Structure and Function: A Guide to Three Major Structural-Functional Theories

Part 1: Approaches to the simplex clause

Christopher S. Butler
Honorary Professor, University of Wales Swansea

John Benjamins Publishing Company
Amsterdam/Philadelphia
# Table of contents

Acknowledgments  xiii  
Preface  xv  

## Chapter 1

### Functionalist approaches to language  
1.1 Introduction  1  
1.2 Language as communication  2  
1.3 The object of study  4  
1.4 Autonomy and functional explanation  5  
  1.4.1 The complexity of the concept of autonomy  5  
  1.4.2 Autonomy of syntax  6  
  1.4.3 Autonomy of grammar  8  
1.5 The nature of functional explanations  11  
1.6 Innateness and language acquisition  25  
1.7 Some further issues  27  
  1.7.1 The centrality of semantics/pragmatics  27  
  1.7.2 The importance of the cognitive dimension  27  
  1.7.3 The importance of discourse and its relationship with context  28  
1.8 Diversity within functionalism: some interim conclusions  28  

## Chapter 2

### Functionalism, structural functionalism and structural-functional grammars: An examination of six approaches to language  
2.1 Introduction  33  
2.2 ‘Generative functionalism’  34  
2.3 Dik’s Functional Grammar  36  
  2.3.1 Language as communication  36  
  2.3.2 Rejection of the autonomy of the grammar, in favour of functional explanation  36
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 The centrality of semantics and pragmatics, and the motivation</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of syntax</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4 The cognitive dimension</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.5 Text and its relationship with context</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.6 Typological considerations</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.7 Language acquisition</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.8 Summary</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Role and Reference Grammar</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Language as communication</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Rejection of the autonomy of the grammar, in favour of functional</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>explanation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 The centrality of semantics and pragmatics, and the motivation of</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>syntax</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4 The cognitive dimension</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.5 Text and its relationship with context</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.6 Typological considerations</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.7 Language acquisition</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.8 Summary</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Systemic Functional Grammar</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 Language as communication</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 The rejection of the autonomy of the grammar, in favour of functional</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>explanation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3 The centrality of semantics and pragmatics, and the motivation of</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>syntax</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.4 The cognitive dimension</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.5 Text and its relationship with context</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.6 Typological considerations</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.7 Language acquisition</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.8 Summary</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 West Coast Functionalism</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1 Language as communication</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2 The rejection of the autonomy of the grammar, in favour of functional</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>explanation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3 The centrality of semantics and pragmatics, and the motivation of</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>syntax</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.4 The cognitive dimension</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.5 Text and its relationship with context</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.6 Typological considerations</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.7 Language acquisition</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.8 Summary</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.7 Cognitive Grammar  
2.7.1 Language as communication  
2.7.2 The rejection of the autonomy of the grammar, in favour of functional explanation  
2.7.3 The centrality of semantics and pragmatics, and the motivation of syntax  
2.7.4 The cognitive dimension  
2.7.5 Text and its relationship with context  
2.7.6 Typological considerations  
2.7.7 Language acquisition  
2.7.8 Summary

2.8 Summary: towards a characterisation of structural-functional grammars

CHAPTER 3

The clause in Functional Grammar: An introduction

3.1 Underlying goals
3.1.1 Pragmatic adequacy
3.1.2 Psychological adequacy
3.1.3 Typological adequacy
3.1.4 A note on recent proposals in relation to standards of adequacy

3.2 The simplex clause in Dik's account of Functional Grammar
3.2.1 Within and outside the simple clause
3.2.2 Generating the underlying clause structure
3.2.3 Expression rules

3.3 Alternative proposals for the layering of underlying clause structure

3.4 Other work on expression rules

3.5 The Functional Lexematic Model

3.6 Modelling the natural language user in Functional Grammar and Functional Procedural Grammar

3.7 Two recent proposals
3.7.1 Recent proposals by Hengeveld
3.7.2 Mackenzie's Incremental Functional Grammar

3.8 Conclusion
3.8.1 The relationships between levels of linguistic patterning
3.8.2 Mechanisms for specifying clause structure
3.8.3 Layering
3.8.4 Syntactic, semantic and pragmatic functions
CHAPTER 4

The clause in Role and Reference Grammar: An introduction

4.1 Underlying goals 119
4.2 The components of the model for the simple clause 120
4.3 Problems with Immediate Constituent approaches 121
4.4 Core, nucleus, periphery 123
4.5 Formal representation of the Layered Structure of the Clause: the constituent projection 124
4.6 Pre- and post-core slots, detached positions 127
4.7 Operators 128
  4.7.1 Nuclear operators 129
  4.7.2 Core operators 129
  4.7.3 Clausal operators 129
  4.7.4 Scope and ordering of operators 130
  4.7.5 Integrating operator information with constituent information: the operator projection 131
4.8 Constructional templates 132
4.9 Information structure: the focus projection 133
4.10 States of affairs, the logical structure of the predicate, thematic relations and semantic macroroles 135
4.11 The semantics of adjuncts and operators 139
  4.11.1 Adpositional phrases 139
  4.11.2 Adverbs 140
  4.11.3 The semantic representation of operators 141
4.12 Syntactic relations in RRG 142
4.13 Linking semantic and syntactic representations 143
  4.13.1 Introduction to linking 143
  4.13.2 Linking from semantics to syntax 146
  4.13.3 Linking from syntax to semantics 148
4.14 Conclusion 148
  4.14.1 The relationships between levels of linguistic patterning 148
  4.14.2 Mechanisms for specifying clause structure 150
  4.14.3 Layering 150
  4.14.4 Syntactic, semantic and pragmatic functions 151

