

2921-9225

Tobias Kiene

The Legal Protection of Traditional Knowledge in the Pharmaceutical Field

An Intercultural Problem on
the International Agenda



Waxmann 2011

Münster / New York / München / Berlin

CONTENTS

Introduction	11
PART I: FRAMEWORK	15
1. Traditional Knowledge in the Pharmaceutical Field	15
1.1 Catharanthus roseus.....	15
1.2 Curcuma longa	16
1.3 Arogyapaacha.....	18
1.4 Hoodia gordonii.....	19
1.5 Homalanthus nutans	20
1.6 Phyllanthus niruri	21
2. Traditional Knowledge and Plant Genetic Resources	21
3. Legal Framework	26
3.1 Intellectual Property Rights and Related Rights.....	26
3.1.1 Patents	26
3.1.2 Plant Breeders' Rights.....	32
3.1.3 Other Intellectual Property Rights.....	34
3.2 Biodiversity Law and Rights in Genetic Resources	36
3.2.1 The Convention on Biological Diversity.....	36
3.2.2 The International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture.....	40
3.3 Rights of Indigenous Peoples	41
3.3.1 The United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples.....	41
3.3.2 The Human Rights Framework	43
4. Gaps: The Legal Problem.....	45
4.1 Outside Intellectual Property Law	46
4.2 Intellectual Property Rights.....	49
5. Conceptual Complexity and the Scope of the Analysis	56
PART II: THEORY	61
1. Introduction.....	61
2. Foundation	63
2.1 Intellectual Property, Cultural Diversity and Legal Pluralism.....	63
2.1.1 The Concept of Legal Pluralism in Legal Anthropology.....	64
2.1.1.1 Introduction	64
2.1.1.2 Constitutional Changes, Theoretical Implications	65
2.1.1.3 Philosophical Questions: Liberalism and Legal Pluralism	73
2.1.1.4 Further Theoretical Consequences.....	84
2.1.2 A Pluralistic Interpretation of Drug Development and Intellectual Property	88
2.2 Social Norms, Social Rules: Law, Culture and Society	96
2.2.1 Overview	97
2.2.2 Law as Part of Social Reality	102

2.2.3 Moore's Semi-Autonomous Social Fields.....	109
2.2.4 Law and Society in an Intercultural Context.....	116
2.3 Conclusions.....	120
3. Specific Issues.....	121
3.1 Customary Law.....	121
3.1.1 Introduction.....	121
3.1.2 Conceptual Questions.....	122
3.1.3 The Study of Customary Law.....	126
3.1.4 Customary Law and Traditional Knowledge Protection.....	130
3.2 Group Membership.....	132
3.2.1 Introduction.....	132
3.2.2 Conceptual Questions.....	132
3.2.3 Indigenous Peoples.....	134
3.3 Traditional Knowledge Systems.....	142
3.3.1 Introduction.....	142
3.3.2 Terminological and Conceptual Questions.....	143
3.3.3 Traditional Knowledge and Formal Science.....	147
3.3.4 The Complexity of Traditional Knowledge Systems.....	150
3.3.5 The Interest in the Value of Traditional Knowledge.....	153
PART III: PRACTICE.....	159
1. Introduction: From Theory to Practice.....	159
2. General Approaches in Indigenous Peoples' Declarations.....	160
3. Options: Solution Strategies.....	166
3.1 Intellectual Property Rights Based Solutions.....	166
3.1.1 Defensive Protection of Traditional Knowledge.....	167
3.1.2 Positive Protection of Traditional Knowledge.....	170
3.1.3 General Objections to Intellectual Property Rights Solutions.....	173
3.2 Contracts Approach.....	175
3.3 Alternative Models.....	181
3.3.1 Compensatory Liability Regimes.....	182
3.3.2 Database Rights.....	183
3.3.3 Traditional Resource Rights.....	184
3.3.4 A Global Bio-Collecting Society.....	185
3.4 Critical Comments.....	187
4. Current State of Multilateral Debates.....	190
4.1 Introduction.....	190
4.2 The World Trade Organization.....	191
4.3 The Convention on Biological Diversity.....	197
4.4 Other Multilateral Forums.....	202
5. The Sui Generis Approach of the World Intellectual Property Organization.....	205
5.1 Traditional Knowledge at WIPO.....	205

5.2	General Examination of the Intergovernmental Committee on Intellectual Property and Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore (IGC).....	212
5.2.1	Establishment and Mandate.....	212
5.2.2	Traditional Knowledge Holders at the IGC.....	218
5.3	Towards the Elaboration of the “Draft Provisions”.....	222
5.3.1	The First Five Sessions of the IGC: Capacity Building, National Experiences and Defensive Approach.....	222
5.3.2	From the Sixth IGC to the First Version of the “Draft Provisions”.....	229
5.3.3	First Commenting Process and Revision.....	233
5.4	WIPO’s Draft Provisions for the Protection of Traditional Knowledge.....	238
5.4.1	General Considerations.....	238
5.4.2	“Policy Objectives” and “General Guiding Principles”.....	245
5.4.3	The Misappropriation Approach.....	250
5.4.4	Traditional Knowledge: the “Subject Matter” of Protection.....	257
5.4.5	The Rights Granted and the Role of Customary Law.....	264
5.4.6	The Relationship with the Existing Legal Framework.....	270
5.4.7	Current State of IGC Deliberations.....	274
PART IV: CONCLUSIONS.....		281
REFERENCES.....		293
ANNEX.....		321
1.	Abbreviations.....	321
2.	WIPO’s Revised Provisions for the Protection of Traditional Knowledge. Policy Objectives and Core Principles.....	323
3.	Abstract.....	332