

Contents

PART ONE: REFORMING ENERGY AND TRANSPORT SUBSIDIES

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	11
What is a subsidy?.....	11
Effects of subsidy reform on the environment	12
Promising areas for subsidy reform	13
Implementation issues	13
Next steps	14
<i>Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION</i>	17
1.1 Context.....	17
1.2 Reasons for subsidy reform	17
1.3 The OECD project	18
1.4 Defining and measuring subsidies	19
1.4.1 Direct payments to producers or consumers.....	20
1.4.2 Tax expenditures.....	20
1.4.3 Policies that create transfers through market prices	20
1.4.4 Failure to internalise externalities.....	21
1.5 Measuring subsidies	21
1.6 Approach and methodology for this report.....	22
1.7 Scope of case studies	23
1.8 Structure of the report.....	24
<i>Chapter 2: ENERGY POLICY REFORM</i>	25
2.1 Scope of the case studies	27
2.2 Identifying supports to coal production and consumption	28
2.2.1 Coal producer subsidy equivalents	28
2.2.2 Capital supports and risk protection for ESI.....	29
2.2.3 Uneven environmental regulation.....	29
2.3 Effects of removing coal support.....	30
2.3.1 Fuel switching	30
2.3.2 Demand reduction.....	31
2.3.3 Environmental effects	31
2.3.4 Economic, employment, environmental and trade effects.....	34
2.4 Identifying supports to electricity production and consumption	37
2.4.1 Taxes and duties below the general rate	37
2.4.2 Support to investment, risk limitation, rate of return controls.....	38
2.4.3 Subsidies for remote and rural electrification and price regulation.....	39
2.4.4 Preferential contracts for energy-intensive industry	39
2.5 Effects of removing support for electricity.....	40
2.5.1 Environmental effects	40
2.5.2 Economic, employment and trade effects	41
2.6 Externalities of electricity generation.....	42
2.6.1 Coal-fired power station at West Burton	42
2.6.2 Gas-fired power station at West Burton	44

2.6.3	Nuclear power station in France	44
2.6.4	Effects of removing externalities	44
2.7	Implementation issues in reforming energy supports	46
<i>Chapter 3: TRANSPORT SUBSIDY REFORM</i>		49
3.1	Scope of case studies	49
3.2	Subsidy evaluation	50
3.3	Budgetary transport subsidies	51
3.3.1	Measuring transport subsidies	51
3.3.2	Environmental effects of user fee road funding	53
3.3.3	Economic and other policy issues in full user fee funding	54
3.4	Other support for car use	54
3.5	Transport externalities	55
3.5.1	Defining and measuring externalities	55
3.5.2	Environmental effects of externality charges	57
3.5.3	Effects of other means of reducing and internalising externalities	58
3.6	Economic impacts and implementation issues	59
3.6.1	Fuel tax increases	59
3.6.2	Internalising externalities	60
3.6.3	The role of local government in internalising externalities	60
<i>Chapter 4: CONCLUSIONS</i>		63
4.1	Environmental effects of policy reform	63
4.2	Feasibility of reform	64
4.3	Overcoming barriers	64
4.4	Methodologies	65
4.5	Further work	65
REFERENCES		67
List of studies undertaken within the OECD Environment Directorate's Project on the Environmental Implications of Energy and Transport Subsidies		71
GLOSSARY		73

PART TWO: CASE STUDIES

<i>Chapter 5: THE CLIMATE CHANGE IMPLICATIONS OF ELIMINATING U.S. ENERGY SUBSIDIES</i>		77
5.1	Introduction	77
5.2	What is an energy subsidy?	78
5.3	Existing studies of energy subsidies	79
5.3.1	Direct tax expenditures	79
5.3.2	Direct taxes	79
5.3.3	Research and development	79
5.3.4	Subsidies not directly related to federal budget	80
5.4	Environmental impacts of subsidy removal	81
5.5	Phasing out indirect energy subsidies	83
5.5.1	Transportation	83
5.5.2	Housing	86
5.6	Conclusion	87