CHAPTER 5

The clause in Systemic Functional Grammar: An introduction

5.1 Underlying goals 154
  5.1.1 Language as social semiotic 154
  5.1.2 SFG as a theory of meaning 155
5.1.3 SFG as a theory of paradigmatic relations 156
5.1.4 SFG as a theory of text 156
5.1.5 SFG as an applicable theory 157
5.1.6 SFG and the cognitive dimension 158
5.1.7 SFG and typological concerns 160
5.2 The clause in Halliday's An Introduction to Functional Grammar 161
  5.2.1 Strata of description in IFG 161
  5.2.2 Unit, rank and constituency in IFG 162
  5.2.3 Function in IFG 166
  5.2.4 System and realisation in IFG 169
5.3 System as the fundamental category in SFG 169
5.4 Linking system and structure through realisation statements 174
5.5 Lexis as most delicate grammar 176
5.6 The upper stratum of semantics 178
5.7 Clause structure and meaning in the Cardiff grammar 184
5.8 A note on other approaches derived from SFG 190
  5.8.1 Communication Linguistics 190
  5.8.2 Semiotic Grammar 192
5.9 Conclusion 195
  5.9.1 The relationships between levels of linguistic patterning 195
  5.9.2 Mechanisms for specifying clause structure 196
  5.9.3 Layering 196
  5.9.4 The assignment of functions to constituents 197

CHAPTER 6

An interim critical comparison of approaches 199
6.1 Similarities and differences of overall approach 199
  6.1.1 Communicative function and the rejection of autonomy 199
  6.1.2 Typological considerations 200
  6.1.3 Applicability 201
  6.1.4 Cognitive considerations 201
  6.1.5 Methodological differences 202
6.2 Similarities and differences in relationships between levels of linguistic patterning 205
  6.2.1 Syntax, semantics and pragmatics 205
  6.2.2 Lexical phenomena and their relationship with the rest of the grammar 219
6.3 Similarities and differences in relation to syntagmatic and paradigmatic patterning 236
# Table of contents

6.4 Similarities and differences in layering 239
6.5 Conclusion 246

## Chapter 7

**The structure and meaning of phrasal units**

7.1 Introduction 251
7.2 The structure and meaning of noun phrases 251
   7.2.1 The noun phrase in Functional Grammar 252
   7.2.2 The noun phrase in Role and Reference Grammar 281
   7.2.3 The nominal group in Systemic Functional Grammar 293
7.3 The structure and meaning of adpositional phrases 317
   7.3.1 Adpositional phrases in Functional Grammar 317
   7.3.2 Adpositional phrases in Role and Reference Grammar 319
   7.3.3 Adpositional phrases in Systemic Functional Grammar 321
7.4 The structure and meaning of adverbial phrases 323
   7.4.1 Adverbs and adverbial phrases in Functional Grammar 323
   7.4.2 Adverbs and adverbial phrases in Role and Reference Grammar 325
   7.4.3 Adverbial groups in Systemic Functional Grammar 325
7.5 The 'verbal group' in Systemic Functional Grammar 325
   7.5.1 Structure 325
   7.5.2 System 328
7.6 Commonalities across phrasal units in Systemic Functional Grammar 328
7.7 Comparison of approaches 330
   7.7.1 Some salient points of comparison 330
   7.7.2 Analysis of an example under each approach 333

## Chapter 8

**Representing situations**

8.1 Representing situations in Functional Grammar 337
   8.1.1 A typology of ‘States of Affairs’ 337
   8.1.2 Arguments and satellites 342
   8.1.3 Nuclear semantic functions 343
   8.1.4 Types of satellite 343
   8.1.5 States of Affairs and conceptions of ‘reality’ 344
   8.1.6 States of Affairs and non-verbal predication 346
   8.1.7 A note on complementation in FG 347
8.2 Representing situations in Role and Reference Grammar 347
   8.2.1 Basic principles: a reminder 347
   8.2.2 States of Affairs and their linguistic representations 348
   8.2.3 The RRG typology of States of Affairs and their participants 350
Chapter 8

8.2.4 Arguments, adjuncts and argument-adjuncts 352
8.2.5 The lexical representation of verbs and their arguments 353
8.2.6 Semantic macroroles, valence and transitivity 366

Chapter 9

9.1 Introduction 449
9.2 Temporality, aspectuality, modality and polarity in Functional Grammar 451
  9.2.1 Tense and temporal satellites in FG 452
  9.2.2 Aspect in FG 456
  9.2.3 Modality in FG 463
  9.2.4 Polarity in FG 482
9.3 Temporality, aspectuality, modality and polarity in Role and Reference Grammar 484
9.4 Temporality, aspectuality, modality and polarity in Systemic Functional Grammar 486
  9.4.1 Halliday’s account 486
  9.4.2 The Cardiff grammar account 496
  9.4.3 Other systemically-oriented approaches to modality 498
9.5 Comparison of approaches 501
  9.5.1 Temporality and aspectuality 501
  9.5.2 Modality and polarity 506

References 511
Name index 535
Language index 541
Subject index 543