THE TORTURE DEBATE IN AMERICA

Edited by

KAREN J. GREENBERG

CENTER ON LAW AND SECURITY
NEW YORK UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Acknowledgments ......................................................... page ix
List of Contributors ..................................................... xi

Introduction: The Rule of Law Finds Its Golem: Judicial Torture Then and Now ............................................. 1
Karen J. Greenberg

THE ISSUES

Torture: The Road to Abu Ghraib and Beyond ....................... 13
Panel Discussion with Burt Neuborne, Dana Priest, Anthony Lewis, Joshua Dratel, Major Michael (Dan) Mori, and Stephen Gillers

ESSAYS

Section One: Democracy, Terror and Torture

1 Liberalism, Torture, and the Ticking Bomb ....................... 35
   David Luban

2 How to Interrogate Terrorists ...................................... 84
   Heather MacDonald

3 Torture: Thinking about the Unthinkable ......................... 98
   Andrew C. McCarthy

4 The Curious Debate .................................................. 111
   Joshua Dratel

5 Is Defiance of Law a Proof of Success? Magical Thinking in the War on Terror ........................................... 118
   Stephen Holmes
6 Through a Mirror, Darkly: Applying the Geneva Conventions to “A New Kind of Warfare” ........................................... 136
Scott Horton

7 Speaking Law to Power: Lawyers and Torture ....................... 151
Richard B. Bilder and Detlev F. Vagts

8 Torture: An Interreligious Debate ..................................... 162
Joyce S. Dubensky and Rachel Lavery

Section Two: On the Matter of Failed States, The Geneva
Conventions, and International Law

9 Unwise Counsel: The War on Terrorism and the Criminal
Mistreatment of Detainees in U.S. Custody .............................. 183
David W. Bowker

10 Rethinking the Geneva Conventions ................................. 203
Lee A. Casey and David B. Rivkin, Jr.

11 If Afghanistan Has Failed, Then Afghanistan Is Dead:
“Failed States” and the Inappropriate Substitution of Legal
Conclusion for Political Description ...................................... 214
David D. Caron

12 War Not Crime .............................................................. 223
William H. Taft IV

Section Three: On Torture

13 Legal Ethics and Other Perspectives ................................. 229
Jeffrey K. Shapiro

14 Legal Ethics: A Debate .................................................... 236
Stephen Gillers

15 The Lawyers Know Sin: Complicity in Torture ..................... 241
Christopher Kutz

16 Renouncing Torture ....................................................... 247
Michael C. Dorf

17 Reconciling Torture with Democracy ................................... 253
Deborah Pearlstein

18 Great Nations and Torture .............................................. 256
M. Cherif Bassiouni
CONTENTS

Section Four: Looking Forward

19 Litigating Against Torture: The German Criminal Prosecution ........................................... 261
   Michael Ratner and Peter Weiss

20 Ugly Americans .................................................. 267
   Noah Feldman

RELEVANT DOCUMENTS

1 Taft-Haynes March 22, 2002 Memo Re: President’s Decision about Applicability of Geneva Conventions to al Qaeda and Taliban ...................................................... 283
   William Taft IV to William Haynes, March 22, 2002

2 Bybee-Gonzales August 1, 2002 Memo Re: Standards of Conduct for Interrogation, aka the “Torture Memo” ........ 317
   Jay Bybee to Alberto Gonzales, August 1, 2002

   Daniel Levin to James B. Comey, December 30, 2004

4 JAG Memos Re: Recommendations of the Working Group to Assess the Legal, Policy and Operational Issues Relating to Interrogation of Detainees Held by the U.S. Armed Forces in the War on Terrorism, February–March 2003. .......... 377
   February 5, 2003, Jack Rives, Major General USAF Memo
   February 6, 2003, Jack Rives Memo
   February 6, 2003, Michael Lohr Memo for the GCAF
   February 27, 2003, Kevin Sandkuhler Memo
   March 3, 2003, Thomas Romig Memo for GCAF

AFTERTHOUGHT

To the American People: Report upon the Illegal Practices of the United States Department of Justice .................................................. 395
   Zechariah Chafee, Felix Frankfurter, Ernst Freund,
   Roscoe Pound, et al., May 1920

Index ................................................................. 405