Environmental Protection by Means of International Liability Law

by

Prof. Dr. Rüdiger Wolfrum
Dr. Christine Langenfeld

in cooperation with

Dr. Ilona Renke
Betsy Baker Röben (J.D., LL.M.)
Christian Ulrich Wolf

Translated from the German by Terence J. Oliver,
in cooperation with Betsy Baker Röben

Max-Planck-Institute for Comparative Public Law and
International Law, Heidelberg
Contents

List of Important Abbreviations ........................................................................................................xvii

Part 1: Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1

Part 2: Résumé of Environmental Liability Provisions in International Law (Langenfeld) ...................................................... 3

I. International agreements/drafts ................................................................................................. 3

  1. Transboundary air pollution and pollution of the Earth’s atmosphere ............... 3

     1.1. Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution ......................... 3

     1.2. Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer / Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer ................. 4

     1.3. Framework Convention on Climate Change ............................................. 5

  2. Liability in connection with marine pollution ................................................................. 5

     2.1. Agreements on liability for damage due to the carriage of oil and other hazardous substances ........................................... 5

         2.1.1. Oil pollution ......................................................................................... 5


             2.1.1.2. Excursus: Voluntary liability agreements for compensation of oil pollution damage ........................................ 19

             2.1.1.3. International Convention relating to Intervention on the High Seas in Cases of Oil Pollution Casualties ..................... 21

             2.1.1.4. Conventions on precautions, control and cooperation in cases of oil pollution .................................................. 23

         2.1.2. International Convention on Liability and Compensation for Damage in Connection with the Carriage of Hazardous and Noxious Substances by Sea (HNS Convention) ........................................ 23

     2.2. Marine pollution resulting from exploitation of the seabed ......................... 30

         2.2.1. International Convention on Civil Liability for Oil Pollution Damage resulting from Exploration for and Exploitation of Seabed Mineral Resources .................................................. 30
2.2.2. Agreement for Cooperation relating to the Marine Environment

2.2.3. Liability regime for deep-sea mining under the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS)

2.3. Agreements under international law for the protection of the marine environment, with a programmatic liability clause or general criminal law clause, the implementation of which is the responsibility of the contracting states

2.3.1. Agreements for the protection of the marine environment with a programmatic liability clause

2.3.1.1. Agreements for the protection of the marine environment with a programmatic liability clause, the contents of which are to be specified in greater detail by subsequent international conventions

2.3.1.2. Conventions for the protection of the marine environment, with a liability clause that relates to the harmonisation and further development of national liability provisions

2.3.2. Conventions on the protection of the marine environment containing a general criminal law clause, the implementation of which is the responsibility of each of the contracting states

2.4. UN Convention on the Law of the Sea

2.5. International Convention on Salvage

3. Water conservation (fresh water)

3.1. Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes

3.2. ILC Convention on the Law of the Non-Navigational Uses of International Water Courses

3.3. Guidelines of the ECE (Economic Commission for Europe) Task Force on Responsibility and Liability Regarding Transboundary Water Pollution

3.4. Agreement of 10 June 1922 between Germany and Denmark regulating the Water and Dyke Situation at their Common Border

3.5. Treaty Concerning the River Plate and Its Maritime Limits

4. Dangerous substances and activities
4.1. Convention on Civil Liability for Damage Resulting from Activities Dangerous to the Environment ................................................................. 50
4.2. The Nordic Environmental Protection Convention ................................... 57
4.3. North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation ................. 59
4.4. Convention on Civil Liability for Damage caused during Carriage of Dangerous Goods by Road, Rail and Inland Navigation Vessels (CRTD Convention) ................................................................. 60
4.5. Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context .................................................................................. 64
4.6. Convention on Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents ............. 64

5. Waste transport and waste management ..................................................... 65
5.1. Draft Articles of a Protocol on Liability and Compensation for Damage Resulting from the Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and Their Disposal ................................................................. 65
5.2. Convention of the Ban of the Import into Africa and the Control of Transboundary Movement and Management of Hazardous Wastes within Africa (Bamako Convention) / Convention to Ban the Importation into Forum Island Countries of Hazardous and Radioactive Wastes and to Control the Transboundary Movement and Management of Hazardous Wastes Within the South-Pacific Region (Waigani Convention) ............ 69
5.3. Bilateral agreements ................................................................................. 70

5.3.1. Agreement between the Government of Canada and the Government of the United States of America concerning the Transboundary Movement of Hazardous Wastes ........................................................................... 70
5.3.2. Agreement between the Government of the United States of America and the Government of Malaysia concerning the Transboundary Movement of Hazardous Wastes from Malaysia to the United States ................................................................................. 70
5.3.3. Agreement of Cooperation Between the United States of America and the United Mexican States Regarding the Transboundary Shipment of Hazardous Wastes and Hazardous Substances ................................................................................. 71

