Reconceiving International Refugee Law

Edited by

James C. Hathaway

This research was generously supported by a grant from the Ford Foundation

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements ix  
Contributors xiii  
Preface: Can International Refugee Law be Made Relevant Again?  
*James C. Hathaway* xvii  
1. The Demise of the Interest-Convergence xviii  
2. The Politics of Non-Entrée xx  
3. The “Right to Remain” xxi  
4. Relegation of Burdens to the South xxi  
5. Principles for a New Paradigm of Refugee Protection xxii  
6. Toward the Reformulation of International Refugee Law xxv  

## I. Temporary Protection  
*Manuel Angel Castillo and James C. Hathaway*  
1. Why Temporary Protection Should be Considered 1  
2. How to Render Temporary Protection Humane 7  
2.1 Responding to the Vulnerabilities of Refugees 8  
2.2 The Refugee Family 9  
2.3 Social Organization 10  
2.4 Interaction with the Local Community 12  
3. How Temporary Protection Should be Structured 14  
3.1 Designating the State of Temporary Protection 14  
3.2 The Duration of Temporary Protection 17  
4. How Temporary Protection Should be Brought to an End 19
Table of Contents

Insights from Refugee Experience: A Background Paper on Temporary Protection

Maciej DOMANSKI

1. Becoming a Refugee: Desocialization and Dematuration Issues 22
2. Staff-Inmate Relations: Interaction, Communication and Information Problems 25
3. Reactions, Adaptations, and Adjustments 27
4. Aspects of Temporariness: Attitudes Towards Time and Space 28
5. Other Aspects of Camp Experience: Grief and Anxiety 29
6. Interim Conclusions and Qualifications 30

Issues for Discussion 32

II. Repatriation Aid and Development Assistance

Robert F. GORMAN and Gaim KIBREAB

1. Introduction 35
2. Assessing the Contemporary Status of International Efforts Concerning Refugee/Returnee Aid and Development 38
   2.1 Evolution of Solutions to the Refugee Problem 38
   2.2 The Need for Change 41
   2.3 Orthodoxy Questioned 42
   2.4 The Myth of Inter-Agency Cooperation 43
   2.5 In Search of the Locus of the Gap 45
   2.6 The Weaknesses of the “Innovative Models” 47
   2.7 Inclusion of Areas of Return in National Plans of Development 50
3. Temporary Protection and its Relation to Repatriation Aid and Development 51
   3.1 Basic Principles 51
   3.2 Local Development Institutional Structures in Temporary Protection 54
   3.3 RDCs and Preparation for Repatriation 57
4. Returnee Aid and Development 60
   4.1 Initial Considerations 60
   4.2 Voluntary Repatriation as the Optimal Solution 62
   4.3 Returnee Aid and Development 64
   4.4 Country of Origin Repatriation Planning 65
   4.5 Aid Strategy Upon Restoration of Peace 67
   4.6 Development Councils 68
5. Conclusions 73
   Postscript: Reply to Critiques 76

Issues for Discussion 80
# Table of Contents

## III. Responsibility Sharing

*Asha HANS and Astri SUHRKE*

1. Introduction ................................................................. 83
   1.1 The International Refugee Regime .................................. 84
   2.1 European Refugees .................................................... 86
   2.2 African Refugees ..................................................... 88
   2.3 Latin American Refugees ............................................ 92
   2.4 Asian Refugees ........................................................ 95
      2.4.1 South Asia ..................................................... 96
      2.4.2 Southeast Asia ............................................... 99
3. Analysis of Concepts and Practice .................................... 102
   3.1 Policy Issues of Reform ........................................... 102
   3.2 Theoretical Issues of Reform ..................................... 104

Issues for Discussion ..................................................... 107

## IV. Fiscal Burden Sharing

*Amitav ACHARYA and David B. DEWITT*

1. Introduction ................................................................. 111
2. Refugees and Security .................................................... 118
3. Three Conceptions of Burden Sharing ................................ 124
4. Conclusions ..................................................................... 137
   Table 1: Financial Contributions from Western Countries to the
   UNHCR .......................................................................... 142

Issues for Discussion ..................................................... 143

### Afterword: Assessing the Prospects for Reform of International
Refugee Law

*Bill FRELICK* .................................................................... 147

1. Temporary Protection ..................................................... 148
2. Repatriation Aid and Development Assistance ..................... 151
3. Responsibility Sharing .................................................... 152
4. Fiscal Burden Sharing ..................................................... 153
5. Conclusions ..................................................................... 155

Bibliography ....................................................................... 159