

Critical Issues in American Religious History

Second Revised Edition

ROBERT R. MATHISEN



Baylor University Press
Waco, Texas

CONTENTS

Preface	xv
Foreword	xvii

Chapter 1: Interpreting Religion in America

ESSAYS

§1	The Recovery of American Religious History <i>Henry F. May</i>	2
§2	Telling Stories <i>Peter W. Williams</i>	16
§3	History Texts and Why Is There So Little Religion in the Textbooks? <i>Warren A. Nord</i>	26

Chapter 2: Religion in Early America

How inclusive would religion be in early America?

DOCUMENTS

§4	A French View of Native Americans (1611)	40
§5	English America's First Mass (1634)	42
§6	Anti-Catholicism (1641)	44
§7	Pennsylvania and the Quakers (1669)	44
§8	The Trial of Margaret Brewster (1677)	46
§9	Slave Conversion on the Carolina Frontier (1709)	51

ESSAYS

§10	Black Women and Religion in the Colonial Period <i>Lillian Ashcraft Webb</i>	53
§11	Exposing the Idolatry of the Romish Church: Anti-Popery and Colonial New England <i>Francis D. Cogliano</i>	60
§12	Saints and Sisters: Congregational and Quaker Women in the Early Colonial Period <i>Mary Maples Dunn</i>	72

Chapter 3: The Era of the Great Awakening*What was the meaning of the Great Awakening?***DOCUMENTS**

§13	An Essay for Reviving Religion (1733)	87
§14	From the Journal of the Rev. Ebenezer Parkman (1742)	88
§15	Thoughts on the Revival of Religion (1742)	96
§16	Seasonable Thoughts on the State of Religion (1743)	98
§17	"What a Vile Creature I Am" (1744)	99
§18	The Testimony of Harvard College against George Whitefield (1744)	103
§19	The Millennium (1758)	104
§20	The Impact of the Great Awakening (1769)	105

ESSAYS

§21	The Great Awakening: Revelation and Reason <i>Cedric Cowing</i>	107
§22	The Great Awakening as Subversion and Conspiracy <i>David S. Lovejoy</i>	112
§23	Women and Revivalism: The Puritan and Wesleyan Traditions <i>Martha T. Blauvelt and Rosemary Skinner Keller</i>	123

Chapter 4: Religious America in the American Revolution*How religious was the American Revolution?***DOCUMENTS**

§24	Discourse Concerning Unlimited Submission (1750)	136
§25	Southern Anglican Loyalist (1770)	138
§26	A Calm Address to Our American Colonies (1775)	140
§27	Election Sermon (1776)	142
§28	The Church's Flight into the Wilderness (1776)	144
§29	Isaac Backus's Call for a Bill of Rights (1779, 1783)	145

ESSAYS

§30	The Role of Religion in the Revolution <i>William G. McLoughlin</i>	148
§31	Visions of a Republican Millennium: An Ideology of Civil Religion in the New Nation <i>Nathan O. Hatch</i>	154
§32	The American Revolution and the Religious History of the United States <i>Mark Noll</i>	163

Chapter 5: American Religion in the Middle Period*What would be the role of religion in the early republic?***DOCUMENTS**

§33	The Rise of African American Churches (1792, 1816)	177
§34	Forming the American Bible Society (1816)	179
§35	Lyman Beecher and Disestablishment (1818)	181
§36	The Church Must Take Right Ground (1835)	182
§37	Millerites and Millennialism (1836)	185
§38	Measures to Promote Revivals (1835)	186
§39	The Anxious Bench (1844)	189
§40	Human Aliment and the Wines of Scripture (1855)	192

ESSAYS

§41	The Promise of the Millennium <i>Steven Mintz</i>	194
§42	Charles G. Finney <i>Robert R. Mathisen</i>	206
§43	Adventism and the American Experience <i>Jonathan M. Butler</i>	214

Chapter 6: American Religion in the Antebellum Frontier West*How did the frontier West shape American religion?***DOCUMENTS**

§44	Frontier Revivalism (1808)	227
§45	Methodist Circuit Preacher (1834)	229
§46	Narrative of the Massacre of the Wife and Children of Thomas Baldwin (1836)	230
§47	First White Women over the Rockies (1837)	232
§48	The Need for Western Colleges (1843)	234
§49	The Mormon Exodus Announced (October 8, 1845)	237
§50	Justification by Scripture (1846)	238
§51	Robert Baird on the Principle of Voluntarism (1856)	239