6. Transboundary nuclear pollution .............................................................. 71
6.1. Convention on Third Party Liability in the Field of Nuclear Energy (Paris Convention) / Convention Supplementary to the Paris Convention (Brussels Convention) ................................................................................ 72

6.2. The Vienna conventions on liability for nuclear damage ................................ 80
   6.2.1. Vienna Convention on Civil Liability for Nuclear Damage .................... 80
   6.2.2. Protocol to Amend the Vienna Convention .................................................. 82
   6.2.3. Convention on Supplementary Compensation for Nuclear Damage .............. 85

6.3. Agreement between the Federal Republic of Germany and the Swiss Confederation on Liability to Third Parties in the Field of Nuclear Energy .................................................................................................................. 86


6.5. Convention Relating to Civil Liability in the Field of Maritime Carriage of Nuclear Material ................................................................................................................................. 88

7. The Antarctic ........................................................................................................ 89
   7.2. Protocol on Environmental Protection to the Antarctic Treaty ...................... 92
   7.3. Negotiations on an environmental liability regime for the Antarctic – the Chairman’s Eighth Offering on an Annex on Environmental Liability ................................................. 93

8. Space ...................................................................................................................... 97
   8.2. ILA Draft Instrument on the Protection of the Environment from Damage Caused by Space Debris ............................................................................................... 100
   8.3. Agreement Governing the Activities of States on the Moon and Other Celestial Bodies ..................................................................................................................... 102

II. The Work of the International Law Commission (ILC) / ILC Draft on International Liability for Injurious Consequences Arising out of Acts Not Prohibited by International Law ................................................................. 103
III. Interim conclusion .......................................................................................................... 110

IV. Responsibility and Liability for Environmental Harm under Public International Law .................................................................................................................. 112

1. Preliminary remark ........................................................................................................... 112

2. Transboundary environmental harm .................................................................................. 114

3. Validity of the principle of responsibility under international law for transboundary environmental harm .................................................................................. 116

4. Preconditions for responsibility for transboundary environmental harm .. 119

4.1. Breach of duty ................................................................................................................ 119

4.2. Content of breach of duty ............................................................................................. 121

4.3. Responsibility for the acts of private persons ................................................................. 122

4.4. Disapproved result ........................................................................................................ 123

4.5. Circumstances precluding wrongfulness .................................................................... 123

5. Legal consequences of responsibility for transboundary environmental harm .... 125

6. Enforcement .................................................................................................................... 126

Part 3: Liability for Environmental Damage in European Community Law (Renke) ............................................................................................................................. 127

I. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 127

II. Development of environmental liability law in the European Community ... 129

III. Liability rules under Community legislation de lege lata ........................................... 139

1. The Product Liability Directive ......................................................................................... 139

? Member states' liability for transboundary environmental harm as a general legal principle of Community law? ........................................................... 143

IV. Liability rules under Community legislation de lege ferenda ................................... 149

1. Proposed Directive on civil liability for damage caused by waste ......................... 149


V. Outlook for the future: The EC Commission Green Paper on Remedyng Environmental Damage ......................................................................................... 158

VI. Final assessment ............................................................................................................ 163
I. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 168

II. Individual elements of liability de lege lata .................................................................. 173

1. Private environmental liability law .............................................................................. 173

1.1. Fault-based liability under Section 823 ff. Civil Code ............................................. 173

1.1.1. Liability pursuant to Section 823 para. 1 Civil Code ............................................. 175

1.1.2. Liability pursuant to Section 823 para. 2 Civil Code ............................................. 179

1.2. Strict Liability ........................................................................................................... 181

1.2.1. Liability under the Environmental Liability Act (UHG) ....................................... 181

1.2.2. Liability under Section 22 of the Water Resources Management Act (Wasserhaushaltsgesetz – WHG) ............................................................................. 187

1.2.3. Liability under Sections 32 ff. Genetic Engineering Act (Gentechnikgesetz – GenTG) ...................................................................................................................... 190

1.2.4. Liability under Sections 25 ff. of the Nuclear Energy Act (Atomgesetz – AtG) ................................................................................................................................. 194

1.2.5. Liability under Section 1 of the Product Liability Act (Produkthaftungsgesetz – ProdHaftG) ............................................................................................................. 197

1.2.6. Liability under Section 7 of the Road Traffic Act (Straßenverkehrsrgesetz – StVG) ......................................................................................................................... 199

1.2.7. Liability under Sections 35 – 57 of the Air Traffic Act (Luftverkehrsrgesetz – LuftVG) ..................................................................................................................... 202

