The Contested Past: Reading Canada's History

Selections from the Canadian Historical Review

Edited by Marlene Shore

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO PRESS
Toronto Buffalo London
Contents

PREFACE xiii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS xv

Introduction 3

PART ONE: NATION AND DIVERSITY, 1920–1939

Commentary 65

The Purpose of the Past
Some Vices of Clio (1926) 71
W.S. Wallace

The Beginnings of Historical Criticism in Canada:
A Retrospect, 1896–1936 (1936) 73
George Wrong

Past Historians and Present History in Canada (1941) 77
Gustave Lanctôt

Dollard des Ormeaux and the Fight at the Long Sault:
A Reinterpretation of Dollard’s Exploit (1932) 80
E.R. Adair
Contents

Was Dollard the Saviour of New France? (1932) 82
  Gustave Lanctôt

Women of New France (Three Rivers: 1651–63) (1940) 84
  Isabel Foulché-Delbosc

The Historian and Society (1933) 87
  Charles Beard

The Historian and Society (1933) 90
  George M. Wrong

Defining the Canadian Nation

Canada and the Imperial War Cabinet (1920) 93
  George M. Wrong

The Growth of Canadian National Feeling (1920) 99
  W.S. Wallace

Canada as a Vassal State (1920) 101
  Archibald MacMechan

Nationalism and Self-Determination (1921) 104
  W.P.M. Kennedy

Canada’s Relations with the Empire as Seen by the Toronto Globe, 1857–1867 (1929) 107
  F.H. Underhill

Some American Influences upon the Canadian Federation Movement (1924) 110
  R.G. Trotter

The Struggle for Financial Control in Lower Canada, 1818–1831 (1931) 112
  D.G. Creighton

Canadian Migration in the Forties (1928) 115
  Frances Morehouse

The Beginnings of Nova Scotian Politics, 1758–1766 (1935) 115
  W.S. MacNutt
The Environment and Natural Resources
The Assault on the Laurentian Barrier, 1850–1870 (1929) 118
A.R.M. Lower

Economic Factors in Canadian History (1923) 120
W.A. Mackintosh

The Extermination of the Buffalo in Western Canada (1934) 124
Frank G. Roe

Native–European Contact
Review of Harold A. Innis, The Fur Trade in Canada (1931) 127
W.A. Mackintosh

Social Revolution in Early Eastern Canada (1938) 129
Alfred Goldsworthy Bailey

PART TWO: WAR, CENTRALIZATION, AND REACTION, 1940–1965
Commentary 135

Society and War
The Social Sciences in the Post-War World (1941) 140
A.R.M. Lower

Response to Lower, 'The Social Sciences ...' (1941) 145
H.A. Innis

The Need for a Wider Study of Military History (1944) 147
A.E. Prince

In Defence of Political History (1950) 149
G.P. de T. Glazebrook

Redefining the Nation
Sir John Macdonald and Canadian Historians (1948) 152
D.G. Creighton
Content

Toronto vs Montreal: The Struggle for Financial Hegemony, 1860–1875 (1941) 156
D.C. Masters

Agriculture in the Red River Colony (1949) 159
W.L. Morton

The Origins of Public Broadcasting in Canada (1965) 162
Margaret Prang

Nationalism Challenged

Chapleau and the Conservative Party in Quebec (1956) 168
H. Blair Neatby and John T. Saywell

Review of Guy Fréguault, La Guerre de la Conquête (1958) 170
G.F.G. Stanley

The British Conquest: Canadian Social Scientists and the Fate of the Canadiens (1959) 171
Michel Brunet

Le Nationalisme canadien-français: De ses origines à l’insurrection de 1837 (1964) 176
Fernand Ouellet

The Concept of Social Class and the Interpretation of Canadian History (1965) 183
S.R. Mealing

The Lachine Strike of 1843 (1948) 186
H.C. Pentland

The National Policy, the Workingman, and Proletarian Ideas in Victorian Canada (1959) 189
F.W. Watt

PART THREE: THE RENEWAL OF DIVERSITY, 1966 TO THE PRESENT

Commentary 195
Contents

Limited Identities
The People of a Canadian City: 1851–2 (1972) 202
Michael Katz

Halifax Merchants and the Pursuit of Development,
1783–1850 (1978) 206
David Sutherland

Never the Twain Did Meet: Prairie–Maritime Relations,
1910–27 (1978) 208
Ernest R. Forbes

Industry and the Good Life around Idaho Peak (1985) 212
Cole Harris

Of Inequality and Interdependence in the Nova Scotian
Countryside, 1850–70 (1993) 217
Rusty Bitterman, Robert A. MacKinnon, and Graeme Wynn

Quebec and Nationalism
The Defeat of George-Etienne Cartier in Montreal-East
in 1872 (1970) 224
Brian J. Young

Religion and French-Canadian Mores in the Early
Nineteenth Century (1971) 227
Jean-Pierre Wallot

The Agricultural Crisis in Lower Canada, 1802–12: A Review of
a Controversy (1974) 232
T.J.A. LeGoff

Revisionism and the Search for a Normal Society: A Critique of
Recent Quebec Historical Writing (1992) 235
Ronald Rudin

Class Consciousness
Aid to the Civil Power: The Canadian Militia in Support of
Social Order, 1867–1914 (1970) 242
Desmond Morton
The Shiners’ War: Social Violence in the Ottawa Valley in the 1830s  
(1973) 247  
Michael S. Cross

Through the Prism of the Strike: Industrial Conflict in Southern Ontario, 1901–14 (1977) 253  
Craig Heron and Bryan D. Palmer

Kenneth McNaught

Paternalism and Politics: Sir Francis Bond Head, the Orange Order, and the Election of 1836 (1991) 262  
Sean T. Cadigan

The Return of Native History

Bruce G. Trigger

Amerindian Views of French Culture in the Seventeenth Century (1974) 269  
Cornelius Jaenen

The Historians’ Indian: Native Americans in Canadian Historical Writing from Charlevoix to the Present (1986) 273  
Bruce G. Trigger

Gender Politics

Eliane Leslau Silverman

The Skilled Emigrant and Her Kin: Gender, Culture, and Labour Recruitment (1987) 282  
Joy Parr

Gender History and Historical Practice (1995) 285  
Joy Parr
Contents

Cultural History

The Methodist Church and World War I (1968) 289
J.M. Bliss

The Social Gospel in Canada, 1890–1928 (1968) 292
Richard Allen

French Canada and the Prairie Frontier, 1870–1890 (1969) 295
A.I. Silver

Some Quebec Attitudes in an Age of Imperialism and Ideological Conflict (1976) 298
A.I. Silver

Keith Walden

PART FOUR: REFLECTIONS

Commentary 309

On Canadian History

Canadian History in Retrospect and Prospect: An Article to Mark the Completion of the First Twenty-Five Years of the Canadian Historical Review, 1920–1944 (1944) 312
George Brown and D.G. Creighton

Canadian History in the 1970s (1977) 315
H.J. Hanham

W.J. Eccles

Hugh M. Grant
Contents

The Second Time Around: Political Scientists Writing History (1986)  326  
  John English

Where to Begin and How: Narrative Openings in Donald Creighton’s Historiography (1991)  328  
  Kenneth C. Dewar

  Allan Greer

INDEX  337