Human Rights in States of Emergency in International Law

JAIME ORAÁ

CLARENDON PRESS • OXFORD
1992
Contents

Abbreviations xvii
Table of Cases * xix

Introduction 1

PART 1. HUMAN RIGHTS STANDARDS IN STATES OF EMERGENCY IN THE CONTEXT OF MULTILATERAL TREATIES: THE LEGAL REGIME OF THE DEROGATION CLAUSE 5

Introduction 7


   1. Introduction 11
   2. The Definition of Emergency in the Three Treaties 11
      (a) The Concept in the Covenant and in the European Convention 12
      (b) The Wording of the American Convention 14
   3. The Interpretation Given to the Concept of Emergency by the International Bodies Entrusted with the Application of the Three Treaties 16
      (a) The Jurisprudence under the European Convention 16
      (b) The Practice of the UN Human Rights Committee 20
      (c) The Practice of the IACHR 22
         (i) The Doctrine under the American Convention 23
         (ii) The Principles Applicable to States Non-Parties to the Convention 26
   4. The Main Features of the Emergency Envisaged in the Treaties 27
(a) The Emergency Must be Actual or at Least Imminent 27
(b) Its Effects Must Involve the Whole Population 28
(c) The Threat Must be to the Very Existence of the Nation 29
(d) The Declaration of Emergency Must be a Last Resort 29
(e) The Declaration of Emergency as a Temporary Measure 30

5. Circumstances in which a Public Emergency can be Declared 30
6. Conclusion 32

2. The Principle of Proclamation of the State of Emergency 34

1. Introduction 34
   (a) The Requirement of Official Proclamation in the Covenant 34
   (b) The Absence of this Requirement in the European Convention: Its Effects 37

2. The Organ Competent to Proclaim the Emergency: The Legislature and the Executive 38

3. Judicial Control 40

4. International Control under the Human Rights Treaties 42
   (a) Under the European Convention 42
      (i) The Competence of the European Organs to Control Compliance with the Principles of the Derogation Clause in Exceptional Situations 42
      (iii) The Concept of the Margin of Appreciation 45
      (iv) The Problem of the Burden of Proof 47
   (b) Under the Covenant: The United Nations Human Rights Committee 47
      (i) The Reporting Procedure 48
      (ii) The Practice of the Committee in Certain Specific Cases 49
   (c) Under the American Convention: The Control Exercised by the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights 51

5. Conclusion 55

3. The Principle of Notification 58

1. The Rationale of the Principle of Notification 58
## Contents

2. The Contents of the Notice of Derogation or the Formal Requirements of the Principle of Notification 60
   (a) The Element of Time 60
   (b) The Contents of the Notice of Derogation 61

3. The Effect of the Failure to Comply with the Notification Requirement 64
   (a) Total Failure to Meet the Notification Requirement: The Question of the Application ex officio of the Derogation Clause in Cases in which no Notification has been Sent 66
      (i) The Cyprus Case 67
      (ii) The Bolivian Case 69
      (iii) The Attitude of the UN HR Committee 69
   (b) Partial Failure to Meet the Notification Requirement 70

4. The Distinction between the Obligation of Notifying and the Obligation of Providing Information to International Bodies under Other Procedures 72

5. The Practice of Notification under the Three Treaties 76
   (a) The European Convention 76
   (b) The ICCPR 77
   (c) The ACHR 81

6. Conclusion 83

4. The Principle of Non-Derogability of Fundamental Rights 87

1. Introduction 87
   (a) The travaux préparatoires of the Three Treaties 88
   (b) The Rationale behind the List of Non-Derogable Rights 94

2. The Four Common Non-Derogable Rights 96

3. The Other Non-Derogable Rights under the ICCPR and the ACHR 97
   (a) Rights Unrelated to Public Emergencies 97
   (b) Rights which May have an Impact on Public Emergencies 100

4. Other Rights and Principles which are Held Non-Derogable by Implication 101
   (a) Provisions Related to the Exercise of Non-Derogable Rights 102
   (b) Provisions which Contain General Exceptions 103
   (c) Provisions Related to the Machinery of Implementation of the Treaties 105
Contents

