The Application of EC Law by National Courts

The Free Movement of Goods

MALCOLM A. JARVIS
MA, LLM (Cantab.), LL D (Groningen)

CLARENDON PRESS • OXFORD
1998
Contents

Preface xiii
Abbreviations xv
Treaty of Amsterdam (revised Articles) xix
Table of Cases xxii

1 Introduction 1

2 Article 30 and imports 6

1. Legal structure and scope 6
   (A) The definition of ‘goods’ 6
   (B) Goods from third countries ‘in free circulation’ in the Community 7
   (C) Article 30 and other Articles in the EC Treaty 9

2. Quantitative restrictions 14

3. Measures having equivalent effect 20

4. All trading rules enacted by Member States 23
   (A) Trading rules 25
   (B) Enacted by Member States 28
      The Dutch Association for Advertising Standards and the Advertising Standards Commission 30

5. Directly or indirectly 36
   (A) Examples of directly applicable measures 37
      (i) Import licences and obligations to make a declaration of origin 37
      (ii) Import inspections 42
      (iii) Conditions imposed in relation to imports only 43
      (iv) Limiting channels of distribution 47
      (v) Obligatory origin-marking 49
      (vi) Encouraging discrimination 52
   (B) Examples of indirectly applicable measures 53
      (i) Requirements that goods be sold by qualified persons 56
      (ii) Restrictions on advertising and promotion 59
      (iii) Restrictions regulating the time and place where goods may be sold 64
Contents

(iv) Restrictions as to the presentation of goods 66
(v) Language requirements 69
(vi) Product requirements 71
(vii) Price-fixing 76

6. Conclusions 85

3 Actually or potentially hindering intra-Community trade 89

1. Introduction 89

2. Application of the case law prevailing before the Keck and Mithouard judgment of 24 November 1993 90
   (A) A limit of common sense for Article 30? 92
   (B) Confused ECJ case law 95
   (C) Article 30 and de minimis 104
   (D) Proof of an actual or potential effect on trade 110
   (E) Incorrect applications of the "actual or potential" effect on trade test 116

3. Application of post-Keck and Mithouard case law 118
   (A) Keck and the scope of Article 30 118
   (B) Application of Keck before the national courts 122

4. Conclusions 129

4 Article 34 and exports 133

1. Introduction 133

2. Is Article 34 sufficiently clear in practice? 135

3. Article 34 and de minimis 145

4. Protection of the environment and Article 34 145

5. Article 34 and common organizations of the Market 149

6. Conclusions 152

5 Reverse discrimination and purely national measures 153

1. Introduction 153

2. French legislation restricting the advertising of alcoholic beverages 158

3. French legislation concerning resale price maintenance for books 165
4. National legislation concerning the disposal of waste 168
5. Conclusions 173

6 The rule of reason 175
   1. Introduction 175
   2. The protection of cultural expression 180
   3. Consumer protection and the fairness of commercial transactions 183
   4. Protection of national socio-cultural characteristics: national legislation affecting shop-opening hours 195
      (A) United Kingdom 200
      (B) France 200
      (C) The Netherlands 201
      (D) The proportionality principle 202
      (E) The application of the proportionality principle to national legislation affecting shop opening hours 204
         (i) Identifying the objective of the national legislation 204
         (ii) Is the proportionality test unduly difficult to apply? 206
         (iii) The necessity test vs. the balancing test 207
         (iv) The application of the proportionality principle before the French courts 211
         (v) The application of the proportionality principle before the English and Welsh courts: the doctrine of Parliamentary sovereignty 214
         (vi) Proportionality as a question of fact 217
         (vii) A real problem of fragmentation of justice in application of the proportionality principle? 219
         (viii) The origin of the 'chaos' before the English courts: the availability of injunctions to enforce the Shops Act 221
         (ix) Is it desirable for the ECJ to decide the proportionality issue itself? 223
         (x) Summary 225

