Multinational Enterprises and the Law

Peter Muchlinski
Part I  The Conceptual Framework  

1  Concern over Multinational Enterprises  
  1 The Origins of Post-war Political Concern over MNEs  
     1.1 The Attitudes of Countries and Regions  
     1.2 Sensational Abuses of Corporate Power by MNEs  
     1.3 Moves towards an Economic Theory of the MNE  
     1.4 The Ideological Dimension  
     1.5 Summary  
  2 The Contemporary Position  
  3 Problems of Definition  
  4 Concluding Remarks  

2  The Evolution of Modern Multinational Enterprises  
  1 The Principal Phases of MNE Growth  
     1.1 The First Period: 1850–1914  
     1.2 The Second Period: 1918–1939  
     1.3 The Third Period: 1945 to the Present  
        1.3.1 The period of American dominance: 1945–1960
1.3.2 The period of renewed international competition: 1960 to the present 28
1.3.3 Possible future developments 32
2 Explanations for the Growth of MNEs and the Role of Legal Factors Therein 33
2.1 Theories of MNE Growth 33
2.2 The Role of Legal Factors 38
   2.2.1 Ownership- or firm-specific factors 38
   2.2.2 Locational factors 42
   2.2.3 Internalization factors 45
3 Concluding Remarks 47

3 Business and Legal Forms of Multinational Enterprise: towards a Theory of Control 57
1 MNEs as Transnational Business Organizations 57
2 Legal Forms of Multinational Enterprise 61
   2.1 Contractual Forms 62
      2.1.1 Distribution agreements 63
      2.1.2 Production agreements 63
   2.2 Equity Based Corporate Groups 65
      2.2.1 The Anglo-American 'pyramid' group 65
      2.2.2 European transnational mergers 66
      2.2.3 The Japanese *keiretsu* 69
      2.2.4 Changes in business organization and effects on equity based structures 71
   2.3 Joint Ventures 72
   2.4 Informal Alliances between MNEs 73
   2.5 Publicly Owned MNEs 75
2.6 Supranational Forms of International Business 76
   2.6.1 Forms adopted by the European Community 77
   2.6.2 The Andean Multinational Enterprise adopted by the Andean Common Market (ANCOM) 78
   2.6.3 Public international corporations 79
3 Concluding Remarks: Business and Legal Forms and the Control of MNE Activities 80

4 Relations between MNEs and States: towards a Theory of Regulation 90
1 Developing a Regulatory Agenda: Interactions between MNEs and Home and Host States 90
   1.1 The Neo-classical Perspective 93
   1.2 The Orthodox Post-war Economic Perspective 93
1.3 The Marxist Perspective 95
1.4 The Influence of Nationalism 97
1.5 The Environmental Perspective 99
1.6 'Global Consumerism' 100
1.7 Synthesis: Framework for a Regulatory Agenda 101

2 Jurisdictional Levels and Methods of MNE Regulation 102
2.1 The Regulatory Priorities of Home and Host States 103
2.2 Bargaining between Host States and MNEs 104
2.3 Jurisdictional Levels of Regulation 107
2.3.1 National regulation 107
2.3.2 Regional regulation 111
2.3.3 International regulation 112

3 Concluding Remarks 114

Part II Regulation by Home and Host States 121

5 The Jurisdictional Limits of Regulation through National or Regional Law 123
1 The Legal Bases for the Extraterritorial Regulation of MNEs 123
1.1 Nationality 124
1.2 Protective Jurisdiction 124
1.3 Objective Territorial Jurisdiction 125
2 The Extraterritorial Regulation of MNEs in State Practice 126
2.1 Jurisdiction to Prescribe 126
2.1.1 Nationality links 127
2.1.2 The 'effects' doctrine 129
2.1.3 Links of ownership and control 133
2.2 Personal Jurisdiction 134
2.2.1 Establishing a sufficient connection between the forum and the non-resident unit of the MNE 134
2.2.2 The doctrine of forum non conveniens as applied to non-resident units of MNEs 141
2.3 Jurisdiction to Enforce 144
2.4 The Disclosure of Evidence in Proceedings Involving a MNE 145
2.4.1 Disclosure of evidence in US antitrust proceedings 146
2.4.2 US disclosure orders and foreign secrecy laws 148
2.4.3 The reduction of conflicts over demands for disclosure of evidence located in a foreign jurisdiction 151