5. Study of Several Proposals to Make a priori Non-Derogable Some Minimum Guarantees against Arbitrary Detention and of Due Process of Law 106
   (a) Introduction 106
   (b) Guarantees against Arbitrary Detention in Emergencies 108
       (i) General Guarantees 108
       (ii) Minimum Rights of Detainees 108
   (c) Guarantees of Due Process of Law in Emergencies 114
       (i) The Minimum Rights of Due Process 115
       (ii) The Rights whose Derogation would be Justified in Principle 116
       (iii) The Right to be Tried by an Independent and Impartial Tribunal 118
       (iv) The Practice of the HR Committee 119
       (v) The Practice under the ACHR 121

6. Conclusion 124

Appendix: Reservations to Non-Derogable Rights in the Three Human Rights Treaties 127

The Three Substantive Conditions for the Derogation of Rights in States of Emergency 139

5. The Principle of Proportionality 140

1. Introduction 140
   (a) The Legislative History of the Treaties 143

2. The Application of the Principle of Proportionality by the Supervisory Bodies under the Three Main Treaties 144
   (a) The Principle as Applied by the European Organs in Cases of Emergency 144
   (b) The Principle as Applied by the UN Human Rights Committee 152
       (i) The Review of States’ Reports 152
       (ii) Under the Optional Protocol 157
   (c) The Application of the Principle of Proportionality under the ACHR 159
       (i) The General Principles Formulated by the Inter-American Court 159
       (ii) The Application of the Principle by the IACHR 161

3. Conclusion 168
Contents

6. The Principle of Non-Discrimination 171
   1. Introduction 171
      (a) The Characteristics of the Provision 172
      (b) The Debate on the Principle of Non-Discrimination as Non-Derogable 172
      (c) The Introduction of the Principle as a Condition for Derogation 173
      (d) The Extent of the Provision 174
   2. The Application of the Principle by the Monitoring Organs under the Three Treaties 177
      (a) The European Organs: The Ireland v. UK Case 177
      (b) The Practice of the HR Committee 182
      (c) The Practice of the IACHR 185
   3. Conclusion 188

7. The Principle of Consistency 190
   1. Introduction 190
   2. Legislative History of the Principle in the Three Treaties 191
   3. The Application of the Principle by the Monitoring Organs under the Three Treaties 193
      (a) The European Convention 193
      (b) The UN Human Rights Committee 196
      (c) The IACHR 197
   4. The Delimitation of the Content of the Expression ‘Other Obligations under International Law’ 200
      (a) The Possible Additional Obligations Arising from the Laws of War 201
         (i) Humane Treatment 202
         (ii) Fair Trial and Due Process of Law 204
         (iii) Safeguards for Internees in Convention IV 204
   5. Conclusion 205

PART II. HUMAN RIGHTS IN STATES OF EMERGENCY IN GENERAL INTERNATIONAL LAW 207

Introduction 209
8. Customary International Law and Human Rights: Two Preliminary Questions

1. The Existence of Human Rights Standards in Customary Law
2. The Special Evidence Required to Prove the Existence of Customary Norms in the Area of Human Rights


1. Legal Doctrines in International Law which Justify the Non-Compliance with International Obligations in Cases of force majeure, Self-Defence, and Necessity
2. The Doctrine of State Necessity
   (a) Characteristics
   (b) Conditions of Application
   (c) Decisions of the ILO Organs: the Greek and Polish Cases

10. Second Line of Inquiry: The Emergence of Some of the Principles of the Derogation Clause as Principles of General International Law

1. The Legal Nature of the Derogation Clause
2. Three Types of Principles
3. The Derogation Clause and Customary International Law: The ‘Norm-Creating Character’ of the ICCPR and the Derogation Clause
4. Evidence of the Emergence of Some of the Principles of the Derogation Clause as Customary Law
   (a) The Probative Value of Law-Making Treaties
   (b) The Repetition of the Same Norm in Several Human Rights Treaties
   (c) The Practice of the Organs of International Organizations and Similar Agencies
      (i) The Practice of the IACHR
      (ii) the Practice of the UN Organs
   (d) The Acceptance of these Principles by States Non-Parties to the Human Rights Treaties
5. The Application of the Principles of the Derogation Clause to Other Areas of International Law
Contents

(a) State Responsibility for Injury to Aliens (Human Rights of Aliens in States of Emergency in General International Law) 254
(b) The Law of Belligerent Occupation: The Case of Israel 256
6. The Principles of the Derogation Clause as 'General Principles of Law' 257


1. The Principle of Exceptional Threat 261
2. The Principle of Proportionality 262
3. The Principle of Non-Discrimination 263
4. The Principle of Non-Derogability of Fundamental Rights 264

Conclusions of Part II 266

Concluding Remarks 270

Bibliography 273

Index 287