# Contents

Chapter 1:  
Defining and Revising the Structure of Evolutionary Theory  

Part I, Chapters 2–7  
The History of Darwinian Logic and Debate  
Segue to Part II  

Part II, Chapters 8–12  
Towards a Revised and Expanded Evolutionary Theory  

Bibliography  
Illustration Credits  
Index  

1  
91  
585  
593  
1344  
1388  
1393
Expanded Contents

Chapter 1: Defining and Revising the Structure of Evolutionary Theory

• Theories Need Both Essences and Histories 1
• The Structure of Evolutionary Theory: Revising the Three Central Features of Darwinian Logic 12
• Apologia Pro Vita Sua 24
  A Time to Keep 24
  A Personal Odyssey 33
• Epitomes for a Long Development 48
  Levels of Potential Originality 48
  An Abstract of One Long Argument 53

Part I: The History of Darwinian Logic and Debate

Chapter 2: The Essence of Darwinism and the Basis of Modern Orthodoxy: An Exegesis of the Origin of Species 93

• A Revolution in the Small 93
• Darwin as a Historical Methodologist 97
  One Long Argument 97
  The Problem of History 99
  A Fourfold Continuum of Methods for the Inference of History 103
• Darwin as a Philosophical Revolutionary 116
  The Causes of Nature's Harmony 116
  Darwin and William Paley 116
  Darwin and Adam Smith 121
  The First Theme: The Organism as the Agent of Selection 125
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Second Theme: Natural Selection as a Creative Force</th>
<th>137</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Requirements for Variation</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copious</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undirected</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gradualism</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Adaptationist Program</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Third Theme: The Uniformitarian Need to Extrapolate: Environment as Enabler of Change</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Judgments of Importance | 163

**Chapter 3: Seeds of Hierarchy** | 170
- Lamarck and the Birth of Modern Evolutionism in Two-Factor Theories | 170
  - The Myths of Lamarck | 170
  - Lamarck as a Source | 174
  - Lamarck's Two-Factor Theory: Sources for the Two Parts | 175
    - The First Set: Environment and Adaptation | 176
    - The Second Set: Progress and Taxonomy | 179
    - Distinctness of the Two Sets | 181
  - Lamarck's Two-Factor Theory: The Hierarchy of Progress and Deviation | 175
  - Antinomies of the Two-Factor Theory | 189
- An Interlude on Darwin's Reaction | 192
- *No Allmacht* without Hierarchy: Weissman on Germinal Selection | 197
  - The *Allmacht* of Selection | 197
  - Weismann's Argument on Lamarck and the *Allmacht* of Selection | 201
  - The Problem of Degeneration and Weismann's Impetus for Germinal Selection | 203
  - Some Antecedents to Hierarchy in German Evolutionary Thought | 208
    - Haeckel's Descriptive Hierarchy in Levels of Organization | 208
    - Roux's Theory of Intracorporeal Struggle | 210
    - Germinal Selection as a Helpmate to Personal Selection | 214
    - Germinal Selection as a Full Theory of Hierarchy | 219
- Hints of Hierarchy in Supraorganismal Selection: Darwin on the Principle of Divergence | 224
  - Divergence and the Completion of Darwin's System | 224
  - The Genesis of Divergence | 232
Contents

Divergence as a Consequence of Natural Selection 234
The Failure of Darwin's Argument and the Need for Species Selection 236
The Causes of Trends 240
Species Selection Based on Propensity for Extinction 246
Postscript: Solution to the Problem of the "Delicate Arrangement" 248

• Coda 249

Chapter 4: Internalism and Laws of Form: Pre-Darwinian Alternatives to Functionalism 251

• Prologue: Darwin's Fateful Decision 251

• Two Ways to Glorify God in Nature 260
  William Paley and British Functionalism: Praising God in the Details of Design 262
  Louis Agassiz and Continental Formalism: Praising God in the Grandeur of Taxonomic Order 271
  An Epilog on the Dichotomy 278

• Unity of Plan as the Strongest Version of Formalism: The Pre-Darwinian Debate 281
  Mehr Licht on Goethe's Leaf 281
  Geoffroy and Cuvier 291
  Cuvier and Conditions of Existence 291
  Geoffroy's Formalist Vision 298
  The Debate of 1830: Foreplay and Aftermath 304