3 Concluding Remarks: the Limitation of Extraterritoriality Conflicts 156

6 The Control of Inward Investment by Host States 172

1 The Scope of Host State Discretion 172
2 Techniques For Restricting Entry and Establishment 173
   2.1 Total Exclusion and Sectoral Exclusion of Foreign Investors 174
      2.1.1 Total exclusion 174
      2.1.2 Sectoral exclusion 175
   2.2 Laws Restricting Foreign Shareholdings in National Companies 177
      2.2.1 Indigenization laws 177
      2.2.2 Restrictions on foreign ownership in privatized companies 181
      2.2.3 Concluding remarks 184
   2.3 Laws Regulating Equity Joint Ventures between Foreign and Local Enterprises 184
      2.3.1 The post-socialist states of Eastern Europe 187
      2.3.2 The People’s Republic of China 188
      2.3.3 The Soviet Union and its successor states 192
      2.3.4 Concluding remarks 193
   2.4 ‘Screening Laws’ 194
      2.4.1 Screening laws in LDCs 195
      2.4.2 Screening laws in economically advanced countries 197
      2.4.3 Concluding remarks 203

3 Concluding Remarks: the Movement towards Liberalization of Controls over Foreign Investors 203

7 Measures for the Encouragement of Inward Direct Investment 222

1 The Encouragement of Inward Direct Investment by Host States 222
   1.1 Host States without Specialized Controls on Inward Direct Investment 223
   1.2 Investment Incentives 225
   1.3 Export Processing Zones (EPZs) and Related ‘Policy Enclaves’ within the Host State 228
## Contents

### 2.1 The 'Enterprise Entity' Theory and Its Limitations 328
### 2.2 Towards a New Law of MNE Group Liability? 330
### 3 Protection of Minority Shareholders in the Subsidiary of a MNE 333
### 4 Protection of Creditors upon the Insolvency of the Subsidiary of a MNE 336
### 5 Concluding Remarks 339

**10 Accountability and Disclosure**

1 Principal Motives and Interests behind Enhanced MNE Accountability and Disclosure 346
2 Reforming the Internal Structures of MNEs to Ensure Accountability 349
   2.1 The Use of Non-executive Directors on the Managerial Boards of MNEs 349
   2.2 European Initiatives for the Enhancement of MNE Accountability 350
3 Disclosure by MNEs in Annual Accounts and Other Statements 354
   3.1 Consolidated Financial Statements 355
   3.2 Segmental Disclosure 361
   3.3 Social Disclosure 366
      3.3.1 Employee disclosure 366
      3.3.2 Value-added statements 367
      3.3.3 Environmental disclosure 368
   3.4 Foreign Currency Translation 371
4 Concluding Remarks 372

**11 Regulation through Antitrust Law**

1 The Use of Antitrust Laws in the Regulation of the Anti-competitive Activities of MNEs 384
   1.1 The Nature and Aims of Antitrust Regulation 384
   1.2 The Incidence of Anti-competitive Conduct on the Part of MNEs and Regulatory Responses 386
      1.2.1 Anti-competitive agreements and concerted practices 387
      1.2.2 'Abuse of a dominant position' or 'monopolization' 393
      1.2.3 Mergers and acquisitions 395
2 International Developments in the Regulation of Restrictive Business Practices Undertaken by MNEs 403
3 Concluding Remarks 411
12 Technology Transfer

1 The Nature of Technology Transfer
   1.1 'Technology' and 'Technology Transfer' 425
   1.2 The Generation and Use of Technology: the Interests of Technology-exporting and Technology-importing States Compared 427

2 Technology Transfer by MNEs and Its Legal Effects 431

3 Restrictive Terms in Technology Transfer Transactions
   3.1 Restrictions on the Commercial Policy of the Technology Recipient 433
   3.2 Restrictions on the Use of Technology on the Part of the Recipient 435

4 The Two Principal Models of Technology Transfer Regulation
   4.1 The Developed Country Model 437
   4.2 The LDC Model
      4.2.1 Reserved approach to the protection of intellectual property rights 438
      4.2.2 Specialized technology transfer laws 442

5 The Draft UNCTAD Code of Conduct on the Transfer of Technology 444

6 Concluding Remarks: the Demise of the LDC Challenge to the International System of Technology Transfer? 446

13 Labour Relations

1 The Evolution of the ILO and OECD Codes 458

2 General Policies of the Codes and Their Relationship to National Laws 459

3 Employment Issues
   3.1 Employment Promotion 462
   3.2 Equality of Opportunity and Treatment 462
   3.3 Security of Employment 464

