EUCOTAX Series on European Taxation

The Principle of Equality in European Taxation

Editor

Gerard TK Meussen
CONTENTS

Preface xi
About the Authors and Editors xiii
List of Abbreviations xv
Table of Cases xvii
Table of Treaties and Constitutions xxvii

1. General Introduction
   Hans Gribnau

   1. Introduction 1
   2. Taxation and equality in a historical perspective 3
   3. The rule of law 6
   4. Democracy 8
   5. Constitutional democracy 10
   6. The rule of legislature? 12
   7. The changing position of the law 14
   8. The judiciary comes to the rescue 18
   9. A value-oriented theory of law 20
   10. Principles as the normative core of law 21
   11. Checks and balances in law making 23
   12. Balancing powers and principles 25
   13. From theory to practice 26
   14. The principle of equality in constitutions and international treaties 27
   15. Constitution or international treaty? 29
   16. The equality principle as methodological instrument 31
   17. Conclusion 32

2. Austria
   Karl Korinek and Michael Holoubek

   1. Introduction 35
   2. The development of the Constitutional Court’s rulings on the principle of equality 36
   3. “Localising a violation” of the principle of equality 41
   4. Procedure for reviewing laws as to their compliance with the principle of equality 43
      4.1 Establishing a “discrimination” 43
      4.2 Review of “objective justification” 44
         4.2.1 Existence of a “reasonable ground” 44
The Principle of Equality in European Taxation

4.2.2 The principle of proportionality 47

5. Conclusion 49

3. Belgium 51
Stefaan van Crombrugge

1. Introduction 51
2. The influence of Article 14 of the ECHR and Article 26 of the ICCPR on Belgian law 53
3. The determination of categories of persons 54
   3.1 The introduction of a specific tax 55
      3.1.1 Non-recurrent contribution borne by companies 56
      3.1.2 Flemish levy on discharging cooling water 57
      3.1.3 Brussels levy on immovable property 57
      3.1.4 Levy borne by chemists 58
      3.1.5 Anti-pollution taxes 58
   3.2 Differentiation within one and the same tax 59
      3.2.1 Objective criterion 60
      3.2.2 Reasonable justification 60
4. The role of the comparability investigation 66
   4.1 Incomparability to justify differentiation 68
   4.2 Homogeneity of the categories 69
   4.3 Proportionality 70
5. Determining proportionality 71
6. Conclusion 72

4. France 75
Philippe Marchessou

1. Introduction 75
2. A time-honoured assertion of the principle of equality in the constitutional texts 75
   2.1 The affirmation of the principle of equality in the French constitutional texts 76
   2.2 The affirmation of the principle of equality in tax matters in the French constitutional texts 76
3. The protection of the principle of equality in tax matters as guaranteed by the Conseil constitutionnel and the Conseil d'Etat 77
   3.1 The Conseil constitutionnel as censor of the tax statute 77
   3.2 The scope of the principle of equality 78
      3.2.1 Equality before the law 78
      3.2.2 Equality concerning public expenses 79
      3.2.3 Equality in tax matters 79
      3.2.4 Equality between taxpayers 81
3.3 The possibility of discrimination justified by the need to fight tax evasion 82
4. The Conseil d'Etat: a censor of the regulations 82
  4.1 Moderate use of the principle of equality 83
  4.2 Beyond an isolated appraisal of each tax 84
5. The possibility for a taxpayer to invoke the equality principle in his or her tax trial 85
  5.1 Adjustment proceeding from a discriminatory interpretation of the law 85
  5.2 Adjustment as the end-product of a discriminatory tax law 87
6. Conclusion 88

5. Germany 89
Klaus Vogel and Christian Waldhoff

1. Introduction 89
2. Federal Constitutional Court decisions on tax equality 90
  2.1 Ruling on the joint assessment of spouses 91
  2.2 Ruling on tax deduction for a contribution to a political party 92
  2.3 Ruling on the mutual effect of child support payments and fiscal capability 96
  2.4 Ruling on the basic tax-free allowance 97
  2.5 Ruling on taxation according to assessed value in net-wealth tax 98
3. Constitutional taxation equality as encumbrance according to the ability to pay 99
  3.1 The four roots of the principle of ability to pay in the Basic Law 100
  3.2 Application of the principle of the ability to pay 106
  3.3 The problem of equality in the constitutionality of taxation law 109
  3.4 The expression of tax fairness 110
4. Conclusion 114

6. Italy 115
Adriano Di Pietro

1. The principle of equality in the tax field 115
2. The principle of non-discrimination in tax law 118
3. The non-discrimination principle in tax law: the case law of the Corte Costituzionale 120
4. Conclusion 123
The Principle of Equality in European Taxation

7. The Netherlands
Richard Happé

1. Introduction 125
2. The principle of equality and testing of Acts of Parliament 126
   2.1 The principle of equality: a fundamental principle in the Dutch legal order 127
   2.2 Article 26 of the ICCPR 130
   2.3 Restricted meaning of Article 14 of the ECHR for Dutch tax law 131
3. The Supreme Court’s method of judicial interpretation in judging an alleged violation of the principle of equality 134
   3.1 Unequal treatment of similar cases 134
      3.1.1 Brief sketch of the Dentist’s Wife case 136
      3.1.2 Legislator’s margin of appreciation 137
      3.1.3 First requirement: unequal treatment of equal cases 138
      3.1.4 Second requirement: the absence of a reasonable and objective ground for unequal treatment 139
   3.2 Unequal treatment of unequal cases 142
   3.3 Indirect discrimination 143
4. The Supreme Court’s task with respect to the unjustified unequal treatment of equal cases 144
   4.1 The Court does not apply the statutory regulation 145
   4.2 The Court applies the statutory regulation in conformity with the treaty 146
   4.3 The Court does not do anything, because a choice has to be made that goes beyond its task of developing the law 147
   4.4 A special case of relatively direct effect: the Court leaves the violation of the principle of equality undecided 149
5. An assessment of 10 years of case law on the basis of the principle of equality 151
6. Conclusion 154

8. Spain
Tulio Rosembuj

1 Introduction 157
2. Constitutional doctrine 158
   2.1 The power to levy taxes 158
   2.2 Equality in the application of the law 159
   2.3 Protection of equality 160
   2.4 The principle of progressiveness 161
3. Conclusions 163
Contents

9. United Kingdom 165
   Philip Baker

Conclusion 169
   Gerard Meussen

1. Written constitution and the principle of equality 169
2. The constitutional courts in Europe 169
3. Absence of a constitutional court in the Netherlands and the United Kingdom 170
4. A constitutional principle of equality 171
5. European Court of Human Rights case law 172
6. Application of the principle of equality in taxation 173
7. Conclusion 174

Appendix I: Survey of Treaties and Constitutions 175

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 175
European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 176
Constitutions:
   Austria 177
   Belgium 177
   France 178
   Germany 181
   Italy 187
   The Netherlands 187
   Spain 188

Appendix II: Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights 191

Tyrer 191
Gillow 203
Inze 224
Darby 239
Henrich v. France 247
Karlheinz Schmidt v. Germany 265

Index 273