IN THE MATTER OF

J. Robert Oppenheimer

THE SECURITY CLEARANCE HEARING

Edited by Richard Polenberg

Cornell University Press Ithaca and London
CONTENTS

List of Illustrations xi
Preface xiii

Introduction: “All the Evil of the Times” xv
The Setting and the Participants xxix

PART I THE HEARING

Monday, April 12 3
KENNETH D. NICHOLS: “The Commission has no other recourse . . . but to suspend your clearance until the matter has been resolved” 3
J. ROBERT OPPENHEIMER: “The items of so-called derogatory information . . . cannot be fairly understood except in the context of my life and my work” 10
GORDON GRAY: “An inquiry and not . . . a trial” 29
J. ROBERT OPPENHEIMER: “Exploding one of these things as a firecracker over a desert” 30

Tuesday, April 13 35
GORDON GRAY: “Strictly confidential” 35
GORDON GRAY: “Those who are not cleared . . . will necessarily be excused” 38
J. ROBERT OPPENHEIMER: “When you see something that is technically sweet, you go ahead and do it” 41
Wednesday, April 14

J. Robert Oppenheimer: “Both an older brother and in some ways perhaps . . . a father” 49
J. Robert Oppenheimer: “In the case of a brother you don’t make tests” 53
J. Robert Oppenheimer: “Then I invented a cock-and-bull story” 61
Roger Robb: “You spent the night with her, didn’t you?” 72

Thursday, April 15

General Leslie R. Groves: “I would not clear Dr. Oppenheimer today” 75
J. Robert Oppenheimer: “One can be mistaken about anything” 81
Roger Robb and J. Robert Oppenheimer: “Your memory is not refreshed by what I read you?” “No, on the whole it is confused by it” 85
J. Robert Oppenheimer: “Of the known leakages of information, Fuchs is by far the most grave” 93

Friday, April 16

J. Robert Oppenheimer: “I would have done anything that I was asked to do . . . if I had thought it was technically feasible” 94
J. Robert Oppenheimer: “I am not sure the miserable thing will work . . . [but it] would be folly to oppose the exploration of this weapon” 99
J. Robert Oppenheimer: “The program in 1951 was technically so sweet that you could not argue about that” 108
John Lansdale: “We kept him under surveillance whenever he left the project. We opened his mail. We did all sorts of nasty things” 111

Monday, April 19

Gordon Dean: “A very human man, a sensitive man, . . . a man of complete integrity” 120
Hans A. Bethe: “Only . . . when the bomb dropped on Japan, . . . did we start thinking about the moral implications” 126

Tuesday, April 20

George F. Kennan: “It is only the great sinners who become the great saints” 139
James B. Conant: “Dr. Oppenheimer’s appraisal of the Russian menace . . . was hard headed, realistic, and thoroughly anti-Soviet” 148
ENRICO FERMI: “My opinion . . . was that one should try to outlaw the thing before it was born” 153

DAVID E. LILIENTHAL: “Here is a man of good character, integrity, and of loyalty to his country” 156

Wednesday, April 21

ISIDOR I. RABI: “He is a consultant, and if you don’t want to consult the guy, you don’t consult him period. . . . We have an A-bomb . . . * * * and what more do you want, mermaids?” 166

Thursday, April 22

NORRIS E. BRADBURY: “A scientist wants to know. He wants to know correctly and truthfully and precisely” 179

HARTLEY ROWE: “I don’t like to see women and children killed wholesale because the male element of the human race are so stupid that they can’t . . . keep out of war” 185

LEE A. DUBRIDGE: “Dr. Oppenheimer . . . was a natural and respected and at all times a loved leader” 188

Friday, April 23

ROGER ROBB: “Mr. Chairman, unless ordered to do so by the board, we shall not disclose to Mr. Garrison in advance the names of the witnesses we contemplate calling” 194

VANNEVAR BUSH: “Here is a man who is being pilloried because he had strong opinions, and had the temerity to express them” 199

Monday, April 26

KATHERINE OPPENHEIMER: “I was emotionally involved in the Spanish cause” 207

CHARLES C. LAURITSEN: “I think there is a great deal of difference between being a Communist in 1935 and being a Communist in 1954” 216