4 Training of Workers 466

5 Conditions of Work and Life
   5.1 Wages, Benefits and Conditions of Work 467
   5.2 Safety and Health 469

6 Industrial Relations
   6.1 Freedom of Association and the Right to Organize 470
   6.2 Collective Bargaining and Consultation 476
6.3 Examination of Grievances and Settlement of Industrial Disputes 480
7 Concluding Remarks 480

Part III The Emerging System of International Regulation 491

14 Renegotiation and Expropriation 493
1 The Restriction of State Sovereignty in the Field of Contractual Relations with Foreign Investors 493
1.1 The ‘Internationalization’ of International Investment Agreements 494
1.2 Sanctity of Contract and Stabilization Clauses 496
2 Renegotiation of International Investment Agreements 497
3 Expropriation of Foreign Corporate Assets 501
3.1 What Constitutes Expropriation? 501
3.2 The Legality of Expropriatory Measures under the Law of the Host State 502
3.3 The Legality of Expropriation at International Law 503
3.3.1 The conflict of norms in this area 503
3.3.2 The elements of lawful expropriation 504
3.4 The Issue of Compensation 506
3.4.1 The valuation of expropriated property 506
3.4.2 The measure of compensation 511
3.4.3 The settlement of claims through lump sum agreements 513
4 Investment Guarantee Schemes 514
5 Concluding Remarks 519

15 The Settlement of International Investment Disputes 534
1 The Limitations of Traditional International Dispute Settlement Mechanisms in MNE–Host State Relations 534
2 Alternatives to Diplomatic Protection: International Dispute Settlement Mechanisms Involving the MNE and Host State Inter Se 537
2.1 Ad Hoc Arbitration and Conciliation 538
2.2 Institutional Systems for International Dispute Settlement 538
2.3 The Contribution of UNCITRAL 539
3 The International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes

3.1 The Aims of ICSID 541

3.2 The Washington Convention and Its Effect on State Sovereignty over Investment Disputes 542

3.2.1 The Contracting State's ability to control jurisdiction 542

3.2.2 Subject matter jurisdiction 546

3.2.3 The delocalized character of ICSID arbitration 547

3.2.4 The extent to which an unfavourable decision of an ICSID tribunal can be challenged by the losing party 551

3.2.5 Enforcement of ICSID awards 553

3.2.6 Procedure and costs 553

3.3 The Use of the Convention 555

3.3.1 The membership 555

3.3.2 The caseload 556

3.3.3 The use of references to ICSID arbitration in investment agreements and national laws 557

3.4 Conclusion 559

16 The Codification of International Standards for the Treatment of Foreign Investors 573

1 The Andean Common Market (ANCOM) 575

2 The OECD Guidelines on Multinational Enterprises 578

2.1 The Policy of the Guidelines 579

2.2 The Legal Nature of the Guidelines 580

2.3 The Role of International Minimum Standards 580

2.4 The Scope of Application 581

2.5 National Treatment 583

2.6 Dispute Settlement 587

2.7 Substantive Provisions 588

2.8 International Investment Incentives and Disincentives 591

2.9 Concluding Remarks 592

3 The Draft UN Code of Conduct on Transnational Corporations 592

### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 The 1992 World Bank Guidelines</td>
<td>598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 The Standard Setting Provisions of MIGA</td>
<td>602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Bilateral Investment Treaties</td>
<td>617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The Origins of BITs</td>
<td>617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The Principal Provisions Common to BITs</td>
<td>619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Preamble</td>
<td>619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Provisions Defining the Scope of Application of the Treaty</td>
<td>620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Application <em>ratione materiae</em></td>
<td>620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Application <em>ratione personae</em></td>
<td>622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Application <em>ratione territoriae</em></td>
<td>624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4 Application <em>ratione temporis</em></td>
<td>624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Standards of Treatment</td>
<td>625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 General standards of treatment</td>
<td>625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Specific standards of treatment</td>
<td>628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Dispute Settlement Clauses</td>
<td>632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Disputes between the contracting parties</td>
<td>632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Disputes between the host state and the foreign investor</td>
<td>633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The Effect of BITs within the National Legal Systems of the Contracting States</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The Use of BITs</td>
<td>637</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Concluding Remarks: the Effect of BITs on the Content of International Law</td>
<td>638</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index**                                                                 | 649  |