5. Conclusions 227

7 Article 36 grounds of justification 231
   1. Introduction 231
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Public morality</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Public policy and public security</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(A) Public policy and public security and economic economic considerations</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(B) Public policy and civil unrest</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(C) Public policy and public security and the second sentence of Article 36</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Protection of health and life of humans</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(A) Equivalence and the duty on the part of Member States to co-operate with other Member States</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(B) Cases which suggest that the national courts are not respecting the narrow interpretation of the Article 36 public-health justifications adopted by the ECJ</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(C) Is it desirable for the ECJ to decide (wherever possible) the proportionality of a national measure?</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(D) Examples of extremely competent and dynamic applications of the public-health justification in Article 36</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(E) Summary</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Protection of animals and plants</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Protection of national treasures possessing artistic, historic, or archaeological value</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Conclusions</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Intellectual property rights</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Patents</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'Licences of Right' under the Patents Act 1977</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Copyright</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copyright in television programme listings</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Trade marks</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(A) The doctrine of common origin</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(B) Repackaging products and trade-mark infringement</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(C) Confusingly similar trade marks</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Indications of source and appellations of origin</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. How intrusive should Article 36 be?</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

7. Do you have to sue for the intellectual property right infringement in the other Member State? 334
8. The burden of proof 337
9. Importation from third countries 340
10. Conclusions 343

9 Completion of the internal market and the effect of community harmonization legislation 345
1. Introduction 345
2. Exhaustive Community harmonization legislation precluding recourse to Article 36 EC 349
3. The compatibility of Community legislation with primary Treaty rules 356
4. Legal mechanisms for the completion of the internal market 358
5. Conclusions 364

10 Remedies for breach of rules on the free movement of goods before national courts 365
1. Introduction 365
2. Interim relief before national courts 368
(A) Application of the provisions concerning the free movement of goods by French courts in interim proceedings
(i) Cases in which the juge des référés held that the breach of French law constituted a trouble manifestement illicite and that, until it was shown in an incontestable manner that the French provisions were contrary to Articles 30 to 36 EC, French law must apply 370
(ii) Cases in which the juge des référés held that the court was incompetent to resolve a serious dispute between French and EC law 372
(iii) Cases in which the juge des référés held that French law should be applied to avoid the emergence of a legal vacuum 374
(iv) Cases in which the juge des référés carried out an effective balancing act between the provisions of French law and Articles 30 to 36 EC 376
Contents

(v) Evaluation of the exercise of the discretion to grant interim measures by the juge des référes

378

(B) Application of the provisions concerning the free movement of goods by United Kingdom courts in interim proceedings

380

(C) Application of the provisions concerning the free movement of goods by Dutch courts in interim proceedings

386

(D) Conclusions

390

3. State liability for breach of EC law

393

(A) State liability for breach of EC law before the French courts

397

(B) State liability for breach of EC law before the English courts

405

(C) State liability for breach of EC law before the Dutch courts

413

(D) Conclusions

418

11 Preliminary references to the ECJ Under Article 177 EC

420

1. Introduction

420

2. Mandatory references: the obligation on national courts of last resort to refer questions of EC law to the ECJ and the ‘Acte Clair’ Doctrine

422

3. The wishes of the parties

425

4. A court against whose decisions there is no judicial remedy under national law

426

5. Length of time required for a preliminary reference

427

6. Appeals against decisions to refer

428

7. Repeat references

429

8. Conclusions

429

12 Conclusion

431

1. Introduction

431

2. How should the approach of the ECJ in interpreting the provisions concerning the free movement of goods be altered in order to take into account the problems of application of its current case law before the national courts?
3. Can national courts be trusted to apply EC law correctly? 439
   (A) Open hostility and poor applications of Articles 30 to 36 EC by the national courts 439
   (B) Irreconcilable judgments: courts in one Member State faced with the compatibility of particular national legislation with the provisions concerning the free movement of goods but reaching different conclusions 443
   (C) The emergence of national precedents misapplying EC law 446
   (D) The constitutional position of national judges; Parliamentary sovereignty vs. the independence of the judiciary; free trade vs. national regulation of economic life 447

4. Balancing the scales: evaluation of the administration of justice in the Community taken as a whole 448

5. Towards a mature system of Community courts 452

Select Bibliography 459

Index 469