ESSAYS

§52	The Heritage of the Popular Denominations <i>T. Scott Miyakawa</i>	241
§53	Religion and Spirituality <i>Ferenc M. Szasz and Margaret Connell Szasz</i>	249
§54	Temples in the Forest <i>Robert F. Berkhofer, Jr.</i>	260

Chapter 7: Slavery and American Religion*How did slavery coexist with religion in antebellum America?***DOCUMENTS**

\$55	A View of the Exertions Lately Made for the Purpose of Colonizing the Free People of Colour (1817)	275
\$56	A Catholic Defense of Slavery (1840)	276
\$57	Slavery and Methodist Schism (1843)	279
\$58	Slave Religion (1849)	281
\$59	Letters on Slavery (1852)	282
\$60	What to the Slave is the Fourth of July? (1852)	285
\$61	Slavery and Southern Presbyterian Secession (1861)	289
\$62	Slave Songs and Spirituals (1867)	294

ESSAYS

\$63	Religious Life in the Slave Community <i>Albert J. Raboteau</i>	297
\$64	Antislavery and the Evangelical Movement <i>Bertram Wyatt-Brown</i>	303
\$65	Slavery and Theology: The Emergence of Black Christian Consciousness in Nineteenth-Century America <i>Timothy L. Smith</i>	313

Chapter 8: Religion and America's Civil War*How did religion impact the Civil War?***DOCUMENTS**

\$66	Abraham Lincoln's Letter to Joshua F. Speed (1855)	333
\$67	An Address to Christians throughout the World (1863)	334
\$68	President Davis Seeks God's Aid and Mercy (1864)	335
\$69	Abraham Lincoln's Second Inaugural Address (1865)	336
\$70	Address at the Raising of the Union Flag over Fort Sumter (1865)	338
\$71	Horace Bushnell's Reflections on the Civil War (1865)	341
\$72	A Confederate Chaplain Recounts His Experience of the Revivals, 1863–1864 (January 1867)	342

ESSAYS

\$73	Religion, the Origins of Southern Nationalism, and the Coming of the Civil War <i>Mitchell Snay</i>	345
------	--	-----

\$74	Yankee Protestants and the Civil War: From Confusion to Crusade <i>James H. Moorhead</i>	350
\$75	Christian Soldiers: The Meaning of Revivalism in the Confederate Army <i>Drew Gilpin Faust</i>	362

Chapter 9: The Encounter between Religion and Science*How did religion in America respond to the "new" voice of science?***DOCUMENTS**

\$76	What is Darwinism? (1874)	376
\$77	Evolution (1884)	381
\$78	Evolution and Religion (1886)	384
\$79	Cardinal Gibbons on Religion and Science (1889)	387
\$80	The Religion of Evolution (1891)	390
\$81	A Catholic Reconciles Evolution and Church Dogma (1896)	394
\$82	The Final Effort of Theology (1896)	398

ESSAYS

\$83	The Ape in the Tree of Knowledge <i>Paul A. Carter</i>	404
\$84	The Intellectual Crisis of Belief <i>James Turner</i>	414
\$85	Between Americanism and Modernism: John Zahm and Theistic Evolution <i>R. Scott Appleby</i>	423

Chapter 10: Religion in Industrializing America*How did the factory and the city influence American religion?***DOCUMENTS**

\$86	Frances Willard and the Women's Christian Temperance Union (1883)	443
\$87	Cardinal Gibbons Defends the Knights of Labor (1887)	444
\$88	The Social Gospel as a Unitive Force (1890)	446
\$89	Pope Leo XIII's "Rerum Novarum" (1891)	449
\$90	In His Steps (1896)	452
\$91	The Race Problem in a Christian State (1906)	455
\$92	Christianity and the Social Crisis (1907)	459

ESSAYS

- §93 American Protestantism at a Crossroads
Susan Curtis 462
- §94 Catholic Revivalism: Conversion and Reform
Jay P. Dolan 472
- §95 "The Future Golden Day of the Race": Millennialism
and Black Americans in the Nadir, 1877–1901
Timothy E. Fulop 485

Chapter 11: Religion and American Empire-Building

How did religion influence the emergence of America as a world power?

DOCUMENTS

- §96 Reaching Alaska's Natives (1878) 501
- §97 A Missionary Declares China's Salvation (1883) 502
- §98 Our Country (1885) 505
- §99 A Catholic and Protestant Debate over
the Philippines (1899, 1903) 510
- §100 Boxer Opposition to Christian Missionaries and
Converts (1900) 512
- §101 The March of the Flag (1903) 512

ESSAYS

- §102 The Christian Conquest of the World, 1890–1920
Robert T. Handy 516
- §103 God's Mission and America's
William R. Hutchison 526
- §104 Women Missionaries and Cultural Conquest
Jane Hunter 536

Chapter 12: Fundamentalism vs. Modernism

What were the factors that divided Protestantism a century ago?

