Aspects of the Astrolabe: 
‘architectonica ratio’
in tenth- and eleventh-century Europe

Von der Fakultät für Geistes- und Erziehungswissenschaften
der Technischen Universität Carolo-Wilhelmina
zu Braunschweig

zur Erlangung des Grades
Doktorin der Philosophie (Dr. Phil.)

genehmigte Dissertation

von Arianna Borrelli

aus
Rom, Italien
CONTENTS

List of figures and tables ................................................................. 12
Acknowledgements ........................................................................... 14

1 Introduction .................................................................................. 16
   1.1 The astrolabe and medieval mathematical thought ......................... 16
   1.2 The astrolabe and its aspects ....................................................... 17
   1.3 The early history of the astrolabe ............................................... 19
   1.4 Latin scholars and the astrolabe ............................................... 20
   1.5 The two main theses of this study ............................................. 21
   1.6 Strategies of knowledge transfer: positive and negative definitions ... 22
   1.7 Images of knowledge as premise and subject of research ............. 23
   1.8 Plan of the work ........................................................................ 24

2 Mathematical and practical aspects of the astrolabe ......................... 27
   2.1 Some considerations on mathematical thinking ............................. 27
      2.1.1 Mathematical thinking as a set of prototypes ..................... 27
      2.1.2 Mathematics across cultures and time .............................. 27
      2.1.3 Mathematical thinking and mathematical communication ....... 28
      2.1.4 Geometrical imagination .................................................. 29
      2.1.5 Mathematics, the mind’s eye... and hands ....................... 30
      2.1.6 Images of knowledge and mathematical truth: proof vs. evidence ................................................................. 32
      2.1.7 Geometrical imagination and ‘tacit knowing’ ....................... 33
   2.2 The mathematical aspects of the astrolabe ................................ 34
      2.2.1 The shadow triangle ......................................................... 34
      2.2.2 The homocentric-spheres-model ....................................... 35
      2.2.2.1 The celestial and terrestrial spheres ............................. 35
      2.2.2.2 Geometrical imagination and natural philosophy in the homocentric-spheres-model ........................................ 36
      2.2.2.3 From the solid spheres to the astrolabe ......................... 37
      2.2.2.4 The poles and equator .................................................. 37
      2.2.2.5 The horizon and the altitude circles .................................. 38
      2.2.2.6 The sun and the zodiac ............................................... 39
      2.2.2.7 Zodiac signs and constellations .................................... 40
      2.2.2.8 Seasonal variations in the length of daylight and in the night sky ................................................................. 41
      2.2.2.9 The seven climates ....................................................... 41
      2.2.3 The flat sphere ................................................................... 43
2.2.3.1 Theses to be demonstrated by means of my description of the flat sphere’s structure ........................................ 43
2.2.3.2 The general method for flattening the sphere ..................... 44
2.2.3.3 How to draw the flat sphere: the equator and the north pole ................................................................. 44
2.2.3.4 The tropics on the flat sphere ............................................ 45
2.2.3.5 Ninety-degrees-tilting as a key trick in drawing the flat sphere ........................................................................ 45
2.2.3.6 The circle-into-circle property ........................................... 48
2.2.3.7 Consequences of the circle-into-circle property .................. 48
2.2.3.8 The zodiac and the horizons ............................................. 49
2.2.3.9 Conclusions: the basic three-step-procedure for projecting circles onto the flat sphere ................................... 51
2.3 The practical aspects of the astrolabe ........................................ 53
2.3.1 The planispheric astrolabe ................................................... 53
2.3.2 The back of the planispheric astrolabe ................................... 54
2.3.2.1 The alidade as a sighting tool ........................................... 54
2.3.2.2 The shadow square ......................................................... 54
2.3.2.3 The scale of solar longitudes ............................................ 56
2.3.3 The front of the planispheric astrolabe ................................... 57
2.3.3.1 The disc of the celestial sphere and the disc of the local horizon .............................................................. 57
2.3.3.2 The collection of horizon plates ........................................ 57
2.3.3.3 Possible uses of the front of the planispheric astrolabe ...... 59
2.3.3.4 The hour lines and monastic timekeeping ......................... 60
2.3.4 Could astrolabe artefacts actually perform the functions they were built for? ...................................................... 62

