory Contracts and Proposals Under the Bankruptcy and Insolvency Act (Canada): A Comparative Analysis With the Companies’ Creditors Arrangement Act (Canada), Ellen L. Hayes .......................................................... 267
1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 267
2. General Principles ......................................................................................... 269
3. Specific Types of Contracts .......................................................................... 287
4. Conclusions .................................................................................................. 293

Section III: Voidable Transactions in Bankruptcy

12. Voidable Transactions in Bankruptcy: British Law Perspectives, Ian F. Fletcher .......................................................... 297
1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 297
2. Transactions at an Undervalue .................................................................... 301
3. Voidable Preferences .................................................................................. 305

1. Overview ....................................................................................................... 313
2. The Many Exceptions to Absolute Preference Avoidance ......................... 332
3. Concluding Remarks Regarding the US Situation ...................................... 343
4. Ideas For the Future ..................................................................................... 346

1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 357
2. The Various Voidable and Renewable Transactions ................................... 360
3. Policy Justifications ...................................................................................... 371
4. Critical Commentary .................................................................................... 374
5. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 375
## Section IV: The Ranking of Creditors in the Distribution of Insolvent Estates

15. Canadian Bankruptcy Law: A Secured Creditor's Heaven, *R. C. C. Cuming*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Introduction</th>
<th>379</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Statutory Regulation of Secured Financing Law in Canada</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Role of Personal Property Security Law in Bankruptcy</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Preferences Under the BIA and Provincial Law</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Post-Petition Attachment of Security Interests</td>
<td>394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Protection of Secured Creditors From Employee Wage-Claim Priorities</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Protection of Secured Creditors From (Some) Federal Crown Priorities</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Summary</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16. The Position of Creditors in the Distribution of Insolvent Estates: Consensual Secured Creditors in Japan, *Yukiko Hasebe*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Introduction</th>
<th>403</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Statutory Regimes for Insolvent Companies</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Treatment of Secured Creditors</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Scope of Security Interests</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusion</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

17. Preferred Priority in Bankruptcy, *Susan J. Cantlie*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Introduction</th>
<th>413</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Statutory Priority Provisions</td>
<td>414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Role of Bankruptcy Law</td>
<td>419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusion</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18. The Privately Appointed Receiver and the Enforcement of Security Interests: Anomaly or Superior Solution? *Jacob S. Ziegel*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Introduction</th>
<th>451</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. The Genesis of the Private Receivership and Subsequent Developments</td>
<td>452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Deemed Agency Clause and Conceptual Complications</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Relationship Between Private Receiverships, Administration Orders, and Commercial Reorganization</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Canadian Deviations From the British Model</td>
<td>463</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Why Have the Americans Not Adopted the Private Receivership?</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The Status of Private Receiverships in the Conflict of Laws</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

8. Conclusion 470

   1. Agency Costs and Bankruptcy 474
   2. Free Bargaining and Choice of Law 479
   3. Conclusion 482

Section V: The Personal Liability of Directors and Officers for the Debts of Insolvent Corporations

   1. The Position at Common Law 485
   2. Directors' Supposed 'Duty' to Creditors or to Have Regard to Their Interests 486
   3. Statutory Liability: The Background 488
   4. Liability for Fraudulent Trading: Insolvency Act 1986, Section 213 489
   5. Liability for Wrongful Trading: Insolvency Act 1986, Section 214 491
   6. Wrongful Trading: Scope of the Section 492
   7. Wrongful Trading: Nature of the Order 493
   8. Wrongful Trading: The New Law in Practice 494
   9. Directors' Personal Liability in Other Cases 496
  10. Liability of a Director as a 'Connected' Person 496
  11. Application to Other Bodies 497
  12. Conclusion 497
   
   Appendix: Insolvency Act 1986, Sections 213, 214 498

   1. Introduction 501
   2. Elements of Directors' Duty 502
   3. Defences 508
   4. Consequences of Contravention 511
   5. Holding Company's Liability for Insolvent Trading by Subsidiary 516
   6. Conclusion 518

   1. The Case Law 522
   2. Statute Law 531
   3. Conclusion 543
23. Must Boards Go Overboard? An Economic Analysis of the Effects of Burgeoning Statutory Liability on the Role of Directors in Corporate Governance, Ronald J. Daniels

