The
Helm Information
CRITICAL
ASSESSMENTS
of
WRITERS
IN ENGLISH

General Editor
Graham Clarke

Already published:

T.S. Eliot
Edgar Allan Poe
Henry James
F. Scott Fitzgerald
Joseph Conrad
Charles Dickens

D.H. Lawrence
Thomas Hardy
Mark Twain
Virginia Woolf
Walt Whitman
George Eliot

Forthcoming:

Nathaniel Hawthorne
William Faulkner
James Joyce
E.M. Forster

Ernest Hemingway
Jane Austen
Emily Dickinson

John Steinbeck
Herman Melville
Willa Cather
Daniel Defoe
Contents

VOLUME I:
Recollections and Obituaries; Early Studies;
Evaluations of Juvenilia and Poems;
Writers on the Writing

General Editors Preface 1
Introduction 3
Chronology of the Lives of the Brontë Sisters 11
The Brontë Sisters: A Bibliography 16
The Brontë Sisters: A Critical Bibliography 24
Chronological List of Criticism Included 32
Acknowledgements 45

Recollections and Obituaries

4. HARRIET MARTINEAU, 'Death of Currer Bell', The Daily News, 6 April 1855 rpt. 73
5. J.W.E., from 'Emily Brontë ("Ellis Bell")', MacPhail's Edinburgh Ecclesiastical Journal and Literary Review, No. 164, September 1859 77
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>WILLIAM M. THACKERAY, 'The Last Sketch', <em>Cornhill Magazine</em>, 1, January-June 1860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>THOMAS AKROYD, 'A Day at Haworth: A Reminiscence', 1872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>WILLIAM SCRUTON, 'Martha Brown and the Brontës', <em>Yorkshireman</em> (Bradford), Royal Summer Number, Midsummer 1882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>ANNE RITCHIE, from 'My Witches' Caldron', <em>Macmillan's Magazine</em>, 63, February 1891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>GEORGE M. SMITH, 'Charlotte Brontë', <em>The Cornhill Magazine</em>, 9, July-December 1900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>ANONYMOUS, 'Novels of the Season', <em>North American Review</em>, 67.141, October 1848</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>ANONYMOUS, 'Reading Raids, No. VI.—Currer, Ellis and Acton Bell', <em>Tait's Edinburgh Magazine</em>, n.s., 122, July 1855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>PETER BAYNE, 'Currer Bell' <em>Hogg's Instructor</em>, 4, May 1855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>JOHN SKELTON, 'Charlotte Brontë', <em>Fraser's Magazine</em>, 55, May 1857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>LESLIE STEPHEN, 'Hours in a Library: Charlotte Brontë', <em>Cornhill</em>, 36, 1877</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>ARTHUR W. COLTON, 'Emily Brontë', <em>Citizen</em>, 1 January 1896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Author</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>RICHARD GARNETT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>C.E. VAUGHAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>AUGUSTUS RALLI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>ROY TEMPLE HOUSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>HERBERT READ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>E.F. BENSON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>RICHARD OFFOR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Critical Evaluations of Juvenilia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Source and Details</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>CHRISTINE ALEXANDER</td>
<td>‘Angria Revalued: Charlotte Brontë’s Efforts to free Herself From her Juvenilia’</td>
<td><em>AUMLA</em>, no. 53, May 1980</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Critical Evaluations of the Poems of the Brontë Sisters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Source and Details</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>41.</td>
<td>[SYDNEY DOBELL]</td>
<td>‘Poetry of the Million’</td>
<td><em>The Athenaeum</em>, 975, 4 July 1846</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42.</td>
<td>ANONYMOUS</td>
<td>‘Poems by Currer, Ellis, and Acton Bell’</td>
<td><em>The Spectator</em>, 11 November 1848</td>
<td>472</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
43. REV. DR BRUCE, 'The Poems of the Brontë Sisters,' Brontë Society Transactions, 2, part 9, April 1899 476
44. ANONYMOUS 'An Unrecovered Poetess,' The London Times, rpt. in Living Age, 286, 1915 488
45. AUSTIN ROSEVEARE, 'The Poetry of Emily Brontë,' The Poetry Review, 9, June 1918 496
47. C.W. HATFIELD, 'Introduction,' The Complete Poems of Emily Jane Brontë, New York: Columbia UP, 1941 519
48. MARTIN TURNELL, 'The Poetry of Emily Brontë', The Wind and the Rain, 6, Summer 1949 528
50. LAWRENCE J. STARZYK, 'Emily Brontë: Poetry in a Mingled Tone', Criticism, 14.2, Spring 1972 557