3 Sources and results of previous research .................................... 63
3.1 Introduction: historical and cultural context .............................. 63
3.1.1 The earliest evidence on the method of the flat sphere and on the astrolabe ......................................................... 63
3.1.2 The astrolabe in the Arabic-Islamic, Byzantine and Jewish cultures .................................................................. 64
3.1.3 The network of high medieval astronomical and mathematical studies ............................................................. 66
3.1.4 al-Andalus, its school of astronomy of the tenth and eleventh centuries ............................................................. 67
3.1.5 Prominent figures in the diffusion of astrolabe knowledge in Latin Europe ......................................................... 69
3.1.6 The interplay of modes of communication in the Latin Middle Ages ................................................................. 70
3.1.7 The ‘rise of literacy’ in eleventh- and twelfth-century Europe ........................................................................ 72
3.2 Material and pictorial sources: catalogues, analyses and open questions .......................................................................................................................... 73
  3.2.1 Arabic-Islamic and European astrolabe artefacts ..................................... 73
  3.2.2 The Frankfurt catalogue of medieval astronomical instruments and previous cataloguing projects .............................................................. 74
  3.2.3 Difficulties in dating European astrolabe artefacts ................................... 75
  3.2.4 European astrolabe artefacts and astrolabe drawings used as evidence in this study ......................................................................................... 75
  3.2.5 The earliest European astrolabe (#3042) .................................................. 76
  3.2.6 Early Andalusi astrolabe artefacts with additional non-Arabic engravings as evidence of cultural exchange ......................................................... 77
  3.2.7 Additional pictorial sources ....................................................................... 79

3.3 Textual sources: research results and open questions ........................................... 79
  3.3.1 Extant astrolabe manuscripts ...................................................................... 79
  3.3.2 Astrolabe manuscripts as a source for this study ........................................ 80
  3.3.3 Additional textual evidence ....................................................................... 80
  3.3.4 Preliminary remarks on earlier and later Latin texts on the astrolabe .................................................. 81
  3.3.5 The reconstruction of eleventh-century astrolabe texts .............................. 82
  3.3.6 Problems in the philological reconstruction of the earliest Latin astrolabe texts: the example of J ................................................................. 83
    3.3.6.1 Nicolaus Bubnov's edition of 'de utilitatibus astrolabii' (J) .................... 83
    3.3.6.2 André Van de Vyver's analysis of the earliest Latin astrolabe manuscripts ........................................................................................................... 85
    3.3.6.3 Millás Vallicrosa's studies on ms. Ripoll 225 ........................................ 85
    3.3.6.4 Millás Vallicrosa's edition of early astrolabe texts ................................. 86
    3.3.6.5 Werner Bergmann's thesis of the two-stages composition of J ............ 87
  3.3.7 The sources of h: the problem of the lost original? .................................... 88
  3.3.8 The problem of relating the earliest Latin astrolabe texts to Arabic sources ........................................................................................................ 89
  3.3.9 Paul Kunitzsch's analysis of the relationship of the text J' to Arabic sources .......................................................................................................... 90
  3.3.10 Conclusions: the theory of written transmission of astrolabe knowledge and its problems ................................................................. 91

3.4 Medieval mathematical texts and readability: the example of the
  'Geometria incerti auctoris' (GIA) ...................................................................... 92
  3.4.1 Catherine Jacquet's analysis of the GIA and its relevance for the present study ................................................................................................. 92
  3.4.2 The GIA as product of progressive rewriting ............................................ 93
  3.4.3 Were the single stages of rewriting of the GIA III an individual or a collective enterprise? ............................................................ 94
3.4.4 The question of readability and its possible solutions: the literary and the ‘recipe’ style .................................................. 95
3.4.5 Conclusions: different criteria for evaluating eleventh-century astrolabe texts .................................................. 97

