Language as a Medium of Legal Norms

Implications of the Use of Arabic as a Language in the United Nations System

By

Lutz Edzard

Duncker & Humblot • Berlin
Table of Contents

Chapter One

Introduction .................................................. 17

Chapter Two

Basic legal and linguistic issues
regarding Arabic and Islam

A. Historical background: Middle East and North Africa ..................... 22
B. Religious background: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam .................... 26
C. Legal background: Islamic law ........................................... 29
D. Linguistic background: Arabic .......................................... 33
   I. General observations .................................................. 33
   II. Arabic as a modern language of diplomacy ............................ 34
   III. Types of Arabic documents in the UN system ....................... 37
       1. Overview .......................................................... 37
       2. Bi- and multilateral treaties ..................................... 37
       3. Diplomatic correspondence ....................................... 41
       4. Periodic reports ................................................... 45
       5. Oral contributions ................................................ 47
   IV. Linguistic features of diplomatic Arabic ................................ 48
       1. Syntactic features ................................................... 48
       2. Lexical features ..................................................... 49
       3. Stylistic features .................................................... 51
       4. Pragmatic features ................................................ 53
       5. Islamic formulae .................................................... 54
   E. Summary of Chapter Two ............................................. 57

Chapter Three

The theory of interpretation

A. Legal and linguistic interpretation ....................................... 58
B. The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties ......................... 60
Table of Contents

C. Speech Act Theory .............................................................................................................. 62
D. A typology of diplomatic misunderstanding ........................................................................ 66
   I. General considerations ..................................................................................................... 66
   II. The extension coincides, the intension differs .............................................................. 68
   III. The extension differs, the intension coincides .............................................................. 69
   IV. The extension differs, the intension differs ................................................................. 70
   V. The extension coincides, the intension coincides partially ............................................. 72
E. Summary of Chapter Three ................................................................................................. 73

Chapter Four

Application of the theory of interpretation to the realm of war and peace

A. Overview of problems ......................................................................................................... 74
   I. Basic considerations ....................................................................................................... 74
   II. The Islamic concept of *jihād* ..................................................................................... 75
   III. Islam and terrorism ..................................................................................................... 76
   IV. Contemporary conflicts in the Arab world ................................................................. 77
   V. The diplomatic use of the term "Zionism" ................................................................. 79
B. The Palestine conflict ("Middle East conflict") ................................................................ 82
   I. Overview of general discourse problems ................................................................. 82
   II. The McMahon-Husayn correspondence (1915/1916) .............................................. 85
   III. The Armistice Agreements of 1949 between Israel and its neighbors .................... 87
   IV. The Camp David Peace Accord between Israel and Egypt ...................................... 87
   V. The Oslo Accords between Israel and the PLO ......................................................... 88
   VI. The Washington Declaration between Israel and Jordan ....................................... 89
   VII. The Treaty of Peace between Israel and Jordan ..................................................... 90
   VIII. The Protocol Concerning the Redeployment in Hebron .................................... 90
C. The Iraq-Kuwait crisis ....................................................................................................... 91
   I. Overview of general discourse problems ................................................................. 91
   II. Crucial documents ...................................................................................................... 93
D. The Iraqi concepts of "law", "truth", "peace", and "justice": a comparative analysis of the traditional methods of treaty interpretation and Speech Act Theory ......................................................................................... 105
   I. Basic considerations ...................................................................................................... 105
   II. The traditional methods of treaty interpretation ....................................................... 105
   III. Speech Act Theory .................................................................................................... 106
E. Summary of Chapter Four ............................................................................................... 107
Chapter Five

Application of the theory of interpretation
to the realm of human rights

A. Overview of problems
   I. Basic considerations
   II. "Western" vs. "Islamic" approaches to the issue

B. The periodic reports submitted to international treaty bodies
   I. Synopsis: accession of Islamic states to international human rights conventions and their reservations
   II. The situation in the Arab states and in Iran
   III. The specific problems
      1. Types of reservations
      2. Hidden precepts
      3. List of conflicting norms between international law and the Islamic šari'a

IV. Overview of the specific problems, as appearing in UN documents
   1. Personal statute law
      a) Muslims vs. non-Muslims
      b) Men vs. women
      c) Freedom of religion, thought, and conscience
   2. Family law
      a) Prohibition of marriage between Muslim women and non-Muslim men
      b) Lack of freedom in contracting marriage
      c) Polygamy up to four wives
      d) Complementary distribution of "rights" and "obligations"
      e) Prohibition against women leaving the house, or traveling without husband's permission
      f) Institution of dowry
      g) Asymmetry in divorce regulations
      h) Prohibition of adoption
   3. Law of succession
   4. Penal law
      a) Absolute prohibition against Muslims changing religion
      b) Hudūd sentences
   5. Law of procedure

C. The Islamic concept of "equality": a comparative analysis of the traditional methods of treaty interpretation and Speech Act Theory
   I. Basic considerations
   II. The traditional methods of treaty interpretation
   III. Speech Act Theory
D. Evaluation of the arguments .......................... 152
I. The anachronistic nature of the arguments .... 152
II. Discrepancies within Islamic theory .......... 152
III. Discrepancies between Islamic theory and practice ... 152
IV. Comparable issues in other religions ....... 153
V. Problem of maintenance of status quo ....... 153
VI. Insistence on international human rights principles .... 154
VII. The Islamic concept of *ijtihād* .......... 154
E. Summary of Chapter Five ......................... 156

Chapter Six

Case study: application of the theory of interpretation
to the definition of "ethnic, religious, and
linguistic minorities" in UN documents

A. Overview of problems ........................................ 158
I. Basic considerations ........................................ 158
II. Instruments of international law for the protection of
    minorities .................................................. 160
III. The data and the issues ............................... 161
IV. Linguistic strata ........................................... 168
B. Problems in the discussions of the treaty bodies .... 170
C. Case study: the Turkish-Kurdish conflict ........ 172
D. Analysis: application of Speech Act Theory ...... 177
E. Summary of Chapter Six ................................. 180

Chapter Seven

Conclusion

A. General observations ................................. 181
B. Legal aspects ............................................. 181
C. Linguistic aspects ....................................... 184
D. Summary of Chapter Seven .......................... 185

Appendix

Analytical catalogue of data and sources

A. Arabic terminology .................................... 187
   I. Glossary of Arabic legal/religious and political terms .... 187
# Table of Contents

II. Arabic honorifics ................................................................. 189

B. Arabic terminology sources .................................................. 190
   I. Specialized dictionaries and manuals ................................... 190
   II. List of UN terminology manuals ...................................... 190

C. Sources for treaties and other diplomatic documents .................. 193

D. List of quoted treaties and declarations .................................... 193
   I. Bilateral treaties and declarations (in chronological order) .... 193
   II. Pluri- and multilateral treaties and declarations (in chrono-
       logical order) .................................................................. 194

E. List of quoted UN documents .................................................. 196
   I. List of letters, resolutions, verbatim records, special reports, 
      legal references, and other documents ................................. 196
   II. List of periodic reports by Arab states and Iran, summary 
       records of discussions, and concluding observations ............ 199

F. List of other quoted documents ................................................. 215

G. List of quoted cases, pleadings, and judgments ............................ 216

H. Original Arabic quotations ..................................................... 216

# References

A. Arabic references .................................................................. 234

B. Non-Arabic references .......................................................... 235

# Index

A. Index of names ..................................................................... 249

B. Index of subjects ................................................................. 254