State Failure, Sovereignty and Effectiveness

Legal Lessons from the Decolonization of Sub-Saharan Africa

by

GERARD KREIJEN

with a Foreword by

SIR ROBERT Y. JENNINGS, CBE, QC

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN / BOSTON
CONTENTS

FOREWORD by Sir Robert Jennings vii

INTRODUCTION 1

2 ON THE STATE AND STATE FAILURE 7

1. Introduction 7
2. The State in International law 8
   2.1. Introduction 8
   2.2. The State within the International Legal Order 8
   2.3. Statehood and Legal Personality 11
   2.4. Recognition 13
      2.4.1. The Declaratory and Constitutive Schools of Recognition 15
   2.5. The Criteria for Statehood 18
      2.5.1. The Classical Criteria 18
         (i) Permanent Population 19
         (ii) Defined Territory 19
         (iii) Government 20
         (iv) The Capacity to Enter into Relations: Independence 21
      2.5.2. Additional Criteria 23
   2.6. The Principle of Effectiveness: Some Preliminary Comments 25
2.7. Sovereignty 26
   2.7.1. A Brief Etymology 27
   2.7.2. Some Basic Features of the Modern Concept 28
   2.7.3. A Multi-faceted Concept: Relevant Facets 29
   2.7.4. The Watershed between Traditional and Modern Doctrine 33
2.8. Application of the Criteria for Statehood: Questions of Continuity and Extinction 34
3. The Sociological and the Normative Conception of the State 38
   3.1. Introduction 38
   3.2. The Unity between Reality and Ideas 42
   3.3. The Sociological Conception of the State 44
   3.4. The Normative Conception of the State 46
   3.5. The Empirical and the Juridical in Statehood 49
   3.6. Legal-Formalism 53
   3.7. Kelsen’s Legal-Formalism 55
   3.8. State Failure as a Test for the Authenticity of Values 57
4. State Failure 64
   4.1. Introduction 64
   4.2. Somalia 66
THE ABANDONMENT OF EFFECTIVENESS 171

1. Introduction 171

2. The Swing of the Pendulum 172

3. Dissolving the Unity between Reality and Ideas 178
   3.1. Introduction 178
   3.2. Effectiveness in International Law: General Discussion 179
      3.2.1. The Unstätitchkeit of the International Legal Order and the besondere Wirklichkeitsnähe of International Law 179
      3.2.2. The Duality of Effectiveness 189
      3.2.3. Effectiveness and Power 192
      3.2.4. Effectiveness and Recognition 201
      3.2.5. Effectiveness and Responsibility 203

4. Effectiveness and the Unity between Reality and Ideas 207
   4.1. The Inevitable Relationship between the ‘Is’ and the ‘Ought’ 207
   4.2. The Relationship between the ‘Is’ and the ‘Ought’ as an Expression of the Unity between Reality and Ideas 209
   4.3. Effectiveness: The Unifying Factor 210
   4.4. Unexpected Support: Kelsen’s Normative Theory 211
      4.4.1. Kelsen and the Principle of Effectiveness 212
      4.4.2. ‘The World of the “Ought” Remains a Mystery’ 222
      4.4.3. National Courts and Revolutionary Change of the Basic Norm 225

5. Statehood, State Failure, and the Abandonment of Effectiveness 230
   5.1. Introduction 230
   5.2. Level One: The State as an Expression of Positive International Law 232
   5.3. Level Two: The State as the Enforcer of International Law 233
   5.4. Linking Levels One and Two 236

SOME ILLUSTRATIONS OF THE CONSEQUENCES OF INHERENT WEAKNESS 237

1. Introduction 237

2. How Weak States Fail 238
   2.1. Compensating for a Lack of Substance by Stressing Form 238
   2.2. Sørensen’s Insecurity Containers 242
      2.2.1. Introduction 243
      2.2.2. The Interplay between the Internal and the External 244
      2.2.3. The Herz-Hobbesian Security Dilemma 247
   2.3. From Weak Statehood to State Failure 252
   2.4. The Failure to Respond 258

3. The Evasion of the Normative Character of International Law 262
   3.1. State Failure as a Threat to International Constitutionalism 263
   3.2. The Erosion of Accountability 266
      3.2.1. The Setting 267
      3.2.2. The Central Argument 269
3.2.3. The Irresponsibility of the Failed State 270
   (i) The Draft Articles on State Responsibility: Some General Remarks 271
   (ii) The Problem of Attribution 273
   (iii) Material Impossibility 282
3.3. The Cascading of Responsibility 289
4. Some Additional Observations 291

6 A LITTLE ORDER 295
1. Introduction 295
2. Restoring the Unity between Reality and Ideas 296
   2.1. A Brief Note of Pessimism 296
   2.2. Outlining the Foundations 297
   2.3. Some Non-viable Options 301
      2.3.1. Humanitarian Intervention 301
      2.3.2. Allowing Secession 302
      2.3.3. Giving War a Chance 304
3. Reviving the UN Trusteeship System for Failed States 308
   3.1. Trust: Some General Observations 308
   3.2. International Trusteeship 310
      3.2.1. The Mandates System of the League of Nations 311
      3.2.2. The International Trusteeship System of the UN 312
      3.2.3. International Territorial Administration 318
   3.3. Some Tentative Considerations on a UN Trusteeship for Failed States 322
      3.3.1. Why a UN Trusteeship May Work 323
      3.3.2. Why a UN Trusteeship May Not Work 324
      3.3.3. The Main Legal Obstacles and the Requirement of Consent 326
4. Withdrawal of Recognition 329
   4.1. Introduction 329
   4.2. The Case of Somalia 331
   4.3. The Absence of Government 334
   4.4. Withdrawal of Recognition in International Law 338
      4.4.1. Withdrawal of Recognition: General Considerations 339
      4.4.2. An Inquiry into Legal Doctrine 340
      4.4.3. Withdrawal of Recognition: Additional Considerations 349
         (i) Effect and Nature of the Act of Withdrawal 349
         (ii) Individual or Collective Withdrawal of Recognition? 352
   4.5. Withdrawing Recognition from Somalia: A Hypothetical Case 353
      4.5.1. The Somali Paradox 353
      4.5.2. The Advantages and Disadvantages of Withdrawal: Some Tentative
             Considerations 356
      4.5.3. Putting Things into Perspective 360
5. Self-Determination: The Final Hurdle 363
7 CONCLUSIONS

1. The Decolonization of Sub-Saharan Africa 367
2. Recognition 368
3. Sovereignty 369
4. Effectiveness 371
5. State Failure 374
   5.1. How It Came About 374
   5.2. What It Essentially Is 375
   5.3. What Can Be Done About It? 376
6. The General Perspective: Why Hobbes was Right 377

INDEX 385