Writers on the Writing

54. MATTHEW ARNOLD, 'Haworth Churchyard, April 1855', Fraser's Magazine, 51, May 1855 604
57. ALGERNON CHARLES SWINBURNE, 'Emily Brontë', Miscellanies, London: Chatto & Windus, 1886 611
58. HENRY JAMES, from 'London, January 15, 1897', Harper's Weekly, 41, 6 February 1897 617
60. ROBERT BRIDGES, 'Emily Brontë', The Poetical Works of Robert Bridges, London: Oxford UP, 1936 622
CONTENTS


64. MARGARET DRABBLE, 'The Writer as Recluse: The Theme of Solitude in the Works of the Brontës', Brontë Society Transactions, 16, part 84, 1974 641

VOLUME II:

Responses to the Novels: Agnes Grey, Wuthering Heights and The Tenant of Wildfell Hall

Agnes Grey (1847)

65. GEORGE MOORE, from Conversations in Ebury Street, New York: Liveright, 1924 3

66. PRISCILLA H. COSTELLO, 'A New Reading of Anne Brontë’s Agnes Grey', Brontë Society Transactions, 19.3, 1987 8

Wuthering Heights (1847)


68. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Wuthering Heights, Examiner (London) 8 January 1848 19


70. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Wuthering Heights, Leader (London) 28 December 1850 30

71. J. F. ‘Wuthering Heights’, Temple Bar, 81, December 1887 34

72. MARY WARD, 'Introduction', Wuthering Heights, London: Smith, Elder & Co., 1900 41

73. EDITH M. FENTON, 'The Spirit of Emily Brontë’s Wuthering Heights as Distinguished from that of Gothic Romance', Washington University Studies, 8, October 1920 57

74. C. P. SANGER, The Structure of Wuthering Heights, London: Hogarth Press, 1926 71
CONTENTS


76. LEICESTER BRADNER, ‘The Growth of Wuthering Heights’, PMLA, 48.1, March 1933 85


80. MELVIN R. WATSON, ‘Wuthering Heights and the Critics’, Trollopian, 13, March 1949 154

81. DEREK TRAVERSI, ‘Wuthering Heights After a Hundred Years’, The Dublin Review, no. 445, Spring 1949 170

82. MARK SCHORER, from ‘Fiction and the “Matrix of Analogy”’, The Kenyon Review, 11.4, Autumn 1949 183


88. ISOBEL MAYNE, ‘Emily Brontë’s Mr Lockwood’, Brontë Society Transactions, 15.3, part 78, 1968 328


xii
CONTENTS


98. NANCY ARMSTRONG, ‘Emily Brontë In and Out of Her Time’, Genre, Fall 1982 382


The Tenant of Wildfell Hall (1848)

102. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of The Tenant of Wildfell Hall, The Examiner, 29 July 1848 447

103. ANONYMOUS from ‘Recent Novels’, Fraser’s Magazine, 39, April 1849 454

104. NAOMI LEWIS, Review of The Tenant of Wildfell Hall, The New Statesman and Nation, 17 August 1946 459


106. ARLENE M. JACKSON, ‘The Question of Credibility in Anne Brontë’s The Tenant of Wildfell Hall’, English Studies, 63.3, June 1982 470


CONTENTS

VOLUME III
Evaluations of the Novels: 
Jane Eyre, Shirley and Villette

Jane Eyre (1847)

109. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Jane Eyre, The Spectator, 6 November 1847 3
110. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Jane Eyre, The Guardian, 1 December 1847 7
111. [GEORGE HENRY LEWES], Review of Jane Eyre, Fraser's Magazine, 36, December 1847 12
112. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Jane Eyre, Christian Remembrancer, n.s., 15, April 1848 17
114. LADY EASTLAKE, Review of Vanity Fair and Jane Eyre, Quarterly Review, December 1848 33
115. ANONYMOUS from 'Noteworthy Novels', (Jane Eyre), North British Review, 11.22, 1849 62
116. VIRGINIA WOOLF, 'Jane Eyre and Wuthering Heights', The Common Reader, New York: Harcourt, Brace, Jovanovich, 1925 68
120. R.E. HUGHES, 'Jane Eyre: The Unbaptized Dionysos', Nineteenth-Century Fiction, 18.4, March 1964 115
123. EARL A. KINES, 'The "I" of Jane Eyre', College English, 27.7, April 1966 174
125. JOHN HAGAN, 'Enemies of Freedom in Jane Eyre', Criticism, 13.4, Fall 1971 187
CONTENTS


127. ADRIENNE RICH, 'Jane Eyre: The Temptations of a Motherless Woman', Ms., October 1973 226

128. RUTH BERNARD YEAZELL, 'More True than Real: Jane Eyre's "Mysterious Summons."' Nineteenth-Century Fiction, 29.2, September 1974 240


130. TONY TANNER, 'Passion, Narrative and Identity in Wuthering Heights and Jane Eyre', Teaching the Text, eds Susanne Kappeler and Norman Bryson, London: Routledge, 1983 284

131. PHILIP C. RULE, 'The Function of Allusion in Jane Eyre', Modern Language Studies, 15.4, Fall 1985 298


133. PETER ALLAN DALE, 'Charlotte Brontë's "Tale Half-Told": The Disruption of Narrative Structure in Jane Eyre', Modern Language Quarterly, 47.2, June 1986 324

134. CYNTHIA CARLTON-FORD, 'Intimacy Without Immolation: Fire in Jane Eyre', Women's Studies, 15.4, 1988 342


136. PARAMA ROY, 'Unaccommodated Woman and the Poetics of Property in Jane Eyre', Studies in English Literature, 29.4, Autumn 1989 375


Shirley (1849)

139. [ALBANY WILLIAM FONBLANQUE], Review of Shirley, Examiner (London), 3 November 1849 443

xv
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANONYMOUS REVIEW of <em>Shirley</em>, The Globe, 9 November 1849</th>
<th>448</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANONYMOUS 'Shirley—by the Author of <em>Jane Eyre</em>', The Times (London), 7 December 1849</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANONYMOUS REVIEW of <em>Shirley</em>, The Morning Chronicle, 25 December 1849</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.H. LEWES, 'Currer Bell's <em>Shirley</em>', Edinburgh Review, 91, January 1850</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANONYMOUS REVIEW of <em>Shirley</em>, Westminster Review, 52, January 1850</td>
<td>475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROBERT KEATING SMITH, 'A Well-known Character in Fiction', The Tatler, no. 40, 2 April 1902</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HERBERT E. WROOT, 'The Politics of 1812', Brontë Society Transactions, 3, January 1906</td>
<td>483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JACOB KORG, 'The Problem of Unity in <em>Shirley</em>', Nineteenth-Century Fiction, 12.2, September 1957</td>
<td>488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASA BRIGGS, 'Private and Social Themes in <em>Shirley</em>', Brontë Society Transactions, 13, part 68, 1958</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HERBERT ROSENGARTEN, 'Charlotte Brontë's <em>Shirley</em> and the Leeds Mercury', Studies in English Literature, 16.4, Autumn 1976</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KATE LAWSON, 'The Dissenting Voice: <em>Shirley</em>'s Vision of Women and Christianity', Studies in English Literature, 29.4, Autumn 1989</td>
<td>558</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[HARRIET MARTINEAU], Review of <em>Villette</em>, Daily News, 3 February 1853</td>
<td>589</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
158. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Villette by Currer Bell, The Spectator, 12 February 1853 592
159. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Villette, Bell’s Weekly Messenger, 12 February 1853 595
160. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Villette, The Nonconformist, 16 March 1853 597
163. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of Villette, Dublin University Magazine, 42, November 1853 611
164. UNSIGNED REVIEW, [WILLIAM WIRT KINGSLEY,] University Quarterly, 2, October 1860 615
166. ROBERT A. COLBY, ‘Villette and the Life of the Mind’, PMLA, 75.4, September 1960 632
168. NINA AUERBACH, ‘Charlotte Brontë: The Two Countries’, University of Toronto Quarterly, 42.4, Summer 1973 659
175. NANCY SORKIN RABINOWITZ, ‘“Faithful Narrator” or “Partial Eulogist”: First-Person Narration in Brontë’s Villette’, The Journal of Narrative Technique, 15.3, Fall 1985 750
CONTENTS