<i>Chapter 6:</i>	GREENHOUSE GAS IMPACTS OF RUSSIAN ENERGY SUBSIDIES	91
6.1	Energy subsidies evaluation	91
6.2	Long-term projection model and scenarios	94
6.3	Evaluation of subsidies elimination: long-term effect.....	97
6.4	Regional analysis	98
<i>Chapter 7:</i>	EFFECTS OF PHASING OUT COAL SUBSIDIES IN OECD COUNTRIES	
7.1	Coal subsidies in OECD countries as measured by the PSE indicator.....	101
7.2	Approach of this study: comparing energy supply and demand under two scenarios	101
7.3	Effect on world coal trade and prices	103
7.4	Environmental and economic effects	104
7.5	Effects of including other forms of coal subsidies	104
<i>Chapter 8:</i>	MODELLING “SUPPORTS” TO THE ELECTRICITY SECTOR IN AUSTRALIA	107
8.1	Introduction	107
8.2	The electricity supply industry in Australia	107
8.2.1	Industry overview	107
8.2.2	Competitive market reforms and their implications for greenhouse gas emissions	108
8.3	Supports and market distortions not modelled	108
8.4	Supports and market distortions modelled using MENSA.....	109
8.5	Removal of indirect support to a fossil fuel	109
8.6	Trade policies: new interstate connections for gas and electricity	111
8.7	Removal of implicit capital subsidies and expanded cogeneration.....	111
8.7.1	Industrial co-generation	111
8.8	Conclusion.....	113
<i>Chapter 9:</i>	ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS OF SUPPORTS TO THE ELECTRICITY SECTOR IN ITALY: A CASE STUDY	115
9.1	Introduction	115
9.2	Scale of financial subsidies to the Italian electricity sector.....	117
9.2.1	Net subsidies	117
9.2.2	Cross subsidies.....	118
9.2.3	International comparison	118
9.3	Implications of the subsidies	118
9.3.1	Implications for the electricity system.....	119
9.3.2	Implications for the cost of environmental control policies	120
9.3.3	An approximate evaluation of the effects on social benefit.....	120
9.3.4	Implications of subsidy removal in the absence of CO ₂ controls	121
9.3.5	Conclusions and implications	122
9.4	Note on methodology	122
<i>Chapter 10:</i>	THE MARKET REFORMS IN THE NORWEGIAN ELECTRICITY SECTOR	125
<i>Chapter 11:</i>	ELECTRICITY-RELATED SUPPORTS IN THE UNITED KINGDOM	129
11.1	Supports to coal production.....	130
11.2	Supports to nuclear power	131
11.3	VAT on residential fuel use.....	131
11.4	Evaluation of effects of subsidy reform	132
11.5	Effects of removing externalities.....	135
<i>Chapter 12:</i>	EVALUATION OF THE EXTERNAL COSTS OF ROAD TRANSPORT IN FRANCE AND THE CONSEQUENCES OF COST INTERNALISATION	137
<i>Chapter 13:</i>	THE SOCIAL COSTS OF MOTOR VEHICLE USE IN JAPAN	145

13.1	Introduction	145
13.2	Balance sheet for 1991	146
13.3	Prediction and simulation for 2000 and 2010.....	148
13.3.1	Forecasting system and simulation models	148
13.3.2	Projections for business as usual (BAU) case for 2000 and 2010.....	149
13.3.3	Simulation of fair pricing.....	150
13.4	Concluding remarks on fair tax level simulation.....	151
<i>Chapter 14: TRANSPORT SUBSIDIES: U.S. CASE STUDY</i>		153
14.1	Introduction	153
14.2	Characteristics, extent and usage of the highway system.....	153
14.3	Structure of roadway user taxes.....	154
14.4	Market costs associated with roadway use	154
14.5	Externalities	154
14.6	Full user fee funding scenarios	157
14.6.1	Road wear vs. congestion	157
14.6.2	Parking.....	157
14.6.3	Methodology.....	159
14.6.4	Optimal pricing charges.....	159
14.6.5	Optimal investment.....	159
14.6.6	Results of optimal pricing scenario	159
14.6.7	Gasoline tax increase	161
14.6.8	Climate change impacts	162
14.6.9	Macroeconomic impacts of optimal pricing scenario.....	162
14.6.10	Differences between gasoline tax and optimal pricing scenarios	162
14.6.11	Issues with full user funding of roads.....	165

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1:	Summary of case studies	23
Table 2.1:	Summary of results from OECD and other studies on energy subsidy removal.....	26
Table 2.2:	PSEs for coal production in OECD countries, 1993.....	28
Table 2.3:	Environmental impact of coal fuel cycle.....	30
Table 2.4:	Pollutant emissions for baseload generating technologies.....	32
Table 2.5:	Sulphur content of coal	35
Table 2.6:	Coal fuel cycle damage cost estimates: West Burton	43
Table 2.7:	Global warming damage associated with coal-fired power generation	43
Table 2.8:	CCGT/natural gas damage cost estimates: West Burton	45
Table 2.9:	Global warming damage associated with CCGT/natural gas power generation.....	45
Table 3.1:	Public sector expenditure vs. user fees in the transport sector.....	52
Table 3.2:	External costs (high estimates) of road transport in France, 2010.....	58
Table 5.1:	Carbon reductions per value of subsidy and carbon reductions in 2010.....	87
Table 6.1:	1990 energy prices for industry in Russia, OECD countries and the USA.....	92
Table 6.2:	1990 household energy prices in Russia, OECD countries and the USA.....	93
Table 6.3:	Estimated unsubsidised energy price levels for industry	94
Table 6.4:	Estimated unsubsidised household energy prices	94
Table 6.5:	Estimated energy subsidies in 1990 and 1994	95
Table 6.6:	Projected levels of energy use and emissions for 2010.....	96

