METHODS OF RESOLVING
CONFLICTS BETWEEN TREATIES

Seyed Ali SADAT-AKHAVI

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN / BOSTON
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART ONE</strong></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PRELIMINARY OBSERVATIONS</strong></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER ONE</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>THE CONCEPT OF 'CONFLICT'</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Definition of Conflict</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Causes of Conflict</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Same Act Is Subject to Different Types of Norms</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. One Norm Requires an Act, While the Other Norm Requires or Permits a 'Contrary' Act</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. One Norm Prohibits a 'Necessary Precondition' of Another Norm</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. One Norm Prohibits a 'Necessary Consequence' of Another Norm</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Types of Conflict</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. 'Partial' and 'Total' Conflicts</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. 'Bipartite' and 'Multipartite' Conflicts</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. 'Supervening' and 'Constant' Conflicts</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Schematic Representation of Conflicting Norms</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Constituent Elements of the Diagrams</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Diagrams Representing Conflicting Norms</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Identical subjects</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. One subject is more general</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Overlapping Subjects</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Disjoint Subjects</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Summary</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER TWO
ASCERTAINING THE EXISTENCE OF CONFLICT:
REAL AND FALSE CONFLICTS

I. Interpretation of Norms
1. Interpretation as a Means of Ascertaining the Existence of a Conflict
2. Some Problems of the Interpretation of Norms
   A. Norms Having an ‘Implied’ Meaning
   B. The Meaning of the Term ‘Right’
II. Reconciliation of Norms
1. The Concept of ‘Reconciliation’
2. Some Instances of Reconcilable Norms
   A. Concurrent Permissive Norms Can Never Conflict
   B. Two Norms May Have ‘Canceling’ Effect without Being Conflicting
   C. One Norm May Relate to the ‘Manner’ in Which the Other Norm Must Be
      Performed
III. Summary

PART TWO
RULES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW FOR RESOLVING CONFLICTS

CHAPTER THREE
CONVENTIONAL LAW

I. The System of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
1. One Treaty Affects the ‘Existence’ of the Other Treaty
   A. Termination of the Earlier Treaty
   B. One Treaty Invalidates the Other Treaty
2. Both Treaties Are in Force
   A. Amendment of Treaties
   B. Modification of Treaties
   C. Successive Treaties Relating to the Same Subject-Matter
      (i) The Pre-Eminence of the Charter of the United Nations
      (ii) Conflict-Resolving Clauses
      (iii) Rules for Resolving Conflicts
         (a) The Later Treaty Includes All the Parties to the Earlier Treaty
         (b) The Later Treaty Does Not Include All the Parties to the
             Earlier Treaty
         (c) The Question of the Validity of the Later Treaty
(iv) The Critiques of the Vienna Convention
   (a) It Does Not Address the Question of Conflicting Obligations towards Different States 70
   (b) Problem of Determining the 'Later' Treaty 75
   (c) It Does Not Take Account of the Position of Regional Treaties 81
   (d) It Does Not Take Account of Treaties Containing Obligations *gera omnes* 82
   (e) The Ambiguity of the Term 'Treaty' in the Context of Article 30 83

II. Specific Treaty Clauses Aiming at Resolving Conflicts 84
   1. Definition of Conflict-Resolving Clauses 84
   2. Types of Conflict-Resolving Clauses 87
      A. Clauses Giving Priority to the Treaty in Which They Are Incorporated 87
         (i) Priority over Existing Treaties 87
         (ii) Priority over Future Treaties 88
         (iii) Priority over Both Existing and Future Treaties 90
      B. Clauses Giving Priority to Other Treaties 92
         (i) Priority of Existing Treaties 92
         (ii) Priority of Future Treaties 93
         (iii) Priority of Both Existing and Future Treaties 94
   3. The Problem of Concurrence between Conflict-Resolving Clauses 96

CHAPTER FOUR
CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW 99

I. State Practice as Reflected in Decisions of National Courts and Governmental Documents 99
   1. Priority of the Later Treaty over the Earlier One 100
   2. Priority of the Special Treaty over the General One 101
   3. The Hierarchy between Norms 103
   4. Priority of the 'Principal' Treaty over the Treaty 'Implementing' It 103
   5. Denunciation of Existing Treaties as Means of Avoiding Conflict 104
   6. Priority of the 'More Favorable Provision' in the Field of the Protection of Human Rights 105
   7. The Principle of 'Legislative Intent' 105
   8. The Principle of 'Maximum Effectiveness' 105

