CAN SOCIETY ESCAPE THE NOOSE...?

The Death Penalty in India

CASES, MATERIALS AND OPINION

By

Arunjeev Singh Wallia B.A., LLB, Advocate
Colin Gonsalves B.Eng., LLB, Senior Advocate of the Supreme Court of India
&
Vinay Naidoo B.Sc. (Hons.), G.R.S.C., Cert. (Sorbonne), M.Sc., C.P.E., M.A., B.V.C.
Barrister-at-Law (Gray’s Inn)

The Human Rights Law Network, India
JUNE, 2005
CONTENTS

CONTENTS IN BRIEF viii

PREFACES x
K. G. Kannabiran xiii
Justice Z. M. Yacoob

FOREWORD xvi
Colin Gonsalves xx
About the Book

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS xxii
Contributors xxv
About the editors & principal contributors xxv
Editorial and written contributions xxvii

TABLE OF CASES 11
By Subject 11
By Alphabetical Listing 18

CHAPTER I 23

FIRST WORDS...
By Vinay Naidoo

A CRIMINAL SYSTEM OF INJUSTICE 26

RELIGIOUS VIEWS ON THE DEATH PENALTY 29

BUDDHISM 32
ISLAM 33
CHRISTIANITY 34
HINDUISM 35
SIKHISM 36
JUDAISM 37

EVOLVING STANDARDS OF DECENCY 38

THE THEORIES OF PUNISHMENT AND DETERRENCE 43

A ROUTE TO THE ABOLITION OF THE DEATH PENALTY IN INDIA 46
CHAPTER II

THE LAWS, THE PROCEDURE & PURPOSE OF SENTENCING

I. PROVISIONS OF DIFFERENT INDIAN LAWS IN WHICH THE DEATH SENTENCE MAY BE AWARDED

AIR FORCE ACT, 1950

ARMY ACT, 1950

COMMISSION OF SATI (PREVENTION) ACT, 1987

INDIAN PENAL CODE

NARCOTIC DRUGS AND PSYCHOTROPIC SUBSTANCES ACT, 1985

COMMENT:

THE PREVENTION OF TERRORISM ACT (POTA) AND THE DEATH PENALTY

II: THE PROCEDURE & PURPOSE OF SENTENCING

A. THE PROCEDURE OF SENTENCING

PRE-SENTENCING HEARING: SECTION 235 OF CrPC

NON-COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 235(2), CR.P.C

B. THE PURPOSE OF SENTENCING

CASE LAW

COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 433A

CONSTITUTIONALITY OF SECTION 433-A, IPC

OPINION: ‘Proportionality: Does The Penalty Fit The Offence?’

CHAPTER III

ARTICLES

TREND TOWARDS WORLDWIDE ABOLITION OF THE DEATH PENALTY

By Richard C. Dieter
CONTENTS

TREADING THE PATH TOWARDS ABOLITION OF THE DEATH PENALTY
By Arunjeev Singh Walia 90

PUBLIC OPINION AND THE DEATH PENALTY:
THE ROUTE TO ABOLITION, WHEN THE ROAD IS BLOCKED
By Vinay Naidoo & Lauren Morris 110

JOURNEY TOWARDS HUMANITY
By Asim Sarode 150

Illustrative Table:
Persons Executed from 1950 to 1996

WHEN THE RIGHT TO LIFE IS NOT FULLY PROTECTED, WHAT OTHER RIGHTS SUFFER
THE DEATH PENALTY?
By Daniel Annenberg 153

FOUR MYTHS ON THE DEATH PENALTY
By Kimmo Suominen 159

OPINION: ‘Being “Tough on Crime”: It’s Not Working’
162

Illustrative Tables:
Sample ‘Incidence and Rates’ of Serious Offences, by Country

