What Counts as Evidence in Linguistics

The case of innateness

Edited by

Martina Penke
Anette Rosenbach
Heinrich-Heine-University Düsseldorf
Table of contents

Preface vii

What counts as evidence in linguistics? An introduction 1
Martina Penke and Anette Rosenbach

Typological evidence and Universal Grammar 51
Frederick J. Newmeyer

Remarks on the relation between language typology and Universal Grammar: Commentary on Newmeyer 75
Mark Baltin

Does linguistic explanation presuppose linguistic description? 81
Martin Haspelmath

Remarks on description and explanation in grammar: Commentary on Haspelmath 109
Judith Aissen and Joan Bresnan

Authors' response 113
Martin Haspelmath

From UG to Universals: Linguistic adaptation through iterated learning 117
Simon Kirby, Kenny Smith and Henry Brighton

Form, meaning and speakers in the evolution of language: Commentary on Kirby, Smith and Brighton 139
William Croft

Authors' response 143
Simon Kirby, Kenny Smith and Henry Brighton

Why assume UG? 147
Dieter Wunderlich

What kind of evidence could refute the UG hypothesis? Commentary on Wunderlich 175
Michael Tomasello
Author’s response: Is there any evidence that refutes the UG hypothesis?
  Dieter Wunderlich

A question of relevance: Some remarks on standard languages
  Helmut Weiβ

The relevance of variation: Remarks on Weiβ’s standard-dialect-problem
  Horst J. Simon

Author’s response
  Helmut Weiβ

Universals, innateness and explanation in second language acquisition
  Fred R. Eckman

‘Internal’ versus ‘external’ universals: Commentary on Eckman
  Lydia White

Author’s response: ‘External’ universals and explanation in SLA
  Fred R. Eckman

What counts as evidence in historical linguistics?
  Olga Fischer

Abstraction and performance: Commentary on Fischer
  David W. Lightfoot

Author’s response
  Olga Fischer

Index