Hindu Law
Beyond Tradition and Modernity

Werner Menski
# Contents

*Abbreviations*  
*Preface*

## Part I

**Historical and Conceptual Background**

1. Introduction  
   - Tradition and Modernity in Hindu Law 3  
   - Towards a Postmodern Legal Analysis 11  
   - Hindu Law Beyond Tradition and Modernity 22  
   - The Structure of the Study 29

2. Rising from the Ashes: Postmodern Hindu Law  
   - The Perceived Decline of Hindu Law and its Postmodern Reincarnation 38  
   - The Key Arguments of the Study 49  
   - Moving Towards a Postmodern Condition of Legal Regulation 59

3. Antecedents and Concepts of Traditional Hindu Law  
   - Theoretical Considerations: Orientalist Constructions of Hindu Law 72  
   - Analysing Hindu Legal History 77  
   - The Concept of Cosmic Order (*ṛta*) in Pre-classical Vedic Law 86  
   - Dharma and Classical Hindu Law 94  
   - Assisted Self-control and *danda* in Late Classical Hindu Law 107
CONTENTS

Vyavahāra and Informal Dispute Settlement  112
The Role of Custom in Classical Hindu Law  121

4. The Post-classical Evolution of
Hindu Law and its Colonial Distortions  131

Post-classical Commentaries and Digests  132
Methodological Strategies to Harmonize
Texts and Customs  136
Medieval Texts and their Purported Secularization  146
Medieval Hindu Law under Muslim Rule  152
The Impact of British Legal Administration  156
The Emergence of Anglo-Hindu Law  163

5. Origins of Modernity in Hindu Law:
Emerging Discourses on Reforms
and Codification  186

Debating Modernity: Legal and
Ideological Challenges of Reform  186
Early Colonial Debates on Codification
and Hindu Law Reform  196
Late Colonial Reform Debates:
The Role of the Hindu Elite  204

6. Contesting Modernity:
Post-colonial Evolution of Hindu Law  209

The Modernizing Process of Hindu Law  209
Setting the Debate for Reforms: The 1950s  212
The Onset of Realism: The 1960s  224
Legislative Counter-move:
Reforms of the 1970s  234

7. Transcending Modernity:
The Postmodern Reconstruction
of Hindu Law  244

The Re-indigenization of Hindu Law:
Statutory Precursors  245
Origins of Postmodernity:
Judicial Reconstructions  246
CONTENTS

An Evolving Postmodern Condition:
Constitutional Reawakening 258
The Blossoming of Postmodernity 265

PART II
SUBSTANTIVE HINDU LAW BEYOND
TRADITION AND MODERNITY

8. Hindu Marriage Law 273
The Traditional Hindu Law of Marriage 274
Conceptual Core: Unity in Diversity 276
The Socio-legal Status of Marriage
as a Sacrament 278
Deconstructing Modernist Misconceptions 284
Hindu Marriage Law under British Rule 288
Modernist Reforms to Hindu Marriage Law 292
Modernist Agenda and their Problems 294
Limits of State Law and the Modernist Discourse 297
Contesting Modernity in the Courts 302
Postmodern Evolution of Hindu Marriage Law 306
Towards a Postmodern Discourse 307
An Emerging Postmodern Condition:
Case Law Evidence 315

9. Child Marriage 322
Child Marriage in Traditional Hindu Law 326
Colonial Efforts to Curtail Child Marriages 334
The Emergence of Social Activism 335
Colonial Intervention in Early Marriages 336
The Inefficient Restraint of Child Marriages 339
Child Marriage in Independent India 345
New Statutory Reforms 346
Perceptions of Social Change 350
Reforms of the 1970s 354
Case Law on Child Marriages:
Towards Postmodernity 358
The Postmodern Condition of
Child Marriage Law 365
Social Awareness in the Most Recent Case Law 367
Postmodern Reflections 370

10. Polygamy 374

Traditional Hindu Law on Polygamy 377
Hindu Polygamy under British Rule 383
The Modernist Abolition of Hindu Polygamy 387
Reformist Agenda 387
Statutory Regulation of Hindu Polygamy 389
The Deficient Penalization of Hindu Polygamy 392
The Postmodern Scenario 406
Continuing Modernist Demands for Reform 407
Surrogate Debates on Muslims and
Legal Uniformity 411
Limits of Modernist Intervention 417

11. Divorce 427

Traditional Hindu Concepts of Divorce 430
Reforms During the British Period 438
Modernist Divorce Reforms in
Independent India 442
The Hidden Agenda of Hindu Divorce Reforms 443
Modernist Representations of
the Statutory Scheme 449
The Reforms of the 1970s:
Pushing the Limits 455
Postmodern Hindu Divorce Law 463
Backlash Phenomena:
Refusing to Legislate Further 464
Modernist Despair and Postmodern Inklings 468
The Psycho-social Basis of
Postmodern Hindu Divorce Law 471
Postmodern Judicial Activism in Divorce Law 477

12. Maintenance Law 484

The Traditional Protective Framework 487
The Lull of the British Period 500
Maintenance Law in Modern India 504
Modernist Arguments for Law Reform 505
Legal Reforms of Hindu Maintenance Law 508
Secular Reinforcement:
The Criminal Procedure Code 518

The Postmodern Condition of
Maintenance Law 523
Modernist Critiques of Maintenance Law 524
Postmodernity in Judicial Social Engineering 535

PART III
CONCLUDING ANALYSIS

13. Postmodernity and Beyond 545

Transcending Tradition and
Modernity in Hindu Law 547
Postmodernity in India’s Legal System 557
Postmodern Hindu Law as
Non-western Model Jurisprudence 569
Deconstructing Modernist Discourses of
Non-western Laws 576
Postmodernist Challenges to the Concept of Law 585
Hindu Law, Postmodernity, and Globalization 591

Table of Cases 599
List of Statutes 605
Bibliography 610
Index 640