Personal Autonomy, the Private Sphere and the Criminal Law

A Comparative Study

edited by

PETER ALDDRIDGE
and
CHRISJE BRANTS

OXFORD – PORTLAND OREGON
2001
## Contents

**Contributors**  \(\text{xiii}\)

**Table of Cases**  \(\text{ xv}\)

**Table of Legislation**  \(\text{ xix}\)

### INTRODUCTION

**Peter Alldridge and Chrisje Brants**

- The comparative exercise \(\text{ 1}\)
- Why privacy now? \(\text{ 4}\)
- Justifications for state intervention \(\text{ 8}\)
- Internationalisation and harmonising tendencies
  - International developments \(\text{ 9}\)
  - The European Union \(\text{ 10}\)
  - The European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms \(\text{ 11}\)
- Limiting the power of the state? \(\text{ 13}\)
- Criminal law as a solution for social problems \(\text{ 15}\)
- Why is privacy such a weak right? \(\text{ 19}\)

### 1. LEGAL MORALISM OR PATERNALISM? TOLERANCE OR INDIFFERENCE? EGALITARIAN JUSTICE AND THE ETHICS OF EQUAL CONCERN

**Koen Raes**

1. Usual préjudices \(\text{ 25}\)
2. Tolérance, permissiveness, indifférence \(\text{ 28}\)
3. The norm of equal concern and the problem of implementation \(\text{ 29}\)
4. Political neutrality and the enforcement of morals
   - 4.1. The classic liberal approach \(\text{ 31}\)
   - 4.2. Devlin’s conventionalism \(\text{ 33}\)
   - 4.3. Social integration as a value \(\text{ 35}\)
5. Démocratie objectivism \(\text{ 36}\)
6. Political neutrality and ideals of the good
   - 6.1. The harm principle and justified paternalism \(\text{ 39}\)
   - 6.2. Perfectionism and anti-perfectionism \(\text{ 42}\)
7. The politics of equal concern \(\text{ 46}\)
2. PRIVACY, AUTONOMY AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE RIGHTS: PHILosophical Preliminaries 49
Paul Roberts

I. The value of privacy 52
Privacy and autonomy 57
II. The right to privacy 65
Standard objections and popular misconceptions 71
III. Privacy rights and criminal justice 75

3. THE PUBLIC, THE PRIVATE AND THE SIGNIFICANCE OF PAYMENTS 79
Peter Alldridge

Introductory 79
Criminal law classification 79
Defining the private in criminal law and criminal justice 80
Locating privacy claims in English positive criminal law 82
Markets and the hierarchy of exclusionary reasons 87
Defining the payment 89
Constructing the rational autonomous individual 91
Conclusions and agenda 92

4. SOVEREIGNTY, CRIMINAL LAW AND THE NEW EUROPEAN CONTEXT 93
Leonard F. M. Besselink

I. The state, sovereignty and autonomy 93
Sovereignty 94
Conceptual distinctions 96
The public and the private 98

II. European Union 100
The first pillar 101
Primary EC law and economic freedoms 101
Secondary EC law: EC sanctions 103
EC law: institutional aspects 109
The third pillar 110

III. EU and private sphere/ private autonomy 113
Sovereignty 115

5. THE STATE AND THE NATION’S BEDROOMS: THE FUNDAMENTAL RIGHT OF SEXUAL AUTONOMY 117
Chrisje Brants

Introduction 117
The paradox of individual autonomy and democratic society 120
The European Court of Human Rights on the limits of sexual
autonomy 123
Homosexuality 124
Sadomasochism 127
Equality rights and autonomy 129
Autonomy and the rights and interests of others 132
The limits of sexual autonomy: coercion and consent 134
Consent to what? 135
Consent and submission 136
Sexual autonomy, the problem of public space and the limits of
consent 137

6. HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE CRIMINALISATION OF
TRADITION: THE PRACTICES FORMERLY KNOWN AS
"FEMALE CIRCUMCISION" 139
Lois Bibbings
Introduction 139
General definitions of FC/FGM 140
Human rights, criminal law and FC/FGM 142
Criminal law penalties and enforcement 153
Conclusion 157

7. DENYING SHOAH 161
Bert Swart
The Auschwitz Lie 161
Developments in national and in international law 164
The approach of human rights bodies: arguments in favour of
criminalisation 169
Freedom of speech in the United States: arguments against
criminalisation 173
Concluding observations 177

8. CRIMINAL LEGISLATION IN THE NINETEENTH
CENTURY: THE HISTORIC ROOTS OF CRIMINAL LAW
AND NON-INTERVENTION IN THE NETHERLANDS 181
C.M. Pelser
1. Introduction 181
2. Criminal legislation in the nineteenth century 184
3. The 1886 Criminal Code: leading principles 188
4. The compilers of the 1886 Criminal Code on the private sphere
and personal autonomy 194
x Contents

5. Conclusions on modern developments in the Netherlands 197

9. CONSENT IN DUTCH CRIMINAL LAW 205
   Constantijn Kelk
   1. Basic essentials of Dutch criminal law 205
   2. Fields of criminal law where consent is relevant 207
      a. Offences only prosecuted if a complaint is filed 208
      b. Pornography and matters of public decency 209
      c. Sexual acts under duress or involving violence 211
      d. Voluntary submission to violence in general 213
      e. Conduct of the medical profession 213
      f. Euthanasia 214
   3. Conclusion 220

   Richard Collier
   Introduction 223
   1. Constructing the paedophile: public protest and the release of sex offenders from prison 224
   2. The dangerous individual: risk, popular knowledge and the rule of law 230
      The dangerous individual, risk and the fear of crime 230
      Popular knowledge and the rule of law 234
   3. Childhood, parenthood and gender: (re)constructing the paedophile as other 237
      Vulnerable childhood, anxious parenthood and the dangerous masculine 238
   4. Concluding remarks 241

11. THE FIGHT AGAINST SEX WITH CHILDREN 245
   M. Moerings
   1. Introduction 245
   2. Back to the closet 246
   3. Reactions of society 247
   4. Sex with children and the criminal statutes 249
      (a) Indecency is time-related 250
      (b) Abolition of the complaint requirement 250
   5. Child pornography in the criminal statutes 252
      (a) The rationale behind the child pornography article 253
      (b) Increasing the age limit for child pornography 256
6. The enforcement of sentences and its aftermath 257
   (a) The questionable role of the probation service 259
   (b) Lifelong monitoring and social isolation 260
7. Paedophile sex and child pornography in the light of morality and law 263

Index 267