II. Treaty Practice of States 108
   1. Conflict between Universal Treaties 109
      A. Universal Treaties Having the Same Scope 109
         (i) Priority of the Later Treaty 109
         (ii) Priority of the Earlier Treaty 111
Table of Contents

B. The Scope of One Treaty Is Special 114
   (i) The Special Treaty Is Later in Time 114
   (ii) The General Treaty Is Later in Time 120
C. Universal Treaties Which Are Partially Overlapping in Scope 134
   (i) Priority of Earlier Treaties 134
   (ii) Priority of the Later Treaty 140
2. Conflict between Universal and Closed Treaties 142
   A. A Universal Treaty Follows a Closed Treaty 142
      (i) Priority of Earlier Closed Treaties 142
      (ii) Priority of the Universal Treaty 148
   B. Closed Treaties Which Are Later in Time: The Problem of \textit{inter se} Agreements 152
   C. Priority of the 'More Favorable' Treaty 163
      (i) Protection of Human Rights 163
      (ii) Protection of the Environment 163
      (iii) Protection of Intellectual Property Rights 164
      (iv) Protection of Cultural Property 167
   D. Priority of the 'More Effective' Treaty 168
      (i) Treaties on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Judgments and Arbitral Awards 168
      (ii) Treaties on Dispute Settlement 168
      (iii) Treaties on Judicial Cooperation 168
3. Conflict between Closed Treaties 170
   A. Conflict between Regional Treaties 170
      (i) Regional Treaties Having the Same Scope 170
      (ii) The Scope of One Treaty Is Special 171
      (iii) Regional Treaties Whose Scopes Partially Overlap 172
   B. Conflict between Regional and Bilateral /Sub-Regional Treaties 175
      (i) The Regional Treaty Is Later in Time 175
      (ii) Subsequent Bilateral / Sub-Regional Treaties: The Problem of \textit{inter se} Agreements 181
      (iii) Priority of the 'More Effective' Treaty 184
4. Concluding Remarks Concerning Treaty Practice of States 186
CHAPTER FIVE
OTHER SOURCES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW 189

I. General Principles of Law 189
II. Decisions of International Tribunals 191
   1. The Oscar Chinn Case 191
   2. European Commission of the Danube Case 193
   3. The Mavrommatis Palestine Concessions Case 194
   4. The Electricity Company of Sofia and Bulgaria Case 195

PART THREE
THE PROCESS OF RESOLVING CONFLICTS 197

CHAPTER SIX
DIFFERENT STAGES OF CONFLICT RESOLUTION 199

I. Ascertaining the Existence of a Conflict 199
II. Searching for Applicable Conventional Rules 204
III. Ascertaining the Intention of the Parties Not Specified in the Treaty 205
   1. Intention Expressed in the Course of travaux préparatoires 206
   2. Intention Expressed after the Adoption of the Treaty 208
IV. Resolving Conflicts in the Absence of Any Indications on the Intention of the Parties 210
V. Conclusions 212

CHAPTER SEVEN
SPECIAL RULES ADVANCED FOR RESOLVING CONFLICTS BETWEEN CERTAIN TYPES OF TREATIES 213

I. The Principle of the 'More Favorable' Provision in the Field of Human Rights 213
   1. The Scope of the Principle 216
   2. Exceptions to the Principle 220
      A. Discrimination 220
      B. Interests of the Society 222
   3. The Effect of an Express Provision Limiting or Not Recognizing a Specific Right Guaranteed under a Prior Instrument 224
   4. The Impact of the Multiplicity of Control Organs 227
   5. Implications of the Principle for States 231
Table of Contents

II. The Principle of Cumulative Application of Instruments on Dispute Settlement 232
   1. Concurrent Instruments Relating to the Jurisdiction of the Same Body 233
   2. Concurrent Instruments Relating to the Jurisdiction of Different Bodies 236
      A. The Existence of a Clause Regulating the Relationship between the Procedure Established by One Instrument and Other Procedures 236
      B. The Absence of a Treaty Clause Regulating the Relationship between Concurrent Procedures for Dispute Settlement 238

III. The Principle of ‘Maximum Effectiveness’ in the Field of Private Law 240

IV. The Principle of the Priority of Treaties Relating to ‘Special Matters’ 244

CONCLUSIONS 249

BIBLIOGRAPHY 251