# Contents

1 Introduction .......................... 1
  1.1 The problem defined ............... 1
  1.2 The current state of the debate .... 3
  1.3 The structure of this work ........ 6
  1.4 Historical reflections ............. 10
  1.5 Relationship to *AR&L* ............ 13
  1.6 A note on style and substance ..... 14

2 The Realism Debate .................. 15
  2.1 The central role of truth .......... 15
  2.2 Five important contentions ......... 19
  2.3 Key theses ........................ 27
  2.4 Superassertibility ................. 42
  2.5 Semantic anti-realism ............. 45
  2.6 A crescendo of concerns .......... 50
  2.7 Remarks on natural deduction ..... 55
    2.7.1 Arguments and natural deductions 56
    2.7.2 Accumulating arguments ........ 56
    2.7.3 Rules of inference ............. 58
    2.7.4 *Reductio ad absurdum* .......... 59
    2.7.5 Regimenting philosophical arguments 60
    2.7.6 A plea for tolerance in matters logical 61

3 Irrealism ........................... 63
  3.1 A survey of various kinds of irrealism .... 63
  3.2 Non-factualist irrealism v. error-theory .... 67
  3.3 Notational preliminaries ........... 75
  3.4 A *reductio* of semantic irrealism? .... 77
### 3.5 Isolating the basic steps

- **3.5.1 The first basic step**
- **3.5.2 The second basic step**
- **3.5.3 The third basic step**

### 3.6 Some simple arguments using the basic steps

### 3.7 Evaluating the steps

- **3.7.1 A stratificationist objection to Boghossian will not work**
- **3.7.2 Objection to step (I)**
- **3.7.3 Objection to step (II) from a projectivist’s point of view**

### 3.8 Conclusion

### 4 Against Meaning Scepticism

- **4.1 The impact of scepticism about meaning. The stress between materialist metaphysics and analytic intuition**
- **4.2 Theses about content, and some orthogonal issues**
- **4.3 What semantic determination thesis does the Kripkean sceptic try to undermine?**
- **4.4 On past and future applications of rules**
- **4.5 The sceptic is a non-factualist**
- **4.6 Kripke’s dialectic of reinterpretation**
- **4.7 Uniformity of reinterpretation requires globality**
- **4.8 Kripkean scepticism compared with Quinean indeterminacy: the new dogma of post-empiricism**
- **4.9 Anti-sceptical responses emphasizing the first-person case**
- **4.10 On Goodman’s Paradox**
- **4.11 The proper way to meet the sceptical challenge**
- **4.12 A parable**
- **4.13 From dispositional facts to normativity of meaning**
  - **4.13.1 On going wrong: competence v. performance**
  - **4.13.2 Alleged problems for a dispositional account: the argument from finitude**
  - **4.13.3 Alleged problems for a dispositional account: the argument from error**

### 5 Avoiding Strict Finitism

- **5.1 Knowability in principle**
- **5.2 The strict finitist’s worry**
- **5.3 Recognitional capacities and compositionality**
- **5.4 Feasible verifiability**
CONTENTS

8.3 On wondering whether ........................................ 252
8.4 On knowing every truth ........................................ 259
8.5 Diagnosis of the underlying problem .......................... 266
8.6 Cartesian contents, and our proposed solution .............. 272
8.7 The failure of the reconstrual strategy ...................... 276
8.8 Taking stock .................................................... 278

9 Analyticity and Syntheticity ...................................... 281
  9.1 Logic and analyticity .......................................... 281
  9.2 A brief history of the two distinctions ..................... 282
  9.3 The impact of Gödel's first incompleteness theorem ....... 290
  9.4 An alternative view ............................................ 295
  9.5 The wider logic of number ..................................... 297
  9.6 Necessary existents ............................................ 299
  9.7 The dogma of existence ...................................... 303

10 Finding the right logic .......................................... 305
  10.1 On rational advocacy of reform ............................. 305
  10.2 Systematicity, immediacy, separability and harmony .... 308
  10.3 Epistemic gain in logic ...................................... 322
  10.4 The maxim of narrow analysis ................................ 325
  10.5 Non-forfeiture of epistemic gain ............................ 328
     10.5.1 The Sub-sequent Constraint ............................ 329
     10.5.2 Truth-preservation is not enough ..................... 330
  10.6 The Principle of Harmony .................................... 332
  10.7 The Principle of Extraction for natural deduction systems 334
  10.8 The Anti-Dilution Principle for sequent systems ........ 335
  10.9 Relevance ..................................................... 337
     10.9.1 Uniquely determining rules for the logical operators 338
     10.9.2 Intuitionistic Relevant Logic .......................... 343
     10.9.3 Classical Relevant Logic ................................ 344
     10.9.4 Benefits for computational logic ...................... 346
     10.9.5 On choosing the right relevant logic: the method sum-
              marized .................................................. 346
     10.9.6 Prosecuting our principles further: a precondition on 
              rule applications ........................................ 350
CONTENTS

11 Cognitive Significance Regained ............................. 355
11.1 Re-evaluating the problem of cognitive significance ........ 355
11.2 Conditions of adequacy on a criterion of cognitive significance 360
   11.2.1 Sentences are cognitively significant only within the context of a theory that makes them so .......... 360
   11.2.2 Basic sentences .................................................. 361
   11.2.3 Metalogical neutrality ......................................... 362
   11.2.4 Inductive levels, new vocabulary and extension ....... 363
   11.2.5 Verifiability and falsifiability ............................. 365
   11.2.6 The principle of composition, or molecularity .......... 366
   11.2.7 Constrained extension: higher-level hypotheses ....... 366
   11.2.8 A remark on significance via compounding .............. 369
   11.2.9 Hempel's compositionality condition .................... 370
   11.2.10 The first-order case ...................................... 372
   11.2.11 The invariance of non-significance under reformulation 373
11.3 The formal theory .................................................. 374
   11.3.1 Extension ....................................................... 374
   11.3.2 How sentences depend on the atomic facts within a model for their truth or falsity ................ 382
   11.3.3 Some inductive definitions .................................. 388
   11.3.4 Main results ................................................... 390
11.4 Comparison with Carnap's account ............................ 393
11.5 Blocking Church-Ullian collapses............................ 399

12 Defeasibility and Constructive Falsifiability ............. 403
12.1 Rationalism and relativism ..................................... 403
12.2 On defeasible empirical claims ............................... 406
12.3 Refutation of empirical theories .............................. 414
12.4 Normal forms for disproofs .................................... 422
12.5 Validity of arguments .......................................... 425
12.6 Validity of reductio ............................................. 429
12.7 The anti-realist construal of empirical claims that cannot be proved ........................................ 432

13 Summary and Conclusion ........................................ 435

Bibliography .......................................................... 439

Index ................................................................. 449