

CONTENTS

	Acknowledgments	ix
1	Introduction	1
1.1	Tradeoffs in Utility Operations, Planning, and Policy Decisions	2
1.2	How Can Multicriteria Decision-Making Methods Help?	6
1.3	Why Not Monetize All Criteria?	8
1.4	Scope of the Book	11
2	The Application of MCDM Methods	15
2.1	Attribute Selection and Definition (Step 1)	17
2.1.1	Issues in Attribute Selection	18
2.1.2	Risk as an Attribute	25
2.2	Define Options (Step 2)	27
2.3	Quantify Impacts (Step 3)	30
Annex 2.1	An Example of an MCDM Method for Evaluating Proposals	37
Annex 2.2	Defining Attributes: Biodiversity in Sri Lanka	39
3	Screening and Tradeoff Analysis	45
3.1	Screening (Step 4)	48
3.2	Analyzing Tradeoff Plots (Step 5)	51
3.3	Dominance Analysis (Step 6)	52
Annex 3.1	Generating Tradeoff Curves	57
Annex 3.2	Other Tradeoff Display Methods	60
Annex 3.3	Screening Resources at BC Hydro by Dominance Analysis	61
Annex 3.4	Tradeoff analysis for the Three-Dimensional Case	63
4	Scaling, Weighting, and Amalgamation	67
4.1	Value Scaling (Step 7)	67
4.1.1	Assessing Value Functions	69
4.1.2	Utility Functions	72
4.2	Weighting Methods (Step 8)	75
4.2.1	Equal Weights	76
4.2.2	Observer Derived Weights	76
4.2.3	Direct Weighting	77
4.2.4	The Analytic Hierarchy Process	78
4.2.5	Swing Weights	80
4.2.6	Indifference Tradeoff Weights	81
4.2.7	Gamble Method	81
4.2.8	Desirable Properties of Weights	82
4.2.9	Weighting Conclusions	83
4.3	Amalgamation Methods (Step 9)	85
4.3.1	Additive Value Function	86
4.3.2	Goal Programming	87
4.3.3	Power Law	89
4.3.4	Multiplicative and Additive Utility Functions	90
4.3.5	Using Additive Value Functions, Goal Programming, Power Law and Utility Functions for Screening	91
4.3.6	Outranking Methods: ELECTRE I	91

4.3.7	Successive Elimination	93
4.3.8	Amalgamation Conclusions	95
5	Resolving Differences (Step 10)	99
5.1	Resolving Differences Among Methods	100
5.1.1	Examples of Disagreements Among Methods	100
5.1.2	Resolving Differences Among Methods for Specific Individuals	102
5.2	Resolving Differences Among Individuals	105
6	An Illustrative Numerical Example	111
6.1	Exclusionary Screening (Step 4)	112
6.2	Dominance Analysis (Step 6)	112
6.3	Scaling, Weighting, and Amalgamation (Steps 7-9)	112
6.4	Indifference Tradeoff Weighting (Step 8)	114
6.5	AHP Weighting (Step 8)	115
6.6	Goal Programming Amalgamation (Step 9)	116
6.7	Single and Multiattribute Utility Functions (Steps 7-9)	117
6.8	Amalgamation by ELECTRE (Step 9)	119
6.9	Successive Elimination (Step 9)	120
7	A Review of MCDM Applications in Energy Planning and Policy	123
7.1	MCDM Methods in Environmental Impact Assessment	124
7.1.1	Puget Sound Area Reliability Plan EIS: A Greyscale Impact Matrix	124
7.1.2	A US Federal Energy Regulatory Commission Approach: Additive Value Functions	126
7.2	MCDM Methods in Resource Bidding Systems	128
7.3	MCDM Methods in Transmission and Distribution System Planning	130
7.3.1	Analyzing Cost-Reliability Tradeoffs	131
7.3.2	Transmission Line Routing	133
7.4	MCDM Methods in Supply Capacity Planning	136
7.4.1	Ranking Discrete Supply Plans	136
7.4.2	Multiple Criteria Analysis of Supply Plans Using Linear and Dynamic Programming	139
7.5	MCDM Methods in Resource Planning	142
7.6	MCDM Applications in Generation System Operations	144
7.7	Using MCDM to Measure Corporate Environmental Performance	146
7.8	MCDM Methods in National Energy Policy	149
7.9	Power Sector Applications of MCDM Methods in Developing Countries	151
7.9.1	Power Plant Siting	151
7.9.2	Incorporating Environmental Concerns in Power Sector Planning	154
8	MCDM at BC Hydro: The 1995 Plan	159
8.1	Structuring the Process	159
8.2	Objectives and Attributes (Step 1)	162
8.3	Defining the Alternatives (Step 2)	166
8.4	Portfolio Analysis	170
8.5	Tradeoff Display (Step 5) and Evaluation of Portfolios (Steps 8,9)	172
8.6	Getting to Consensus (Step 10)	175

9	Multi-Method MCDM at BC Gas	179
9.1	Designing a Multi-method MCDM-Based Process	180
9.2	Using MCDM Methods to Screen DSM Programs	182
9.3	Application	183
9.4	Stakeholder Evaluation of the Process and Conclusion	202
10	MCDM Experiments at Seattle City Light	207
10.1	Introduction	207
10.2	Questions Addressed	208
10.3	Resource Planning at Seattle City Light	214
10.4	Results of Method Comparisons	219
10.5	Conclusions	228
11	Closing Remarks	235
	References	239
	Index	255