DOCUMENTS

- §105 The Bible and Modern Criticism (1910–1915) 550
- §106 Fundamentalism is Very Much Alive (1921) 553
- §107 Shall the Fundamentalists Win? (1922) 555
- §108 Christianity and Liberalism (1923) 557
- §109 Fundamentalism and Modernism: Two Religions (1924) 560

ESSAYS

- §110 Tremors of Controversy
George M. Marsden 562
- §111 Introduction to *Controversy in the Twenties: Fundamentalism,
Modernism, and Evolution*
Willard B. Gatewood, Jr. 569
- §112 The Fundamentalist-Modernist Controversy, 1918–1930
Ferenc M. Szasz 580

**Chapter 13: American Religious Ferment during
the Depression Era**

*How did American religion respond to the secular challenges of the
depression period?*

DOCUMENTS

- §113 The Promotion of True Religious Unity (1928) 594
- §114 Humanist Manifesto I (1933) 596
- §115 I Am a Rabbi's Wife (1934) 599
- §116 Niebuhr on the Social Struggle in America (1934) 601
- §117 Coughlin Attacks Roosevelt as Red (1936) 604
- §118 Must We Go to War? (1937) 605

ESSAYS

- §119 No Revival: In This Depression It is Different
Martin E. Marty 608
- §120 Transitions in Judaism: The Jewish American Woman
through the 1930s
Norma Fain Pratt 614
- §121 A Thriving Popular Movement
Joel A. Carpenter 623

Chapter 14: American Religion from World War II to Vietnam

*How would American religion deal with the pressures of the post-World
War II period?*

DOCUMENTS

- §122 The Uneasy Conscience of Modern Fundamentalism (1947) 639
- §123 Church and State in Tension: *School District of
Abington Township, Pennsylvania v. Schempp* (1963) 640
- §124 The Problem of State Religion (1951) 649
- §125 Shall Women be Ordained? (1955) 652

- §126 A Roman Catholic for President? (1960) 653
 §127 Excerpt from "The Council Opens" (1963) 656

ESSAYS

- §128 Frontiers of American Catholicism
Martin E. Marty 659
 §129 Winning Ordination for Women in Mainstream Protestant Churches
Barbara Brown Zikmund 666
 §130 The Rise of the 'New Evangelicalism': Shock and Adjustment
Mark Silk 675

Chapter 15: Religion and the Civil Rights Movement

How did religion in America contribute to the rise of the civil rights movement?

DOCUMENTS

- §131 The Ministry and Integration: "The Greatest Threat to Segregation" (1959) 693
 §132 The Mind of the Ku Klux Klan (1964) 696
 §133 Keep Your Eyes on the Prize (1964) 697
 §134 The Black Muslims as a Protest Movement (1964) 699
 §135 White Protestantism and the Negro (1965) 701
 §136 Martin Luther King Explains Nonviolent Resistance (1967) 703
 §137 The Black Messiah (1968) 705

ESSAYS

- §138 The Origins of Activism, 1950–1963
James F. Findlay, Jr. 710
 §139 The Civil Rights Movement and the Soul of America
Adam Fairclough 718
 §140 High Priest of the Anti-Civil Rights Movement:
 The Calling of Sam Bowers
Charles Marsh 731

Chapter 16: Religion and the Search for American Stability

How did American religion restructure at the close of the millennium?

DOCUMENTS

- §141 The Native American Church, Peyote, and
People v. Woody (1964) 742

- §142 Zen Buddhism in America (1976) 745
 §143 Homosexuality and the Church (1978) 746
 §144 The Black Churches: A New Agenda (1979) 748
 §145 A Mormon Response to the Equal Rights Amendment (1979) 753
 §146 Hispanics and the Catholic Church (1980) 755
 §147 Feminism and Traditional Judaism (1981) 757

ESSAYS

- §148 The Traumatic Years: American Religion and Culture
 in the '60s and '70s
Sydney E. Ahlstrom 760
 §149 Toward Religious Realignment
Robert Wuthnow 773
 §150 Confused and Helpless
Thomas C. Reeves 781
 §151 Claiming Muslim Space in America's Pluralism
Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad 785

Appendix: Additional Resources on American Religious History

797