Argument in a Time of Change

Definitions, Frameworks, and Critiques

Edited by James F. Klumpp

Associate Editors: Thomas A Hollihan, Rebecca S. Bjork, Malcolm L. Sillars, Pat Ganer, Scott Jacobs, Catherine Palczewski, and Charles Arthur Willard

# Table of Contents

Acknowledgments viii  
Preface ix  
Selection for the Volume xii  

Keynote  
1 "Definitions" David Zarefsky, Northwestern University 1  

Exploring Argument, Argumentation, and Argumentative Processes:  
The Nature of Argument  
2 'Making Sound Arguments: Would a Claim by Any Other Sound Mean  
the Same or Argue So Sweet?' G.R. Boynton and John S. Nelson,  
University of Iowa 12  
3 "Foundational Thoughts on Informal Logic as a Theory of Argument"  
Mark Weinstein, Montclair State University 18  
4 "Some Remarks on Non-Deductive Argument" Harald Wohlrapp, University  
of Hamburg, Germany 24  
5 "The Antilogical Alternative" Michael Mendelson, Iowa State University 30  
6 "Rhetorical Invention and the Speaker's Selection of Arguments" Fred J.  
Kauffeld, Edgewood College 35  
7 "Argument Without Truth? Hannah Arendt on Political Judgment and Public  
Persuasion" John S. Nelson, University of Iowa 40  
8 "Argument Without Truth? Heidegger on Rhetoric, Logos and the Unconcealment  
of Being" Susan Zickmund, Augustana College 46  

The Processes of Argument  
9 "Rhetorical Rationales for Dialectical Moves: Justifying Pragma-Dialectical  
Reconstructions" Frans H. van Eemeren and Peter Houtlosser, University of  
Amsterdam 51  
10 "Rhetorical Ways of Managing Disagreement: Justifying Reconstructions of  
Confrontation" Peter Houtlosser and Frans H. van Eemeren, University of  
Amsterdam 57  
11 "Argumentative Candor and Persuasive Success: A Meta-Analysis of the  
Persuasive Effects of Implicit and Explicit Message Conclusions" Daniel J.  
O'Keefe, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign 63  
12 "Deliberation and Character" Jean Goodwin, Northwestern University 70  

Frameworks for Theorizing and Studying Arguments  
13 "Reconsidering the Narrative Paradigm: The Implications of Ethos" Paul  
Turpin, University of Southern California 75
14 "Polyphony in the Theory of Argumentation in the Language-System: What it is and How it works" Igor Zagar, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

15 "Epistemics as a New Rhetoric for Modern Times" Joyce Gab Kneeland, Northwestern University

Interpersonal Dimensions of Arguing

16 "Taking Conflict Personally, Solidarity, and Relational Satisfaction: Interrelationships within Arguments" Judith M. Dallinger and Mark Callister, Western Illinois University

17 "The Meaning of Two Cultural Categories: Avoiding Interpersonal Arguments or Cutting them Short" Pamela J. Benoit, University of Missouri, and Dale Hample, Western Illinois University

18 "Processes and Outcomes Related to Non-Rational Argument in Societal Groups" Sandra Ketroch, University of Rhode Island, Renee Meyers, University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee, and Beatrice Schultz, University of Rhode Island

Argument in Scholarship

19 "The Crises in Scholarly Argument" Bruce E. Gronbeck, University of Iowa

20 "The Constituents of Sound Scholarly Argument: An Editor's Perspective" Dennis S. Gouran, The Pennsylvania State University

Studying Argument in the New Electronic World

21 "Earning the Right to Have Your Say: Pre-Qualification of Contributions to Discussion on the Web" Sally Jackson, University of Arizona

22 "The Scientific Collaboratory as Workbench for Public Argument" Barbara J. O'Keefe, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign


Creating the Civil Society: Argument's Place: What are the Characteristics of the Civil Society?

24 "Civic Virtue, Civil Society, and the Principle of the Public Sphere" Gerald A. Hauser, University of Colorado, Boulder

25 "Modes of Citizenship and Forms of Deliberation: A Comparative Study" Douglas Gregory Blankenship, Northwestern University

26 "Proceduralist Theories of Public Deliberation: Implications for the Production of Citizens" Darrin Hicks, University of Denver, and Lenore Langsdorf, Southern Illinois University at Carbondale

27 "Habermas' Between Facts and Norm: The Domains and Logics of Public Argument Given Cultural Globalization" David Cheshier, Georgia State University

28 "Reading the Force of Law in Between Facts and Norms" Douglas Thomas, University of Southern California
Argumentation, Power, and Difference

29 "Rhetorical Ventriloquism: Fantasy and/as American National Identity" 168
Barbara A. Biesecker, University of Iowa

30 "Re-Signing the Opposition: 'Minority Epistemology' and the Politics of Power" 173
Mark McPhail, University of Utah

31 "Bodies that Argue: Power, Difference and Argument" Catherine Palczewski,
University of Northern Iowa

32 "The Rhetorical Perspective on Argumentation and the Question of Effectivity"
Ronald Greene, University of Texas at Austin

33 "Transforming the Quest for Meaning: A Case Study in Public Argument"
Sandra J. Berkowitz, Joseph P. Zompetti, and Satoru Aonuma, Wayne State
University

Case Studies of Argument and Civility

34 "The Speciousness of Old Rhetoric: Deforming the Sublime" Thomas B. Farrell,
Northwestern University

35 "The Dark Side of Community and Democracy: Militias, Patriots and Angry
White Guys" Patricia Riley, University of Southern California, James F. Klumpp,
University of Maryland, and Thomas A. Hollihan, University of Southern California