4 Non-written and non-verbal modes of communication in the diffusion of astrolabe knowledge .................................................. 99

4.1 Memory, notes and geometrical patterns in high medieval mathematical arts .................................................. 99
  4.1.1 The main thesis of the present chapter: astrolabe manuscripts as written traces of a primarily non-written transmission .................................................. 99
  4.1.2 The medieval craft of memory .................................................. 100
  4.1.3 The embodiment of mnemonic patterns in images and artefacts .................................................. 101
  4.1.4 Memory and medieval learning .................................................. 103
  4.1.5 Modes of communication in the medieval mathematical arts .................................................. 104
  4.1.6 Thinking numbers as geometrical patterns .................................................. 105
  4.1.7 Conclusions: quadrivium, memory and manual crafts .................................................. 108

4.2 Memory and the astrolabe .................................................. 109
  4.2.1 Memory in astrolabe-related texts .................................................. 109
  4.2.2 Note-taking as a complement to memory .................................................. 111
  4.2.3 Fulbert of Chartres’ mnemonic verses and the letters of Radulf of Liège and Regimbold of Cologne .................................................. 112

4.3 Drawings as a mode of transmission of astronomical knowledge .................................................. 113
  4.3.1 Astronomy in number and/or in measure .................................................. 113
  4.3.2 Diagrams as an independent mode of communication .................................................. 114
  4.3.3 Stereographic projection in ninth-century astronomical diagrams .................................................. 115
  4.3.4 The astronomical diagrams of Abbo of Fleury and Byrtferth of Ramsey, the astronomical devices of Gerbert of Aurillac .................................................. 117

4.4 Drawings and knowledge transmission: the construction of tropics and zodiac .................................................. 118
  4.4.1 The sources: texts h1, h2 and h3 and drawings d1 and d2 .................................................. 118
  4.4.2 Relationship between the strictly verbal contents of h1, h2 and h3 .................................................. 119
  4.4.3 The construction of tropics and zodiac in the text h2 and in the drawing d1 .................................................. 120
  4.4.4 The construction of the tropics in h3: a product of notetaking? .................................................. 124
  4.4.5 Comparison of the manuscript tradition of h2 and h3 .................................................. 126
  4.4.6 The construction of tropics and zodiac in h1 .................................................. 126
4.4.7 Conclusions: transfer of astrolabe knowledge by means of memory, drawings and notes ........................................ 128

4.5 The relationship between Ptolemy's `Planisphaerium' and early Latin astrolabe texts and drawings ........................................ 129
4.5.1 Greek, Latin and Arabic version of the `Planisphaerium' ...... 129
4.5.2 Relevance of the `Planisphaerium' for this study ............ 130
4.5.3 What Ptolemy did not say in the `Planisphaerium' .......... 131
4.5.4 The contents of the `Planisphaerium' ........................ 131
4.5.5 The construction of tropics and zodiac in the `Planisphaerium' .......................................................... 132
4.5.6 The coincidence between dl and the drawing illustrating chapter 1 of the `Planisphaerium' ........................................ 134

4.6 The division of the astrolabe's zodiac in eleventh-century Latin Europe ............................................................. 137
4.6.1 The measure of the zodiac ........................................ 139
4.6.2 The division of the zodiac in the text dz1 .................. 140
4.6.3 The division of the zodiac in the texts dz2, dz3 and dz4 ..... 143
4.6.4 The division of the zodiac in the text 'Iubet rex Ptolomeus' (pt) .............................................................. 144
4.6.5 The division of the zodiac in the text h1 ..................... 146
4.6.6 The language of proportions in pt and h1 ................. 147
4.6.7 The division of the zodiac in the treatises of Ascelin of Augsburg (a) and Herman of Reichenau (h) ...................... 148
4.6.8 The division of the zodiac in eleventh-century drawings of astrolabe parts .................................................. 149
4.6.9 Conclusions: the problem of dividing the astrolabe's zodiac as a focus of natural philosophical discussion in high medieval astrolabe studies ........................................ 153
4.6.10 The zodiac circle on the astrolabe #3042 .................. 154
4.6.11 The division of the zodiac on the astrolabe #3042 ....... 155

