CONCURRENT PROCEEDINGS IN COMPETITION LAW

PROCEDURE, EVIDENCE AND REMEDIES

by

Renato Nazzini

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
CONTENTS—SUMMARY

List of Abbreviations xxvii
Tables of Cases xxix
Tables of Statutes xliii
Table of Statutory Instruments, Rules, and Practice Directions liii
Table of Treaties and Conventions lv
Table of Rules of Arbitration and Articles of the UNCITRAL Model Law lvii

1. Introduction 1

Overview 1
Road Map of the Analysis 2
Static and Dynamic Interactions 5
Administrative and Civil Proceedings 8
Criminal, Administrative, and Civil Proceedings 11
International Commercial Arbitration 12
Tactical Implications of Concurrent Proceedings 14
Leniency 15
Private Enforcement 16

I ANALYSIS OF THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK

2. Concurrent Enforcement of Competition Law 21

Introduction 21
The Changing Legal Landscape 25
Concurrent Enforcement of EC Competition Law 28
Concurrent Enforcement of UK Competition Law 35
Conclusion 40

3. Administrative Proceedings 41

Introduction 42
Proceedings Brought by the Commission 43
Proceedings Brought by the OFT or the Regulators 55
Proceedings by other EU National Competition Authorities 69
## Contents—Summary

| Administrative Investigations in the US | 73 |
| Conclusion | 76 |

### 4. Judicial Proceedings

| Introduction | 77 |
| Civil Proceedings | 79 |
| Directors’ Disqualification | 88 |
| Criminal Proceedings by the Serious Fraud Office (or the OFT) | 90 |
| References to the Court of Justice for Preliminary Rulings | 97 |
| Civil Enforcement in the US | 98 |
| Criminal Proceedings by the US Department of Justice, Antitrust Division | 104 |
| Conclusion | 106 |

### 5. Overview of Relevant Legal Principles

| Introduction | 107 |
| Procedural Autonomy of Member States under Community Law | 108 |
| Inherent Jurisdiction of the English Courts to Regulate Concurrent Proceedings | 110 |
| *Res Judicata* and Abuse of Process | 111 |
| *Ne Bis in Idem* (Double Jeopardy) | 114 |
| Privilege against Self-Incrimination | 124 |
| Public Interest Immunity and Confidence | 132 |
| Conflicting Public Policies and Fair Procedures | 132 |
| Conclusion | 135 |

### II THE INTERPLAY BETWEEN ADMINISTRATIVE, CIVIL, AND CRIMINAL PROCEEDINGS

### 6. Stays

| Introduction | 141 |
| Stays of Civil Proceedings in Community Law | 144 |
| Discretion of the National Courts under Community Law | 154 |
| The Approach of the English Courts | 156 |
| Stays in Proceedings for Breach of UK Competition Law | 165 |
| Monetary Claims before the Competition Appeal Tribunal | 168 |
| Conclusion | 171 |
## Contents—Summary

7. Effect of Administrative Decisions 173
   - Introduction 174
   - Objective Effect of Decisions of the Commission 174
   - Effect of Commission Decisions on Third Parties 185
   - Effect of Judgments of the Community Courts 199
   - Binding Effect of OFT Decisions 200
   - Conclusion 204

8. Disclosure and Admissibility of Evidence 205
   - Introduction 206
   - Use in Further Administrative Proceedings of Information Obtained by the Commission 208
   - Use in Further Administrative Proceedings of Information Obtained by the OFT 221
   - Use in Civil Proceedings of Information Obtained by the Commission 229
   - Use in Civil Proceedings of Information Obtained by the OFT 245
   - Use in Administrative Proceedings of Evidence Disclosed in Civil Proceedings 264
   - Conclusion 278

9. Criminalization of Cartels 283
   - Introduction 284
   - Cartel Offence and Concurrent Proceedings 285
   - Criminal and Civil Proceedings 287
   - UK Administrative and Criminal Proceedings: Stays 295
   - UK Administrative and Criminal Proceedings: Evidence 296
   - Relationship with EC Enforcement 304
   - Privilege against Self-Incrimination in Commission Proceedings 308
   - Admissibility of Evidence Obtained in Commission Proceedings 312
   - Conclusion 319

III INTERNATIONAL COMMERCIAL ARBITRATION

10. Arbitration of Competition Law Disputes in the EU and the US 325
    - Introduction 325
    - Arbitrability of Competition Law Disputes 326
    - Commercial Arbitration under Community Law 329
    - Application of EC Competition Law by Arbitral Tribunals 334
    - Arbitration of Competition Law Disputes in the US 343
    - Conclusion 347
11. Arbitration and Concurrent Proceedings

   Introduction 349
   Three-Dimensional Framework Analysis 351
   Stays 356
   Evidence 363
   Effect of Administrative Decisions 369
   Arbitration and Criminal Proceedings 371
   Conclusion 373

IV STRATEGY AND TACTICS IN CONCURRENT PROCEEDINGS

12. Tactical Implications of Concurrent Proceedings 379

   Introduction 379
   Attack Tactics 381
   Defence Tactics 392
   Conflicts of Interests between Companies and Individuals 399
   Conclusion 405

13. Leniency and Concurrency 407

   Introduction 407
   The 2002 Commission Leniency Notice 410
   The OFT Leniency Guidelines 411
   No-Action Letters in England, Wales, and Northern Ireland 414
   The US Department of Justice, Antitrust Division Leniency Policies for Companies and Individuals 415
   Timeliness of the Leniency Application 417
   Consequences of Leniency Applications in Civil Proceedings 420
   Dealing with Leniency Applications: New Skills for Legal Advisers in International Cartel Cases 422
   Conclusion 426

V CONCLUDING REMARKS

14. General Conclusions 431

   Introduction 431
   Stays 432
   Binding Effect of Administrative Decisions 435
   Disclosure and Admissibility of Evidence 436
   Implications of Reforms in the EU and the UK: A 'Sea Change' in the Enforcement of Competition Law? 438
Appendix 1: Commission Notice on Cooperation within the Network of Competition Authorities 441

Appendix 2: Commission Notice on the Co-operation between the Commission and the Courts of the EU Member States on the Application of Articles 81 and 82 EC 455

Appendix 3: OFT Guidance on Powers for Investigating Criminal Cartels 465

Bibliography 479

Index 485