Table 6.7:	Estimated contribution of various factors to emissions reduction in 2010	98
Table 6.8:	Contribution of major factors to the development of TSP emissions	99
Table 6.9:	Contribution of major factors to the development of CO ₂ emissions	99
Table 7.1:	1993 levels of the producer subsidy equivalent (PSE).....	102
Table 8.1:	Primary energy use and CO ₂ emissions, Australia, 1990.....	108
Table 9.1:	Subsidies to the Italian electricity sector.....	116
Table 9.2:	Incremental costs and CO ₂ emissions resulting from electricity subsidies in Italy	121
Table 12.1:	Specific road revenue and direct public expenditure	138
Table 12.2:	Estimated ranges of the external costs of road traffic in France	138
Table 12.3:	Urban traffic balance.....	139
Table 12.4:	Traffic balance in rural areas.....	140
Table 12.5:	Urban traffic balance.....	140
Table 12.6:	Traffic balance in rural areas.....	141
Table 12.7:	Estimated changes in traffic- and pollution-related statistics in France, 1991-2010	142
Table 12.8:	Forecast balance for 2010	143
Table 13.1:	Annual motor-vehicle related tax revenues and costs: Summary (1991).....	146
Table 13.2:	Comparison of external unit cost	148
Table 13.3:	Annual motor-vehicle related revenues and costs: Summary (Business as Usual).....	149
Table 13.4:	Fair fuel price levels.....	151
Table 14.1:	Revenue sources associated with roadway receipts, 1991	155
Table 14.2:	Expenditures associated with roadway use, 1991	156
Table 14.3a:	External costs associated with roadway use.....	158
Table 14.3b:	External costs: modal and rural/urban allocation.....	158
Table 14.4:	Highway expenditures: optimal spending case versus base case.....	160
Table 14.5:	Highway revenues and expenditures.....	165

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1:	Reductions in subsidies, coal use and CO ₂ emissions, for six OECD countries.....	33
Figure 2.2:	Effects on GNP of subsidy recycling mechanisms, United States.....	36
Figure 2.3:	Household electricity tax as percentage of price in OECD countries in 1994.....	38
Figure 2.4:	Carbon emission reductions from removing individual U.S. federal subsidies	41
Figure 3.1:	Effects of road user full-cost pricing, United States	53
Figure 5.1:	Emissions reductions from individual subsidy removal	82
Figure 5.2:	Carbon reductions from direct subsidy removal	83
Figure 5.3:	Impacts on GNP from subsidy removal with different revenue recycling mechanisms.....	84
Figure 6.1:	Real fuel prices in Russia.....	93
Figure 6.2:	Projected TSP emissions	96
Figure 6.3:	Projected CO ₂ emissions	96
Figure 6.4:	Russian emissions indices in 2010.....	100

Figure 7.1:	Coal production in two scenarios	103
Figure 7.2:	Breakdown of coal demand by sector in the OECD in 1990	103
Figure 7.3:	Coal production and imports (six countries): Difference between scenarios.....	104
Figure 8.1:	Part of a typical energy system in MENSA	110
Figure 8.2a:	Australia's high voltage electricity transmission networks.....	112
Figure 8.2b:	Location of natural gas transmission pipelines, Australia, 1995.....	112
Figure 11.1:	Power generation mix in the United Kingdom, 1960-92	130
Figure 11.2:	Estimated support to British Coal, 1982-94	130
Figure 11.3:	CO ₂ emissions with and without subsidies	133
Figure 11.4:	SO ₂ emissions with and without subsidies	134
Figure 11.5:	emissions of NO _x with and without subsidies	134
Figure 11.6:	Average cost of electricity generated under several scenarios.....	135
Figure 14.1:	Comparison of carbon emissions from highway fuel consumption	160
Figure 14.2:	Cumulative carbon savings and cost per tonne removed with optimal pricing	163
Figure 14.3:	Cumulative carbon savings and cost per tonne removed with gasoline tax increase.....	163
Figure 14.4:	Loss in output due to optimal pricing.....	164
Figure 14.5:	Loss in output due to gasoline tax increase.....	164