Argument in Public Issues:
Case Studies of Argumentative Strategies in Public Arenas

36 "The Appearance of Argument: Public Space and Public Time in the
Documentary Photograph" Cara A. Finnegan, Northwestern University

37 "Audiences Matter: How Incomplete Argument Derailed Liberal Claims in the
Wake of Oklahoma City" Joe Bellon and Edward Panetta, University of Georgia

38 "Merchants of Death: Persuasive Defenses by the Tobacco Industry" William
L. Benoit, University of Missouri, Columbia

39 "Evasive Answers: Reframing Multiple Argumentative Demands in Political
Interviews" Leah Polcar and Scott Jacobs, University of Arizona

40 "Journalists, Moderators and Citizens: A Quantitative Assessment of Questions
Asked in Presidential Debates" Indra deSilva, Mt. Vernon College and Dale A.
Herbeck, Boston College

41 "Not Answering Questions: A Police Chief's Strategies in a Sensationalized
Murder" Bob Agne and Karen Tracy, University of Colorado at Boulder

42 "Reflexive Argument: Jeanne d'Arc and Other Victims" Dale Hample, Western
Illinois University

Arguments and Issues in the Pursuit of the Humane Society

43 "Rhetoric, the Body, and Civil Society" Gerald A. Hauser, University of Colorado
at Boulder

44 "Myths of Blood, Property, and Maternity: Exploring the Public Argumentation
of Anti-Adoption Advocates" Ronald Lee and Karen King Lee, University of
Nebraska, Lincoln
"The Logic of Protection and the Strategy of Normalcy: The (Re)production of Child Sexual Abuse" Jennifer L. Coburn-Engquist, University of Denver

"Race Trails: The Rhetoric of Victimage and the Racial Consciousness of 1930's America" William Lewis, Drake University, and John Louis Lucaites, Indiana University

"Arguing Ourselves to Death" Warren Sandmann, Mankato State University

"Sarah Roberts, Lemuel Shaw, and Nineteenth Century Legal Argument" Marouf Hasian, Arizona State University

"Public Space and Postmodernity: A Rhetorical Analysis of the State of Illinois Center" Stephen W. Becker, Northwestern University

"Pro-Life and Animal Rights Advocacy: An Analogical Assessment of Argumentation Forms Across the Ideological Spectrum" Omar G. Guevara II, Wayne State University

War and Peace

"The Fairy Tale and the Tragedy? The Western Metaphors of War in the Persian Gulf and in Bosnia" Riikka Kuusisto, University of Helsinki, Finland

"Clean' Bombs and 'Limited' War: Edward Teller's Cold War Arguments" Terence Cheek, St. John's University

"The Rhetorical Construction of Reality; 'Overcoming Modernity'' Takeshi Suzuki, Ibaraki University, Japan

"The Authority to Address the History of the Bomb: An Examination of the Public Arguments Against Professional Historians and 'The Last Act" Theodore O. Prosise, University of Southern California

Legal Argument

"Feminist Legal Arguments and Sears: A Case Study" Theresa Beiner, University of Arkansas, Little Rock.

"Prudence, Process, or Politics: The Counter-Majoritarian Problem and the Nature of Judicial Expertise" James Arnt Aune, Texas A&M University

"Identifying Arguments in Courtroom Transcripts" Nina J. Truch and Scott Jacobs, University of Arizona

"Maintaining Accountability to Principles of Dialectic in the Oliver North Testimony: Question-Answer Debates in Congressional Hearings" Alan Aldrich, University of Arizona

"Split Decisions: Undecidability and the Holdout Juror" Steve Schwarze, University of Iowa, and Chris Kamrath, Northwestern University

"Individualism and the Public Sphere? A Case Study in Public Legal Argument" John C. Day, University of Southern California

Goals and Strategies for Educators in Argumentation:
Reconsidering the Argumentation Classroom

"Reflective Discourse in a Critical Thinking Classroom" Robert T. Craig, University of Colorado at Boulder

"God, What a Job! Commitment in the Face of Uncertainty, Alterity, and Dislocation" William Lewis, Drake University
"Argument and Mediated Content: Understanding Audience Reception and Its Cultural Implications" David M. Cheshier and Carol K. Winkler, Georgia State University

"Rethinking the Traditional Debate Model: Florida State University's Argumentation Course" Marilyn J. Young, Florida State University

"Putting the Critical Edge Back into Legal and Business Argument: Developing the Specialized Seminar" Kathleen Farrell and David Hingstman, University of Iowa

Preparing Debate for the 21st Century

"Transformational Leadership in the 21st Century: The Role of Debate" Pamela L. Stepp, Cornell University


"Information Age Consciousness: Technological Challenges to Traditional Advocacy" Ben Voth, Miami University

"Technological Requirements of the Debate Director in the 21st Century" Rich Edwards, Baylor University

"Professional Requirements of the Debate Director in the 21st Century" Karla K. Leeper, Baylor University

"Forensics Budgets and Programs: A Status Report" George Ziegelmueller, Wayne State University

"Burnout and Retrofire Along the Forensic Highway" Donn W. Parson, University of Kansas

Teaching Kritiking/Kritiking Teaching

"Liberation Pedagogy: Addressing Oppression through Debate Arguments" Brian Lain, University of Iowa

"A Terrorist Education: A Response to the Fear of Deconstruction in Educational Debate" Maxwell Schnurer, University of Pittsburgh

"Kritiking as Alternative Pedagogy: Another Way In" William Shanahan, University of Texas at Austin

Plenarist

"From Identity Crises to Multiple Personalities: Two Decades of the Alta Conference" Bruce E. Gronbeck, University of Iowa