1. Introduction
2. The Defects of Enterprise Liability
3. Directors as Social Monitors of Corporate Conduct
4. Conclusion

PART B: INTERNATIONAL ASPECTS

Section VI: Issues in Concurrent Insolvency Jurisdiction

24. Issues in Concurrent Insolvency Jurisdiction: English Perspectives, Christopher K. Grierson

1. Introduction
2. Co-operation by the English Courts
3. Bank of Credit and Commerce International
   Appendix 1: English Insolvency Procedures
   Appendix 2: The Jurisdiction of the English Courts to Wind Up Overseas Companies

25. The Role of the Examiner as Facilitator and Harmonizer in the Maxwell Communication Corporation International Insolvency, Evan D. Flaschen and Ronald J. Silverman

1. Introduction
2. The Special Complexities and Difficulties of International Insolvencies
3. Maxwell Communications Corporation plc
4. The Examiner as Facilitator and Harmonizer
5. The Order and Protocol
6. Facilitation and Harmonization in Legal, Business, and Practical Contexts
7. The Courts' Support for Facilitation and Harmonization
8. Conclusion
   Appendix: Order, Protocol, and Schedule 1 in Maxwell Case


1. Challenges in International Insolvency
2. Purely Domestic Proceedings in Each Country
3. Remaining Issues
4. Concurrent Insolvencies and Parent-Subsidiary and Affiliates Relationships
Contents

5. Blurred Borders Among International Insolvency Regimes 651

Section VII: Choice of Law Issues in International Insolvencies

27. Conflict of Laws Issues in International Insolvencies,  
Jay Lawrence Westbrook and Donald T. Trautman 655
1. The Traditional Approach 655
2. New Approaches 657
3. Conclusion 667
   Addendum: Additional Remarks of Donald T. Trautman 667

28. Comment on the Trautman-Westbrook Paper,  
Yasuhei Taniguchi 671

Section VIII: Harmonization of Jurisdictional and Recognitional Rules

29. Some Observations on Fairness, Public Policy, and Reciprocity in Cross-Border Insolvencies, Douglass G. Boshkoff 677
1. Fairness 678
2. Public Policy 682
3. Reciprocity 683
4. The Future 684

1. Introduction 687
2. Co-operation or Chaos 688
3. In the Beginning: What MIICA Is (and Is Not) 690
5. A World With MIICA: Vision and Reality 697
6. Conclusion 698
   Appendix: Model International Insolvency Co-operation Act 699

31. The Nordic Bankruptcy Convention, Michael Bogdan 701
1. Introduction 701
2. Recognition of Foreign Bankruptcy Decisions 701
3. Law Applicable in Bankruptcy 702
4. Publicity Measures and Their Legal Importance 703
5. Claims With Preferential Rights Against Particular Assets 703
6. General Preferences 704
7. Compositions 705
8. Concluding Observations on the Nordic Convention 706
Contents

9. Comparison with the European Bankruptcy Convention 706

32. Harmonization of Jurisdictional and Recognitional Rules:
The Istanbul Convention and the Draft EEC Convention, 709
Ian F. Fletcher

1. Introduction: The Quest for the 'Holy Grail' 709
2. Istanbul and Brussels: Similarities and Contrasts 717
3. Conclusion 727

33. Some Comments on Harmonization of Jurisdictional and
Recognitional Rules, Richard F. Broude 729

Section IX: Problems of Insolvent Multinational Financial Institutions

34. Multinational Bank Insolvencies: The United States and BCCI, 733
Hal S. Scott

1. Background 733
2. The Closing of BCCI 734
3. Which Countries Make the Decisions 735
4. Liability of Bank Regulators for Closing a Bank 736
5. Closing an Unlawful But Solvent Bank 737
6. The United States Ring Fence 737
7. Branches and Subsidiaries 742
8. Payment System Risks 744
9. Conclusion 744

Section X: The Judges Speak

35. The Judges Speak: A Panel Discussion, Judge James L. 749
Garrity, Jr., Mr Justice James Farley, and Mr Justice R. A. Blair

Index 773