Richard Owen and English Formalism:
  The Archetype of Vertebrates 312
  No Formalism Please, We're British 312
  The Vertebrate Archetype: Constraint and Nonadaptation 316
  Owen and Darwin 326

• Darwin's Strong but Limited Interest in Structural Constraint 330
  Darwin's Debt to Both Poles of the Dichotomy 330
  Darwin on Correlation of Parts 332
  The "Quite Subordinate Position" of Constraint to Selection 339

Chapter 5: The Fruitful Facets of Galton's Polyhedron: Channels and Saltations in Post-Darwinian Formalism 342

• Galton's Polyhedron 342
Orthogenesis as a Theory of Channels and One-Way Streets: the Marginalization of Darwinism 351
Misconceptions and Relative Frequencies 351
Theodor Eimer and the Ohnmacht of Selection 355
Alpheus Hyatt: An Orthogenetic Hard Line from the World of Mollusks 365
C.O. Whitman: An Orthogenetic Dove in Darwin's World of Pigeons 383

Saltation as a Theory of Internal Impetus: A Second Formalist Strategy for Pushing Darwinism to a Causal Periphery 396
William Bateson: The Documentation of Inherent Discontinuity 396
Hugo de Vries: A Most Reluctant Non-Darwinian 415
Dousing the Great Party of 1909 415
The (Not So Contradictory) Sources of the Mutation Theory 418
The Mutation Theory: Origin and Central Tenets 425
Darwinism and the Mutation Theory 439
Confusing Rhetoric and the Personal Factor 439
The Logic of Darwinism and Its Different Place in de Vries' System 443
De Vries on Macroevolution 446
Richard Goldschmidt's Appropriate Role as a Formalist Embodiment of All that Pure Darwinism Must Oppose 451

Chapter 6: Pattern and Progress on the Geological Stage 467
Darwin and the Fruits of Biotic Competition 467
A Geological License for Progress 467
The Predominance of Biotic Competition and Its Sequelae 470
Uniformity on the Geological Stage 479
Lyell's Victory in Fact and Rhetoric 479
Catastrophism as Good Science: Cuvier's Essay 484
Darwin's Geological Need and Kelvin's Odious Spectre 492
A Question of Time (Too Little Geology) 496
A Question of Direction (Too Much Geology) 497

Chapter 7: The Modern Synthesis as a Limited Consensus 503
Why Synthesis? 503
Synthesis as Restriction 505
The Initial Goal of Rejecting Old Alternatives 505
Contents

R. A. Fisher and the Darwinian Core 508
J. B. S. Haldane and the Initial Pluralism of the Synthesis 514
J. S. Huxley: Pluralism of the Type 516

• Synthesis as Hardening
  The Later Goal of Exalting Selection’s Power 518
  Increasing Emphasis on Selection and Adaptation between the First (1937) and Last (1951) Edition of Dobzhansky’s Genetics and the Origin of Species 524
  The Shift in G. G. Simpson’s Explanation of “Quantum Evolution” from Drift and Nonadaptation (1944) to the Embodiment of Strict Adaptation (1953) 528
  Mayr at the Inception (1942) and Codification (1963): Shifting from the “Genetic Consistency” to the “Adaptationist” Paradigm 531
  Why Hardening? 541

• Hardening on the Other Two Legs of the Darwinian Tripod
  Levels of Selection 544
  Extrapolation into Geological Time 556

• From Overstressed Doubt to Overextended Certainty 566
  A Tale of Two Centennials 566
  All Quiet on the Textbook Front 576
  Adaptation and Natural Selection 577
  Reduction and Trivialization of Macroevolution 579

Segue to Part II 585

Part II: Towards a Revised and Expanded Evolutionary Theory

Chapter 8: Species as Individuals in the Hierarchical Theory of Selection 595

• The Evolutionary Definition of Individuality 595
  An Individualistic Prolegomenon 595
  The Meaning of Individuality and the Expansion of the Darwinian Research Program 597
  Criteria for Vernacular Individuality 602
  Criteria for Evolutionary Individuality 608