1.2.8. The law of mining damage ....................................................................................... 205

1.3. Beneficial impairment liability (Aufopferungshaftung) ............................................. 208

1.3.1. Liability under Section 906 para. 2 sentence 2 Civil Code ..................................... 208

1.3.2. Liability under Section 14 sentence 2 Federal Immission Control Act, Section 11 Air Traffic Act, Section 7 para. 6 Nuclear Energy Act, Section 23 sentence 2 Genetic Engineering Act ............................................. 214

1.3.3. General claim to compensation for beneficial impairment .................................... 215

2. Compensation for environmental damage under public law – distinction from private environmental liability law ................................................................................. 217

3. Public law liability ......................................................................................................... 219
3.1. Official liability under Article 34 sentence 1 Basic Law (Grundgesetz – GG) in conjunction with Section 839 Civil Code ............................................................. 220

3.2. Claims arising from expropriation and expropriation-like encroachments .......................................................................................................................... 221

3.3. Claims to compensation under Section 74 para. 2 sentence 3 and Section 75 para. 2 sentence 4 Administrative Procedure Act (Verwaltungsvorschriften – VwVfG) .................................................................................. 223

3.4. Official liability founded on Section 14 sentence 2 Federal Immission Control Act (Bundes-Immissionsschutzgesetz – BImSchG) ................................................ 226

4. The polluter’s responsibility under the law of public order ........................................ 226

5. Compensation for ecological damage (direct environmental protection) ........ 229

5.1. Section 16 para. 1 Environmental Liability Act and Section 7 sentence 1 Genetic Engineering Act ................................................................................................. 230

5.2. Encroachment rules under nature conservation law ................................................. 232

5.3. Compensation for ecological damage through “conducting another's affairs without mandate” (Geschäftsführung ohne Auftrag) under public law ........................................ 233

III. Provisions under legislation de lege ferenda .................................................................. 234

1. Legislation drafted by Hesse, North-Rhine/Westphalia and the parliamentary Greens .............................................................................................................. 234

2. Draft of an Environmental Code – General Part (UGB-AT) ........................................ 237

2.1. The Professors’ Draft .................................................................................................. 237

2.2. Draft of the Expert Commission ................................................................................ 240

3. Liability for cumulative and remote damage (Summations- und Distanzschäden) .......................................................................................................................... 244

IV. Analysis and assessment ............................................................................................... 246

1. Structural features of present-day German environmental liability law ................. 246

2. Analysis and assessment of the legal situation ............................................................. 247

Part 5: Environmental Liability Legislation in the United States (Röben) .......................... 261

Strict liability for environmental damage under US federal laws .................................. 261

1. The “Clean Water Act” (Federal Water Pollution Control Act of 1972) ................. 265

1.1. The CWA as a model for US environmental liability laws ....................................... 266
1.2. Liability standards in the CWA ................................................................. 267
1.3. Potentially responsible parties and proper defendant status ................. 268
1.4. Environmental damage and trustees ...................................................... 268
  1.4.1. Natural Resource Damages ............................................................. 269
    1.4.1.1. Reimbursement of (appropriate) restoration measures .......... 269
    1.4.1.2. Eligibility of residual damage for compensation ............... 270
  1.4.2. Natural resources trustees ......................................................... 271
1.5. Funds .................................................................................................. 272
1.6. Compulsory insurance ....................................................................... 273
1.7. National Contingency Plan ................................................................. 274
1.8. Excursus: Prevention ........................................................................ 274
1.9. The CWA and the international oil liability system ............................. 277
2. CERCLA and the "Superfund" ................................................................. 280
  2.1. The common origins of CERCLA and OPA ..................................... 280
  2.2. CERCLA's mechanisms: Response, Compensation, Liability .......... 281
    2.2.1. Response actions .................................................................... 281
      2.2.1.1. National Contingency Plan ................................................. 283
      2.2.1.2. Hazardous substances covered: Information and analysis .... 284
    2.2.2. Compensation: The Superfund ................................................. 286
    2.2.3. Liability .................................................................................... 288
  2.3. Potentially responsible parties and proper defendant status ............. 289
  2.4. Ecological damage and the assessment of natural resource damages .. 290
    2.4.1. The concept of natural resource damage and the scope of liabil-
           ity .................................................................................................. 290
    2.4.2. Excursus: Assessment of natural resource damages ............... 292
  2.5. Damage threshold ........................................................................... 297
  2.6. Causation and contribution ............................................................... 297
  2.7. Liability exclusion elements ............................................................ 301
  2.8. Liability limit and compulsory insurance ....................................... 301
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.8.1.</td>
<td>Liability limit and punitive damages</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.1.1.</td>
<td>Liability limit</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.1.2.</td>
<td>Punitive damages</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.2.</td>
<td>Compulsory insurance</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9.</td>
<td>Information rights / Status of environmental protection associations / Proper plaintiff status</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10.</td>
<td>Excursus: Criticism of CERCLA</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>The Oil Pollution Act of 1990 (OPA)</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.</td>
<td>Liability standards</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.</td>
<td>Responsible parties and proper defendant status</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.</td>
<td>Concept of damages</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.</td>
<td>Natural Resource Damages and Trustees</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.</td>
<td>Assessment of natural resource damages under OPA</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.</td>
<td>Damage threshold</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.</td>
<td>Liability exclusion elements</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.</td>
<td>Liability limit and compulsory insurance</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1.</td>
<td>Liability limit</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2.</td>
<td>Compulsory insurance</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.</td>
<td>Retroactive effect</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.</td>
<td>Fund</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.</td>
<td>Prevention: The Prince William Sound provision and other safety provisions in OPA</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>The Trans-Alaska Pipeline Authorization Act (TAPAA)</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.</td>
<td>Liability principles</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.</td>
<td>Responsible parties / Proper defendant status</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.</td>
<td>Concept of damages</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>The Marine Protection, Research and Sanctuaries Act (MPRSA)</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.</td>
<td>Liability standards</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.</td>
<td>Concept of damages</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Natural resource damage and environmental liability in US case law</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Earlier cases: non-recognition of natural resource damage ............................................ 327
2. The SS Zoe Colocotroni case ..................................................................................... 329
3. The Exxon Valdez case .............................................................................................. 331

III. Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 334

Part 6: Transboundary Environmental Damage in Private International Law and International Civil Procedure (Wolf) .......................................................... 337

I. Introduction ............................................................................................................. 337

II. Jurisdiction ............................................................................................................ 337

III. International jurisdiction ..................................................................................... 341

1. International jurisdiction regulated by international treaty ........................................ 341

1.1. International jurisdiction under specific conventions ........................................... 342

1.2. International jurisdiction under Brussels Convention and Lugano Convention .......................................................... 345

1.2.1. General jurisdiction under Art. 2 Brussels/Lugano Conventions 346

1.2.2. Exclusive jurisdiction under Art. 16 No. 1 (a) Brussels/Lugano Conventions 347

1.2.3. Concurrent jurisdiction under Art. 5 No. 3 Brussels/Lugano Conventions 349

1.2.4. Concurrent jurisdiction under Art. 5 No. 4 Brussels/Lugano Conventions 352

1.3. International jurisdiction under autonomous international civil procedure law .................................................................................. 353

1.3.1. International jurisdiction under Sections 12, 13, 17 Code of Civil Procedure 353

1.3.2. International jurisdiction under Section 24 Code of Civil Procedure 354

1.3.3. International jurisdiction under Section 32 Code of Civil Procedure 355

1.3.4. International jurisdiction under Section 32a Code of Civil Procedure 356

1.3.5. International jurisdiction under Section 23 sentence 1, first alternative, Code of Civil Procedure 358
1.4. Forum shopping ......................................................... 361
1.5. Multiple parties ....................................................... 362
  1.5.1. Autonomous international law of civil procedure .......... 362
  1.5.2. Brussels Convention and Lugano Convention .......... 362
1.6. Capacity to be a party and capacity to bring an action ...... 363

IV. Applicable law .......................................................... 364
1. Choice of law rules in agreements under international law .... 364
2. Autonomous rules on choice of law .................................. 366
   2.1. Special conflict rule of Section 40 para. 1 Nuclear Energy Act
        (Atomgesetz – AtomG) ............................................. 366
   2.2. General choice of law rules ...................................... 367
       2.2.1. Choice of law rules in the law of torts ................. 367
       2.2.2. Coverage of the applicable law of torts ............ 372
2.3. Effect of public law authorisations ................................ 376
       2.3.1. Preclusive effect ............................................ 376
       2.3.2. Unlawfulness and negligence ................................ 381

V. Evidence issues .......................................................... 381

VI. Recognition and enforcement ........................................ 383
1. Recognition ............................................................... 383
   1.1. Recognition under specific conventions .................... 384
   1.2. Recognition under Brussels Convention and Lugano Convention .... 386
   1.3. Recognition under autonomous German law ............... 388
2. Enforcement ............................................................... 390

VII. Final assessment ...................................................... 391

Part 7: Summary and Assessment ......................................... 392
1. Purpose of liability for environmental damage .................. 392
2. Responsibility / Liability .............................................. 392
3. Concept of damage ..................................................... 392
   3.1. Personal injury and loss of or damage to property ......... 393