OPINION: ‘The Death Penalty for Rape: A Populist Slogan’
163

CHAPTER IV

CONSTITUTIONALITY OF THE DEATH SENTENCE

CONSTITUTIONALITY OF THE DEATH SENTENCE: CASE-LAW 166

CONSTITUTIONAL POWERS OF SUPREME COURT OF INDIA 181

CONSTITUTIONAL POWER OF PRESIDENT AND GOVERNOR 182

CONSTITUTIONAL POWERS OF PRESIDENT AND GOVERNOR IN MATTERS
RELATING TO THE DEATH SENTENCE 182

POWERS OF THE PRESIDENT 183

POWERS OF THE GOVERNOR 183

CASE LAW 184
II: REVIEWS

THE SUPREME COURT: REVIEWING ITS OWN JUDGMENT

REVIEW POWERS OF THE SUPREME COURT: CASE LAW

REVIEW POWERS OF THE SUPREME COURT: DECISIONS OF THE GOVERNORS AND THE PRESIDENT

REVIEW POWERS OF THE SUPREME COURT: LIMITS OF DISCRETION TO ACQUIT/PARDON

CHAPTER IX

DIFFERENCE OF JUDICIAL OPINION: SPLIT BENCHES

DIFFERENCE OF JUDICIAL OPINION: SPLIT BENCHES

A WRIT PETITION SEEKING GUIDELINES

DIFFERENCE OF JUDICIAL OPINION: SPLIT BENCHES: CASE-LAW

OPINION: "The Vice of Arbitrariness."

CHAPTER X

RIGHTS OF PRISONER ON DEATH ROW

RIGHTS OF PRISONER ON DEATH ROW

CASE LAW

CHAPTER XI

DELAY IN EXECUTION OF THE DEATH SENTENCE

DELAY IN EXECUTION OF THE DEATH SENTENCE

CASE LAW
CHAPTER XII

METHODS OF EXECUTION

METHODS OF EXECUTION

CASE-LAW

THE LAW COMMISSION

METHODS OF EXECUTION: INTERNATIONAL USAGE BY RETENTIONIST COUNTRIES

OPINION: 'The Troubling Paradox Behind the Use of Electrocution and Lethal Injection.'

CHAPTER XIII

JUVENILES AND THE DEATH PENALTY

I: THE INDIAN POSITION

II: THE INTERNATIONAL POSITION

INTERNATIONAL TREATIES EXCLUDING JUVENILES OFFENDERS FROM THE DEATH SENTENCE

INTERGOVERNMENTAL BODIES, INTERNATIONAL OPINION AND JUDGMENTS

CHAPTER XIV

THE MENTALLY CHALLENGED AND THE DEATH PENALTY

I: THE INTERNATIONAL POSITION

II: THE INDIAN POSITION

CHAPTER XV

INTERNATIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL LAW ON THE DEATH PENALTY, THE INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND THEIR JUDGMENTS

I: INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS ON THE DEATH PENALTY

II: CONSTITUTIONAL LAW ON THE DEATH PENALTY: THE JUDGMENTS OF FOREIGN NATIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL COURTS
CONTENTS

CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF SOUTH AFRICA 746
CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF TANZANIA 756
SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA 757
SUPREME COURT OF BELIZE 761
SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA: Legal Aid 772
Further U.S. Supreme Court Judgments on Ineffective Legal Aid in Death Penalty Matters 790

III: THE INTERNATIONAL COURTS 794
THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE 794
THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS 796
THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM AND THE ORGANISATION OF AMERICAN STATES 798
THE AFRICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES’ RIGHTS 802
THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE 807
THE PRIVY COUCIL 808

IV: THE JUDGMENTS OF THE INTERNATIONAL COURTS 809
THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE 815
THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS 822
THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM AND THE ORGANISATION OF AMERICAN STATES 847
THE AFRICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES’ RIGHTS 863
THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE 865
THE PRIVY COUCIL 868
CHAPTER XVI

THE END OF THE 7 YEAR DE FACTO MORATORIUM:
THE DHANANJOY CHATTERJEE EXECUTION, & BEYOND...

By Vinay Naidoo

ARTICLE:
“DHANANJOY & THE DEATH PENALTY: CAN SOCIETY ESCAPE THE NOOSE...?”

THE LAST WEEK IN A LIFE: THE FINAL DHANANJOY CASE

THE GROUNDS

THE ORDER

EQUALITY BEFORE THE LAW: ARTICLE 14

A DRAFT GROUND

LAST WORDS...

APPENDICES

APPENDIX I
BIBLIOGRAPHY & RESOURCES

APPENDIX II
EXTRACTS FROM INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS PERTAINING TO THE
DEATH PENALTY

APPENDIX III
COUNTRIES THAT HAVE ABOLISHED THE DEATH PENALTY IN LAW
(FOR ALL CRIMES)

COUNTRIES THAT HAVE ABOLISHED THE DEATH PENALTY IN LAW
(FOR ORDINARY CRIMES)

COUNTRIES THAT ARE ABOLISHIONIST IN PRACTICE.

COUNTRIES THAT RETAIN USAGE OF THE DEATH PENALTY, IN LAW & PRACTICE.

APPENDIX IV
USEFUL WEBSITES ON THE DEATH PENALTY

APPENDIX V
QUOTATIONS ON THE DEATH PENALTY