• The Evolutionary Definition of Selective Agency and the Fallacy of Selfish Genes 613
## Contents

A Fruitful Error of Logic 613
Hierarchical vs. Genic Selectionism 614
   The Distinction of Replicators and Interactors as a Framework for Discussion 615
   Faithful Replication as the Central Criterion for the Gene-Centered View of Evolution 616
   Sieves, Plurifiers, and the Nature of Selection: The Rejection of Replication as a Criterion of Agency 619
   Interaction as the Proper Criterion for Identifying Units of Selection 622
   The Internal Incoherence of Gene Selectionism 625
   Bookkeeping and Causality: The Fundamental Error of Gene Selectionism 632
   Gambits of Reform and Retreat by Gene Selectionists 637
• Logical and Empirical Foundations for the Theory of Hierarchical Selection 644
   Logical Validation and Empirical Challenges 644
      R. A. Fisher and the Compelling Logic of Species Selection 644
      The Classical Arguments against Efficacy of Higher-Level Selection 646
      Overcoming These Classical Arguments, in Practice for Interdemic Selection, but in Principle for Species Selection 648
   Emergence and the Proper Criterion for Species Selection 652
      Differential Proliferation or Downward Effect? 652
      Shall Emergent Characters or Emergent Fitnesses Define the Operation of Species Selection? 656
Hierarchy and the Sixfold Way 673
   A Literary Prologue for the Two Major Properties of Hierarchies 673
   Redressing the Tyranny of the Organism: Comments on Characteristic Features and Differences among Six Primary Levels 681
      The Gene-Individual 683
         Motoo Kimura and the "Neutral Theory of Molecular Evolution" 684
      True Genic Selection 689
      The Cell-Individual 695
      The Organism-Individual 700
      The Deme-Individual 701
      The Species-Individual 703
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The Scientific Debate on Punctuated Equilibrium: Critiques and Responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critiques Based on the Definability of Paleontological Species</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empirical Affirmation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons for a Potential Systematic Underestimation of Biospecies by Paleospecies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons for a Potential Systematic Overestimation of Biospecies by Paleospecies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons Why an Observed Punctuational Pattern Might Not Represent Speciation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critiques Based on Denying Events of Speciation as the Primary Locus of Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critiques Based on Supposed Failures of Empirical Results to Affirm Predictions of Punctuated Equilibrium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claims for Empirical Refutation by Cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phenotypes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genotypes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empirical Tests of Conformity with Models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Sources of Data for Testing Punctuated Equilibrium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preamble</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Equilibrium in Punctuated Equilibrium: Quantitatively Documented Patterns of Stasis in Unbranched Segments of Lineages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Punctuations of Punctuated Equilibrium: Tempo and Mode in the Origin of Paleospecies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Inference of Cladogenesis by the Criterion of Ancestral Survival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The “Dissection” of Punctuations to Infer Both Existence and Modality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morphometric Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proper and Adequate Tests of Relative Frequencies: The Strong Empirical Validation of Punctuated Equilibrium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Indispensability of Data on Relative Frequencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative Frequencies for Higher Taxa in Entire Biotas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative Frequencies for Entire Clades</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Causal Clues from Differential Patterns of Relative Frequencies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Broader Implications of Punctuated Equilibrium for Evolutionary Theory and General Notions of Change

What Changes May Punctuated Equilibrium Instigate in Our Views about Evolutionary Mechanisms and the History of Life?

The Explanation and Broader Meaning of Stasis

Frequency

Generality

Causality

Punctuation, the Origin of New Macroevolutionary Individuals, and Resulting Implications for Evolutionary Theory

Trends

The Speciational Reformulation of Macroevolution

Life Itself

General Rules

Particular Cases

Horses as the Exemplar of “Life’s Little Joke”

Rethinking Human Evolution

Ecological and Higher-Level Extensions

Punctuation All the Way Up and Down? The Generalization and Broader Utility of Punctuated Equilibrium (in More Than a Metaphorical Sense) at Other Levels of Evolution, and for Other Disciplines In and Outside the Natural Sciences