177. ROSEMARY CLARK-BEATTIE, 'Fables of Rebellion: Anti-Catholicism and the Structure of Villette', _ELH_, 53.4, Winter 1986 785
180. LISA SURRIDGE, 'Representing the “Latent Vashti”: Theatricality in Charlotte Brontë’s Villette', _The Victorian Newsletter_, No. 87, Spring 1995 838

VOLUME IV
Evaluations of The Professor; Twentieth-Century Studies: 1947–95; Comparative Studies

_The Professor_ (1857)

181. ANONYMOUS REVIEW of _The Professor_, _Examiner_, London, 20 June 1857 3
182. J.A. FALCONER, 'The Professor and Villette', _English Studies_, 9, April 1927 7
184. MICHAEL D. WHEELER, 'Literary and Biblical Allusion in The Professor', _Brontë Society Transactions_, 17, No. 86, 1976 29
185. REBECCA RODOLFF, 'From the Ending of The Professor to the Conception of Jane Eyre', _Philological Quarterly_, 61.1, Winter 1982 38
186. ANNETTE R. FEDERICO, 'The Other Case: Gender and Narration in Charlotte Brontë's The Professor', _Papers on Language and Literature_, 30.4, Fall 1994 55
CONTENTS

Twentieth-century Studies 1947–93


188. PHYLLIS BENTLEY, ‘The Significance of Haworth’, The Trollopian, 2.3, December 1947 87

189. ANONYMOUS, ‘At Haworth Parsonage’, The Times, 18 December 1848 95

190. ANONYMOUS, ‘Emily Brontë’, The Times Literary Supplement, 18 December 1848 96


196. REBECCA WEST, ‘The Role of Fantasy in the Work of the Brontës’, Brontë Society Transactions, 12.4, part 64, 1954 137


203. CAROL OHMANN, ‘Historical Reality and “Divine Appointment” in Charlotte Brontë’s Fiction’, Signs, 2.4, Summer 1977 230

204. ARTHUR POLLARD, ‘The Brontës and their Father’s Faith’, Essays and Studies, 37, 1984 251

205. RUTH GOUNELAS, ‘Charlotte Brontë and the Critics: Attitudes to the Female Qualities in her Writing’, AUMLA, no. 62, November 1984 265
CONTENTS


207. N.M. JACOBS, 'Gender and Layered Narrative in *Wuthering Heights* and *The Tenant of Wildfell Hall*', *Journal of Narrative Technique*, 16.3, Fall 1986 303


210. I.E. GORAK, 'Border Countries: *Wuthering Heights* and *Shirley* as Regional Novels', *Criticism*, 32.4, Fall 1990 353


212. BARBARA GATES, 'Down Garden Paths: Charlotte Brontë's Haunts of Self and Other', *Victorian Newsletter*, no. 83, Spring 1993 381

Comparative Studies

213. ANONYMOUS, 'Poetesses', *The Saturday Review*, 23 May 1868 399


216. FRANKLIN GARY, 'Charlotte Brontë and George Henry Lewes', *PMLA*, 51.2, June 1936 416


219. DAVID P. DREW, 'Emily Brontë and Emily Dickinson as Mystic Poets', *Brontë Society Transactions*, 15.3, part 78 (1968) 464


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>223.</th>
<th>GAYATRI CHAKRAVORTY SPIVAK, 'Three Women's Texts and a Critique of Imperialism', <em>Critical Inquiry</em>, 12.1, Autumn 1985</th>
<th>511</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>224.</td>
<td>CAROL A. BOCK, 'Charlotte Brontë's Storytellers: The Influence of Scott', <em>Cahiers Victoriens et Edouardiens</em>, 34, October 1991</td>
<td>530</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>