5 The philosophical aspects of the astrolabe .......................... 158
5.1 Why did medieval Latin scholars study the astrolabe? ........ 158
5.1.1 The astrolabe as a new mathematical and philosophical instrument of the mathematical arts ................................. 158
5.1.2 The main thesis of the present chapter: the astrolabe as `architectonica ratio' ............................................... 160
5.1.3 Was there actually an interplay between abstract and material side in astrolabe studies? ...................................... 162
5.1.4 Evidence on medieval sundials ................................ 164
5.1.5 Evidence on gnomons and sundials as devices for astronomical observations ............................................................ 165
5.1.6 The analysis of ms. BnF lat. 7412 as evidence on the motivation of Latin astrolabe studies ........................................ 166
5.2 The astrolabe as `architectonica ratio' of the `machina mundi' 166
5.2.1 The first chapter of the text J: the ‘machina mundi’ and its ‘architectonica ratio’ .......................................................... 166
5.2.2 The Prologue ‘Ad intimas’ (pa) and its possible relation to Vitruvius ................................................................. 168
5.2.3 The ‘architectonica ratio’ of the astrolabe as a forbidden art ................................................................. 173
5.2.4 Chapters J 2–7: determining temporal hours with the astrolabe ................................................................. 174
5.2.5 Was the gesture of raising the astrolabe a recipe or a symbolic act? ................................................................. 175
5.3 The astrolabe and the measure of time and space ................................................................. 176
5.3.1 The measure of time as a philosophical problem ................................................................. 176
5.3.2 Chapter J 8: the astrolabe and the parts of the hours ................................................................. 177
5.3.3 The assimilation of temporal and equinoctial hours ................................................................. 178
5.3.4 The order of the sky and its projection on earth: the seven climates ................................................................. 180
5.3.5 The three-dimensional sphere and the measure of time (J’a) ................................................................. 181
5.3.6 Abstract patterns and their embodiment in astronomical devices and surveying methods ................................................................. 183
5.3.7 The sinker and the astrolabe (dpp) ................................................................. 184
5.3.8 The traces of the ‘Planisphaerium’ in ms. BnF lat. 7412 ................................................................. 187
5.4 Euclid’s and Ptolemy’s geometric constructions ................................................................. 188
5.4.1 The drawings in ms. BnF lat. 7412 and the knowledge they conveyed ................................................................. 188
5.4.2 Drawings from Euclid’s ‘Elements’ (f.14v) ................................................................. 188
5.4.3 Drawing from the ‘Planisphaerium’ (f.14v) ................................................................. 189
5.4.4 Drawings of a sphere with sighting tubes and of a polar sighting tube (f.15r) ................................................................. 192
5.4.5 The universal horary quadrant: text and drawing (f.16r and f. 18v–19r) ................................................................. 195
5.5 The equatorial sundial and the geometrisation of the flow of time ................................................................. 197
5.5.1 The equatorial sundial (f. 19r) ................................................................. 197
5.5.2 Material evidence for high medieval equatorial sundials ................................................................. 200
5.5.3 Written evidence of high medieval equatorial sundials ................................................................. 201
5.6 The astrolabe drawings in ms. BnF lat. 7412 (#4024) ................................................................. 203
5.6.1 Overview on the astrolabe drawings #4024 ................................................................. 203
5.6.2 The astrolabe drawings #4024 and other early European astrolabe artefacts ................................................................. 206
5.6.3 Abraham and his astrolabe in BnF lat. 12117 f. 106r ................................................................. 210

6 Summary and outlook: the aspects of the astrolabe in twelfth-century Europe ................................................................. 214
6.1 The aspects of the astrolabe and their interplay ................................................................. 214
6.2 Twelfth-century astrolabe treatises and their fortunes ................................................................. 216