General Models for Punctuated Equilibrium

Punctuational Change at Other Levels and Scales of Evolution

A Preliminary Note on Homology and Analogy in the Conceptual Realm

Punctuation Below the Species Level

Punctuation Above the Species Level

Stasis Analogs: Trending and Non-Trending in the Geological History of Clades

Punctuational Analogs in Lineages: The Pace of Morphological Innovation

Punctuational Analogs in Faunas and Ecosystems

Punctuational Models in Other Disciplines: Towards a General Theory of Change

Principles for a Choice of Examples

Examples from the History of Human Artifacts and Cultures

Examples from Human Institutions and Theories about the Natural World
Two Concluding Examples, a General Statement, and a Coda 962

• Appendix: A Largely Sociological (and Fully Partisan) History of the Impact and Critique of Punctuated Equilibrium 972
  The Entrance of Punctuated Equilibrium into Common Language and General Culture 972
  An Episodic History of Punctuated Equilibrium 979
  Early Stages and Future Contexts 979
  Creationist Misappropriation of Punctuated Equilibrium 986
  Punctuated Equilibrium in Journalism and Textbooks 990

The Personal Aspect of Professional Reaction 999
  The Case Ad Hominem against Punctuated Equilibrium 1000
  An Interlude on Sources of Error 1010
  The Wages of Jealousy 1014
  The Descent to Nastiness 1014
  The Most Unkindest Cut of All 1019
  The Wisdom of Agassiz's and von Baer's Threefold History of Scientific Ideas 1021
  A Coda on the Kindness and Generosity of Most Colleagues 1022

Chapter 10: The Integration of Constraint and Adaptation (Structure and Function) in Ontogeny and Phylogeny: Historical Constraints and the Evolution of Development 1025

• Constraint as a Positive Concept 1025
  Two Kinds of Positivity 1025
  An Etymological Introduction 1025
  The First (Empirical) Positive Meaning of Channeling 1027
  The Second (Definitional) Positive Meaning of Causes outside Accepted Mechanisms 1032

Heterochrony and Allometry as the Locus Classicus of the First Positive (Empirical) Meaning, Channeled Directionality by Constraint. 1037

The Two Structural Themes of Internally Set Channels and Ease of Transformation as Potentially Synergistic with Functional Causality by Natural Selection: Increasing Shell Stability in the Gryphaea Heterochronoclone 1040

Ontogenetically Channeled Allometric Constraint as a Primary Basis of Expressed Evolutionary Variation: The Full Geographic and Morphological Range of Cerion uva 1045
The Aptive Triangle and the Second Positive Meaning: Constraint as a Theory-Bound Term for Patterns and Directions Not Built Exclusively (Or Sometimes Even at All) by Natural Selection

The Model of the Aptive Triangle

Distinguishing and Sharpening the Two Great Questions

The Structural Vertex

The Historical Vertex

An Epitome for the Theory-Bound Nature of Constraint Terminology

Deep Homology and Pervasive Parallelism: Historical Constraint as the Primary Gatekeeper and Guardian of Morphospace

A Historical and Conceptual Analysis of the Underappreciated Importance of Parallelism for Evolutionary Theory

A Context for Excitement

A Terminological Excursus on the Meaning of Parallelism

The Nine Fateful Little Words of E. Ray Lankester

The Terminological Origin and Debate about the Meaning and Utility of Parallelism

A Symphony in Four Movements on the Role of Historical Constraint in Evolution: Towards the Harmonious Rebalancing of Form and Function in Evolutionary Theory

Movement One, Statement: Deep Homology across Phyla: Mayr’s Functional Certainty and Geoffroy’s Structural Vindication

Deep Homology, Archetypal Theories, and Historical Constraint

Mehr Licht (More Light) on Goethe’s Angiosperm Archetype

Hoxology and Geoffroy’s First Archetypal Theory of Segmental Homology

An Epitome and Capsule History of Hoxology

Vertebrate Homologs in Structure and Action

Segmental Homologies of Arthropods and Vertebrates: Geoffroy’s Vindication

Rediscovering the Vertebrate Rhombomeres

More Extensive Homologies throughout the Developing Somites

Some Caveats and Tentative Conclusions

Geoffrey’s Second Archetypal Theory of Dorso-Ventral Inversion in the Common Bilaterian Groundplan
Movement Two, Elaboration: Parallelism of Underlying Generators: Deep Homology Builds Positive Channels of Constraint