JERROLD R. ZACHARIAS: “I am afraid that wars are evil. . . . But the question of morality . . . you do not have time for when you are trying to think how you fight” 221

ROBERT F. BACHER: “Dr. Oppenheimer’s individual contribution was the greatest of any member of the General Advisory Committee” 225

Tuesday, April 27

JOHN VON NEUMANN: “All of us in the war years . . . got suddenly in contact with a universe we had not known before . . . ; we suddenly were dealing with something with which one could blow up the world” 228
WENDELL M. LATIMER: "I kept turning over in my mind . . . what was in Oppenheimer that gave him such tremendous power over these men" 237

Wednesday, April 28
ROSCOE C. WILSON: "My feeling is that the masters in the Kremlin cannot risk the loss of their base. This base is vulnerable only to attack by air power" 244
KENNETH S. PITZER: "I would not rate Dr. Oppenheimer's importance in this field very high for the rather personal reason . . . that I have disagreed with a good many of his important positions" 249
EDWARD TELLER: "I feel that I would like to see the vital interests of this country in hands which I understand better, and therefore trust more" 252

Thursday, April 29
JOHN J. MCCLOY: "He used the graphic expression like two scorpions in a bottle, that each could destroy the other" 265
DAVID TRESESEL GRIGGS: "ZORC are the letters applied by a member of this group to the four people: Z is for Zacharias, O for Oppenheimer, R for Rabi, and C for Charlie Lauritsen" 271
LUIJS W. ALVAREZ: "I realized that the program that we were planning to start was not one that the top man in the scientific department of the AEC wanted to have done" 276

Friday, April 30
LLOYD K. GARRISON: "The adversary process which we seem to be engaged in should be carried out to the fullest extent" 289
BORIS T. PASH: "Dr. Oppenheimer knew the name of the man, and it was his duty to report it to me" 291
WILLIAM L. BORDEN: "More probably than not, J. Robert Oppenheimer is an agent of the Soviet Union" 298

Monday, May 3
J. ROBERT OPPENHEIMER: "I wish I could explain to you better why I falsified and fabricated" 311

Tuesday, May 4
KATHERINE OPPENHEIMER: "I left the Communist Party. I did not leave my past, the friendships, just like that" 327

Wednesday, May 5
J. ROBERT OPPENHEIMER: "I felt, perhaps quite strongly, that having played an active part in promoting a revolution in warfare, I needed to be as responsible as I could with regard to what came of this revolution" 333
Thursday, May 6
LLOYD K. GARRISON: "His life has been an open book" 346

PART II  THE DECISION

The Personnel Security Board Reports, May 27 355
GORDON GRAY AND THOMAS A. MORGAN: "We have . . . been unable to arrive at the conclusion that it would be clearly consistent with the security interests of the United States to reinstate Dr. Oppenheimer's clearance" 355
WARD V. EVANS: "Our failure to clear Dr. Oppenheimer will be a black mark on the escutcheon of our country" 362

Lloyd K. Garrison's Reply to Kenneth D. Nichols, June 1 366
LLOYD K. GARRISON: "How can this be?" 366

Kenneth D. Nichols's Recommendations to the AEC, June 12 371
KENNETH D. NICHOLS: "I have given consideration to the nature of the cold war . . . and the horrible prospects of hydrogen bomb warfare if all-out war should be forced upon us" 371

Publishing the Transcript, June 13–15 376

Decision and Opinions of the AEC, June 29 378
LEWIS L. STRAUSS: "We find Dr. Oppenheimer is not entitled to the continued confidence of the Government . . . because of the proof of fundamental defects in his 'character'" 378
EUGENE M. ZUCKERT: "This matter certainly reflects the difficult times in which we live" 383
JOSEPH CAMPBELL: "The General Manager has arrived at the only possible conclusion available to a reasonable and prudent man" 385
THOMAS E. MURRAY: "Dr. Oppenheimer failed the test. . . . He was disloyal" 386
HENRY DE WOLF SMYTH: "There is no indication in the entire record that Dr. Oppenheimer has ever divulged any secret information" 388

Conclusion: "An Abuse of the Power of the State" 395

Suggested Reading 399
Index 401