Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Action
Limits Imposed by Economic and Legal Theory

Philip Bentley QC
Partner, McDermott Will & Emery Stanbrook, Brussels, Belgium

Aubrey Silberston CBE
Emeritus Professor of Economics, Imperial College, London, UK

Edward Elgar
Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA
## Contents

**Preface**  

1 Introduction  
1.1 Purpose of the study  
1.2 Free trade versus protection  
1.3 The WTO framework  
1.4 The interest of the subject  

2 Anti-dumping principles  
2.1 Principles  
2.2 Normal value  
2.3 Export price  
2.4 Dumping margin  
2.5 Injury  
2.6 Domestic industry  
2.7 Provisional measures  
2.8 Price undertakings  
2.9 Definitive duties  
2.10 Reviews and refunds  
2.11 Permissive imposition of duties  
2.12 The US approach  

3 Anti-subsidy and countervailing principles  
3.1 Principles  
3.2 Countervailing action  
3.3 Definition of a subsidy  
3.4 Specificity  
3.5 Deemed specificity of export and domestic input subsidies  
3.6 Calculation of the amount of subsidy  
3.7 The relationship between dumped and subsidized exports  
3.8 Matters common to countervailing and anti-dumping action  
3.9 Dispute settlement proceedings against subsidies  

4 Injury  
4.1 Is injury the inevitable effect of competition?
Contents

4.2 Dumping subsidization and injury 38
4.3 Definition of injury 38
4.4 Causation of material injury 39
4.5 Volume of dumped or subsidized imports 40
4.6 Effect of dumped or subsidized imports on prices 41
4.7 Impact of dumped or subsidized imports on the domestic industry 42
4.8 Lesser duty rule 43
4.9 Can injury be measured quantitatively? 44
4.10 The price-volume relationship and the spreading of overheads 46
4.11 Can threat of injury be assessed realistically? 49
4.12 Can material retardation of a new industry be assessed realistically? 51

5 Anti-dumping action – problems arising 54
5.1 Domestic price and sales at a loss 54
5.2 Problems of like product 57
5.3 The problem of no like product 59
5.4 Construction of normal value, SG&A and profit 60
5.5 How should costs be allocated? 62
5.6 Problems of start-up situations 64
5.7 Imports from non-market economy countries 65
5.8 Prospective or retrospective? 71

6 Zeroing and the full degree of dumping 74
6.1 Three methods of calculation 74
6.2 General observations about all three methods 76
6.3 How could the Second Symmetrical Method work? 77
6.4 Is it legitimate to allow zeroing with the Second Symmetrical Method? 78
6.5 When can recourse be made to the Asymmetrical Method? 79
6.6 The decision tree 82
6.7 Negative dumping, zeroing and the investigation of injury 83
6.8 The end of zeroing? 84

7 Subsidies and countervailing action – problems arising 95
7.1 Allocation of countervailing duties over time 95
7.2 Interest charges on subsidies received for current transactions 99
7.3 The relationship between dumped and subsidized exports revisited 102
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Why are undumped subsidized exports countervailable?</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5 A hybrid export subsidy?</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6 Subsidy allocation: per unit or per value?</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7 Continuation of subsidies after privatization</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Public policy considerations</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Community interest</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 Benefits to processing industries</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 Benefits to consumers</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Anti-dumping action – alternative approaches</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Market circumstances and dumping</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Low wage countries</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Countries with no import barriers</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Conclusions on the present situation</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Some proposals for change</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Conclusions and recommendations</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Anti-dumping action</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Subsidies and countervailing action</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Final thoughts</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1 Article VI of GATT 1947</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2 Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of GATT 1994 (AD Agreement)</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 3 Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 4 List of cases</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index 223