Parallellism All the Way Down: Shining a Light and Feeding the Walk

Parallelism in the Large: *Pax-6* and the Homology of Developmental Pathways in Homoplastic Eyes of Several Phyla

Data and Discovery

Theoretical Issues

A Question of Priority

Parallelism in the Small: The Origin of Crustacean Feeding Organs

Pharaonic Bricks and Corinthian Columns

Movement Three, Scherzo: Does Evolutionary Change Often Proceed by Saltation Down Channels of Historical Constraint?

Movement Four, Recapitulation and Summary: Early Establishment of Rules and the Inhomogenous Population of Morphospace: Dobzhansky's Landscape as Primarily Structural and Historical, Not Functional and Immediate

Bilaterian History as Top-Down by Tinkering of an Initial Set of Rules, Not Bottom-Up by Adding Increments of Complexity

Setting of Historical Constraints in the Cambrian Explosion

Channeling the Subsequent Directions of Bilaterian History from the Inside

An Epilog on Dobzhansky's Landscape and the Dominant Role of Historical Constraint in the Clumped Population of Morphospace

Chapter 11: The Integration of Constraint and Adaptation (Structure and Function) in Ontogeny and Phylogeny: Structural Constraints, Spandrels, and the Centrality of Exaptation in Macroevolution

- The Timeless Physics of Evolved Function

  Structuralism's Odd Man Outside

  D'Arcy Thompson's Science of Form

    The Structure of an Argument

    The Tactic and Application of an Argument

    The Admitted Limitation and Ultimate Failure of an Argument
Odd Man In (D'Arcy Thompson's Structuralist Critique of Darwinism) and Odd Man Out (His Disparagement of Historicism) 1200
An Epilog to an Argument 1207
Order for Free and Realms of Relevance for Thompsonian Structuralism 1208
• Exapting the Rich and Inevitable Spandrels of History 1214
Nietzsche's Most Important Proposition of Historical Method 1214
Exaptation and the Principle of Quirky Functional Shift: The Restricted Darwinian Version as the Ground of Contingency 1218
How Darwin Resolved Mivart's Challenge of Incipient Stages 1218
The Two Great Historical and Structural Implications of Quirky Functional Shift 1224
How Exaptation Completes and Rationalizes the Terminology of Evolutionary Change by Functional Shifting 1229
Key Criteria and Examples of Exaptation 1234
The Complete Version, Replete with Spandrels: Exaptation and the Terminology of Nonadaptative Origin 1246
The More Radical Category of Exapted Features with Truly Nonadaptive Origins as Structural Constraints 1246
Defining and Defending Spandrels: A Revisit to San Marco 1249
Three Major Reasons for the Centrality of Spandrels, and Therefore of Nonadaptation, in Evolutionary Theory 1258
• The Exaptive Pool: The Proper Conceptual Formula and Ground of Evolvability 1270
Resolving the Paradox of Evolvability and Defining the Exaptive Pool 1270
The Taxonomy of the Exaptive Pool 1277
Franklins and Miltons, or Inherent Potentials vs. Available Things 1277
Choosing a Fundamentum Divisionis for a Taxonomy: An Apparently Arcane and Linguistic Matter That Actually Embodies a Central Scientific Decision 1280
Cross-Level Effects as Miltonic Spandrels, Not Franklinian Potentials: The Nub of Integration and Radical Importance 1286
A Closing Comment to Resolve the Macroevolutionary Paradox that Constraint Ensures Flexibility Whereas Selection Crafts Restriction 1294
xxii  Contents

Chapter 12: Tiers of Time and Trials of Extrapolationism, With an Epilog on the Interaction of General Theory and Contingent History 1296

- Failure of Extrapolationism in the Non-Isotropy of Time and Geology 1296
  - The Specter of Catastrophic Mass Extinction: Darwin to Chicxulub 1296
  - The Paradox of the First Tier: Towards a General Theory of Tiers of Time 1320
- An Epilog on Theory and History in Creating the Grandeur of This View of Life 1332